REVISTIA

EJLS

EUROPEAN JOURNAL OF LANGUAGE
AND LITERATURE STUDIES

July - December 2022
Volume 8, Issue 2

ISSN 2411-9598 (Print)
ISSN 2411-4103 (Online)

REVISTIA
PUBLISHING AND RESEARCH

EUROPEAN JOURNAL OF LANGUAGE
AND LITERATURE STUDIES

July - December 2022

Volume 8, Issue 2

Typeset by Revistia

Address: 11, Portland Road, London, SE25 4UF, United Kingdom

Tel: +44 2080680407

Web: https://ejls.revistia.org

Email: office@revistia.org

ISSN 2411-9598 (Print), ISSN 2411-4103 (Online)

Indexed in Elsevier's Mendeley, WorldCat, RePEc & Ideas, Google Scholar, Index Copernicus, Crossref

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ISSN 2411-9598 (Print)
ISSN 2411-4103 (Online)
European Journal of
Language and Literature Studies
July - December 2022
Volume 8, Issue 2

Nature Representation in Ahmad Tohari's Works of Fiction

Suroso

Faculty Languages and Arts, Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta, Indonesia

Hartono

Else Liliani

Abstract

This study aims to examine the forms of nature represented in the fiction written by Ahmad Tohari. The source of this analysis is Ahmad Tohari works entitled (1) Kubah, (2) Di Kaki Bukit Cibalak, (3) Lingkar Tanah Lingkar Air (4) Ronggeng Dukuh Paruk, (5) Lintang Kemukus Dini Hari, (6) Jantera Bianglala, and (7) Orang-orang Proyek. Data were collected by means of reading and note-taking technique. Semantic validity was used to measure the data validity, while intra-rater and inter-rater were used to check the reliability. The collected data were then analyzed using the descriptive qualitative technique. The results show that many works written by Ahmad Tohari represent nature. His works show nature in the story setting, characters, and titles. In terms of story setting, the fertile soil, the variety of plants, and small animals usually found in the countryside and forests are presented. The writer describes various places, such as the forest around Cibawor River, Cigobang forest, Citandui River creek, Cibalak Hill, Tanggir Village, and Dukuh Paruk where various plants and animals are found. Then, in terms of representation of nature in the names of characters, there is a character named "Srintil". In Banyumas area, Srintil refers to a type of tobacco that has a fairly higher economic value compared to other types of tobacco. Srintil tobacco may have a high economic value if only it is cared properly, and the green leaves are not damaged. At last, the nature representations in the novel titles are shown in Di Kaki Bukit Cibalak, Ronggeng Dukuh Paruk, Lintang Kemukus Dini Hari, and Jantera Bianglala. The nature representations in Ahmad Tohari's works add aesthetic values and deliver the message of environmental protection.

Keywords: Ahmad Tohari, nature, representation

Introduction

Literary work is a writer's response to the world around him. Pradopo (1995: 178) stated that it is rather the creation of a writer as a member of society. The work does

not come from "a cultural vacuum but from a complex reality of life existing around the writer (Teeuw, 1980: 11). According to Faruk (1988: 7), literary works are semiotic facts that view a cultural phenomenon as a cognitive sign system.

Literary works and life are two social phenomena that complement each other as something existential. This implies that literary works and real life, apart from having their own autonomy, have a reciprocal relationship (Mahayana, 2007: 5). The writer's initiative in creating literary works is inspired by life phenomena. However, it does not mean that every phenomenon may be captured and written about. In order to create a literary work, there is a need to contemplate the phenomenon before interpreting it and then making it into a literary work. There are mainly three issues related to human life. They are (a) personal problems, (b) interpersonal problems with other people and their environment, and (c) problems with God (Nurgiyantoro, 1998: 323).

Environmental problems are society's problems because they show the social realities that have existed for a long time. Environmental problems do not occur only in Indonesia but also in other countries because it has become a global issue. There are many writers who have considerable concern for the problems of the natural environment. Nature has become a part of literary works as a number of writers, especially poets, use the words forests, seas, and trees in their works. Nature is the inspiration for creating literary works, and at the same time, it needs writers to be preserved (https://fatchulfkip.wordpress.com /2013/01/06/ekokritisisme- kajian-ekologis-dalam-sastra-oleh-fatchul-muin).

In the treasures of Indonesian literature, the writer's attitude toward nature has been existing since the era of classic and modern literature. The poems written by Muhammad Yamin, Ramadhan KH, Amir Hamzah, Sanusi Pane, Sutan Takdir Alisjahbana, Abdul Hadi WM, and Sapardi Djoko Damono often represent the nature. In addition, nature is often represented in prose (Mahayana, 2009). One of the writers who express a lot about nature in his work is Ahmad Tohari. According to Yudiono (2003: 150) rural nature and the life of the poor are the main characteristics of Ahmad Tohari's works. The rural environment is especially evident in the description of the setting of the story. Environmental issues are also highlighted in Ahmad Tohari's work (Mahayana, 1989). Hall (1997: 15) reveals that representation is part of the process of producing and exchanging meaning, and language plays an important role in the process.

Ahmad Tohari is one of the Indonesian prolific writers whose almost all of his works show social criticism, including criticism of the environment in Indonesia. Some of his works are *Kubah*/Dome (1980), *Ronggeng Dukuh Paruk/*The Dancer of Paruk Hamlet (1982), *Lintang Kemukus Dini Hari*/A Shooting Star at Dawn (1985), *Jantera Bianglala/The Rainbow's Arc* (1986), *Di Kaki Bukit Cibalak/*On the Foothill of Cibalak (1986), *Senyum Karyamin*/Karyamin's Smile (1989), *Bekisar Merah*/The Red Bekisar (1993), *Lingkar Tanah Lingkar Air/*Soil Circle Water Circle (1995), *Orang-*

Orang Proyek/People of Construction Site (2002), dan *Belantik* (2000). Nature representation is seen in those works. More importantly, nature is dominantly represented in the setting and characters of the novels. The nature is highlighted clearly and in detail in each of the works.

Some theories to analyze the representation of nature in these works of fiction are ecocritical and sociology theories of literature. Ecocriticism is the latest literature approach that examines the relationship between literature and its physical environment (Glotefelty, 1996: xix). Ecocriticism examines the ideas of the environment and how they are represented in literary works. Ecocritical literature has several criteria. Buell (1995: 7-8) states that ecocritical literature uses nature to show how human life correlates with nature. Ecocritical literature usually tells about how someone escapes from a city to a country (pastoral). Then, ecocritical literature describes the village by contrasting it implicitly and explicitly with the city (Giffort, 1999: 2). Jonathan Bate in Juliasih (2012: 87) points out that ecocriticism talks about environmental awareness in literary works. Ecocritical analysis is interdisciplinary in nature, extending to other disciplines, namely literature, culture, philosophy, sociology, psychology, history, environment, politics, economics, and religious studies.

According to Harsono (2008:35), the ecocritical theory is multidisciplinary as it uses both literary and ecological theories although those theories are multidisciplinary in nature. Literary theory is the basic assumption that literature is related to realities. This relationship makes literary works a form of social criticism that can be used as objects of research. This present study focuses on how nature is represented in Ahmad Tohari' fictional works and the functions of the representation.

Theoretically, this study provides an alternative to literary theory application, specifically ecocritical and sociology theories of literature in Indonesian literary works, especially fiction. Practically, this research provides a basis for appreciating novels by Ahmad Tohari that raise environmental issues, thus improving people's abilities in understanding and appreciating Indonesian literary works. Describing the environmental issues in Ahmad Tohari's works, this study is expected to increase society's appreciation of the novels and find values that are useful for society. Thus, these values are expected to add insight and appreciation of society towards Indonesian writers in general, and novels that represent the environment written by Ahmad Tohari.

Research Method

The subject of this study is Ahmad Tohari's novels that include environmental issues. The novels are (1) *Kubah*, (2) *Di Kaki Bukit Cibalak*, (3) *Lingkar Tanah Lingkar Air,* (4) *Ronggeng Dukuh Paruk,* (5) *Lintang Kemukus Dini Hari,* (6) *Jantera Bianglala, dan* (7) *Orang-Orang Proyek.* Data of this study are in the form of discourse taken from the novels. The data were collected through reading and note-

taking. The reading process was done repeatedly to find the main ideas that contain the representation of nature in the story. Then, the data were written on data cards and considered research data. The data validity was measured through semantic validity, while the reliability was measured through intra-rater and inter-rater reliability.

The data were analyzed using the descriptive qualitative technique. This technique is used to describe the forms of the representation including the representation of nature and the functions of the representations. The data description also serves as the interpretation and analysis of nature representation and realities existing in society.

Result and Discussion

Nature Representation in the Settings

Ahmad Tohari is one of the writers that show the natural environment as the story setting in his works. The natural environment becomes the characteristic and charm in his works. In his works, especially novels, many stories are introduced with a detailed description of nature as shown in *Orang-orang Proyek* novel below.

This morning, Cibawor River looks exhausted. Three days ago, heavy rains upstream made this river in flood. Fortunately, it is normal that the flood drains quickly because it is a mountain river in nature. The water, which was originally clear, started to cloud up in the morning, rose, and soon surged half an hour later. It was as if Cibawor was being poured from upstream with a large, thick, muddy sump carrying all kinds of garbage like rubber sandals, plastic bottles, banana trunks, and mahogany branches. (*Orang-orang Proyek: 1)*

At the beginning of this novel, it is presented in the setting that there was a heavy flood caused by environmental damage that occurred in the Cibawor river creek. Various garbage brought by the heavy flood indicates that environmental damage does exist. Very detailed setting that shows the natural environment is also found in other novels, namely *Di Kaki Bukit Cibalak on* pages 5-7, *Lingkar Tanah Lingkar Air* on pages 7-8, and *Kubah on* pages 6 and 7.

The calm and quiet Gobang forest depicted in *Lingkar Tanah Lingkar Air* novel is the hideout of the main character of the novel. Amin, the main character, is a DI troop. How the forest is depicted is shown in the excerpt below.

Very early in the morning, I went out, armed with a sarong wrapped around my waist. I left the weapons with Kiram and Jun who stayed at the secret post. I only brought a machete. I really needed this item, especially as a means of disguise. When going out of the forest was really necessary, I needed to pretend that I roamed around looking for firewood.

From Cigobang forest, I crawled under the dense teak forest to the north and later turned to the west. There was no wind in the forest, so the forest looked like a giant

lying still. A piece of rotting twig that fell would be enough to disturb the silence let alone the crowing of partridges. Meanwhile, the sound of crickets creaking softly on the slopes was clearly audible.

The closer to the edge, the more dreamy the forest because many teak trees were cut down by the illegal loggers. There had been various plants and trees, so it was not only teak trees. I started seeing butterflies and dragonflies, and birds chirping. There are turtledoves and spotted doves perched on a branch of a *wangkal* tree. There was a pair of parrots perched near their nest in a rotting wood hole. They are chatty, but their red beak and green feathers were a real beauty. Then, I saw a Javanese eagle that suddenly swoop down from the sky. His stout body shot down, and it instantly disappeared among the trees. When I went up again, I saw that the mighty bird was already carrying a snake in its claws. It reminded me of venomous vipers that always gave me the chills. Still, the bird ate it instead. (*Lingkar Tanah Lingkar Air*: 117-118).

Ahmad Tohari's *Kubah* represents the poor society. Besides presenting rice fields as local wisdom, the rice fields also symbolize poverty in society. Poverty is caused by horizontal conflicts, and it is clearly depicted in the setting of the story. It is described that the soil is fertile but uncultivated. Such an illustration can be found in the following excerpt.

In Kokosan sub-district, Pegaten village is the most remote. There was a vast teak forest in its south. Meanwhile, its western part was rubber plantations and swamps. The rice fields and the other fields are fertile. That some of its' residents lived in poverty, it was certainly not the condition of the soil to be blamed. One of the facts that had spread misery in the area was the upheavals that were caused Japanese colonialization. There was also the struggle for independence which practically lasted until the early fifties. The peaceful life lasted only a few years, at the end of that decade. *(Kubah:134-135)*

The representation of nature is mainly shown in *Ronggeng Dukuh Paruk* Trilogy. At the beginning of the novel, readers are provided with a pleasing village environment.

A pair of cranes soared in the wind high in the sky. Without even flapping their wings, they moved in harmony for hours. Its voice was shrill. It sounded like a long groan. Water. These two birds had drifted hundreds of kilometers looking for puddles. They had longed for the mud on which they sought prey; frogs, fish, shrimp, or other aquatic insects.

However, the drought is not over. Thousands of hectares of rice fields surrounding Dukuh Paruk had been barren for seven months. The pair of cranes would not find any puddle of water. The rice fields turned into gray dry fields. All kinds of grass died. The green spots here and there were *kerokot* (a pest plant looking like a

cactus), the food for grasshoppers and crickets. This type of cactus plant actually only appeared during summer.

In the other part of the field, a sparrow was trying to defend its life. It flew like a rock from a slingshot while screaming wildly. A kestrel chased it at an excessive speed. The air that the two beasts traveled through made a whooshing sound. The screech of the sparrow was heard as the beak of the kestrel bit its head. .... (*Ronggeng Dukuh Paruk*, 1982: 5)

Ahmad Tohari describes the setting of the story in detail. Nature as the setting of the story has become the charm of the story because only competent writers can depict nature thoroughly. Mahayana stated that:

The issue of the environment, which is rarely used by Indonesian writers has become the charm of Ahmad Tohari's works. The situation of the rural village is somehow perceived to have innocent, slum, open, naive, and natural sense, but it still promises a sincere and selfless peace. The situation is an honest world that prioritizes harmony between living beings and the environment in their surrounding. This is – at least – the impression that is conveyed in almost all of Ahmad Tohari's works (Mahayana, 1989: vii).

The representation of nature is also found in *Ronggeng Dukuh Paruk* trilogy. At the beginning of the second novel entitled *Lintang Kemukus Dini Hari*, nature is depicted to introduce the story. The description of nature is presented on pages 7 and 8. The morning situation in Dukuh Paruk, as well as the animals and plants found in the area, are described in detail.

Dukuh Paruk is quiet even though various animals were awake because the dawn was breaking. The goats began to get restless in their cages. The crowing of the roosters was heard once at a time and then more intensely. *Sikatan* bird scurried from its hiding place. It was ready to take off when it saw the first insect passing in its' sight. ..... Crickets, big head crickets, and bugs had been silent for a long time. The big head crickets hid themselves in a hole in the ground that was plugged from the inside. A grasshopper blended itself with the green color of the leaves.

There was a rose apple tree in one corner of Dukuh Paruk. In the midst of the lush tree, a harmony of nature is being performed. Hundreds of honeybees very diligently gathered the pollen. Their wings were soothing as they filled the dim morning. (*Lintang Kemukus Dini Hari*, 1985: 7-8).

Similarly, at the beginning of *Jantera Bianglala* novel, Dukuh Paruk situation in early 1966 after the fire incident is described. The damaged nature is caused by the rebellion of the Communist Party of Indonesia in that small and remote area.

When Dukuh Paruk became *karang abang lemah ireng* (damaged by fire) in early 1966, almost all of those 23 houses turned into ashes. At that time, many people thought it was the end of the hamlet. Those who wanted to survive should leave

Dukuh Paruk because all property, rice, and *gaplek* (sliced dried root of cassava) were burnt to ashes, so were chicken and goats (their farm). (*Jantera Bianglala*, 1986: 7)

The representation of nature in Ahmad Tohari's works shows his awareness of the sustainability of green nature in a remote village. In *Lintang Kemukus Dini Hari*, Ahmad Tohari shows his awareness of the damaged environment caused by irresponsible people.

When the forests had been damaged. When the rice fields smelled like pest spray, and when too many youths had air rifles. So, the Segara Anakan area and the marshy area around was the last place for various types of birds to survive. (*Lintang Kemukus Dini Hari*, 1985: 94)

Ahmad Tohari also describes the condition of Dukuh Paruk by revealing the natural environment. Dukuh Paruk is like moss on a rock. The writer describes the setting of the story by depicting the natural environment, with moss as an analog. The life of the people in Dukuh Paruk is described as the growth and development of the moss. How moss grows and develops and its resilience in facing environmental drought and speed in responding to air and water to regrow are associated with the people of Dukuh Paruk.

Regarding the ability to survive, Dukuh Paruk could only be compared to moss on a rock. Moss was silent and seemed to die in the dry season. Dry and peeled. But in its death, a moss held the life force. The spores were encased in cysts that were capable of immediately turning their life cycle when the first drop of water or even the mere humidity of air touched it. Dukuh Paruk was a moss that was apparently created to fulfill the needs of living in the most minimal conditions. Dukuh Paruk was still there even without a smile or even a laugh. It was still there even though he barely knew the meaning of his existence anymore. *(Jantera Bianglala, 1986: 10)*

Nature representation was also carried out by Ahmad Tohari by revealing the life of various types of animals that live in the countryside, especially in Dukuh Paruk. The lives and habits of various types of birds are described by Tohari in his novel. The type, color, behavior, and food are described in detail and clearly.

Quiet morning. The sun rays in small beams went through the shade of the Dukuh Paruk cemetery. Drops of dew on the leaf tips caught the light and refracted it into a soft rainbow that glowed. A squirrel slid down from the tree.

In the thick of the parasite, a pair of honey birds chased. The red-colored male chased the female. After being caught, the two wrestled for a moment and then fell down while making love.

The large banyan tree as the crown of the Dukuh Paruk cemetery was the palace of the birds. On a hidden branch perched a plop. He was dozing off after spending the night hunting for mice, fish, or frogs. Only the little magpie bird dared to disturb the

king of birds at night. The pitch-black crickets and the green stilts perched in groups (*Ronggeng Dukuh Paruk*, 1982: 65-66).

The detailed illustration of nature in Ahmad Tohari's fictional works not only bring its own charm to readers but also provides criticisms for Tohari regarding the use of the environmental setting. Dermawan (1992) in his thesis stated that there are elements of illogical background in the *Ronggeng Dukuh Paruk* Trilogy. The illogicality is related to the area of Dukuh Paruk which is not too wide but there are a lot of animals and plants. In the Dukuh Paruk area, there are no less than 38 types of birds, 21 types of insects, 15 mammals, 10 types of reptiles, and 15 other types of animals, and there are 48 types of plants in various varieties. Also, the number of types of animals and plants in Dukuh Paruk which is not too wide is illogical.

Writing his novel, Tohari did not think logically and illogically. Tohari wants to convey to his readers how the beauty of the natural environment with various living creatures in it can always live in balance. The balance and harmony of life with the natural environment, both plants and animals must always be maintained properly to make a better life.

The problem of the life balance related to the environment is also represented by Ahmad Tohari in the novel *Lingkar Tanah Lingkar Air* and the novel *Di Kaki Bukit Cibalak*. In both novels, Ahmad Tohari describes the good relationship between humans and animals and their environment. The character of the story can live in the forest without the threat of wild animals; tigers become his friend because they take care of each other.

When there was a fairy tale about a friendship between a wild animal and a human, we really felt it in real experience. *Si Tutul* (leopard) got closer and stopped just a few meters in front of us. *Si Tutul* hid his body behind the hanging roots as if asking for protection from us. Me, Jun, and Kiram were used to seeing *Si Tutul* (*Lingkar Tanah Lingkar Air*: 132).

Si Tutul is the name of the leopard that lives in the forest where they hide. They are used to seeing the animal. They look after each other, and no one interferes. The beginning of the novel *Di Kaki Bukit Cibalak* tells about the good relationship between humans and wild animals in the environment.

Once Mbok Sum's buffalo didn’t come home for three days. On the fourth day, the animal appeared with its newborn cub in the forest. At that time there were still many Javanese tigers in the teak forests of Cibalak, but the wild animal preferred to pounce on monkeys or langurs, and there were still many wild boars there (*Di Kaki Bukit Cibalak*: 6).

The teak forest environment in Bukit Cibalak was well maintained. No community members harmed the forest. The forest and everything in it was always guarded. There were foremen with swords and mustaches in charge of guarding the teak

forest. Plants and animals thrived there, and the ecosystem chain was well maintained. (*Di Kaki Bukit Cibalak*: 68-69)

2. Representation of nature in Characters

The main characters in *Ronggeng Dukuh Paruk* Trilogy are Srintil and Rasus. The name Srintil in Javanese culture represents its own meaning. Tohari chose the name of the main character, Srintil, which has a meaning related to the natural environment. There are some people who liken Srintil to goat dung. Although goat dung is dirty and disgusting, it has great benefits for the environment for plant fertilizers. *Beribil* is one type of organic fertilizer made from animal waste which has better quality than other types of fertilizers'. Although Srinthil is considered dirty, it has great benefits for the environment, especially for the people of Dukuh Paruk.

The first neon light in Dawuan was a witness that what happened to Srintil was something unique. Its historical background was destitute and rural like goat dung. Even though goat dung was smelly and disgusting, it was able to fertilize tobacco leaves in an arid land. Srintil was not torn apart by her history. On the other hand, Srintil rose to form itself with its backward history. The results began to be exposed under the light. Srintil became the center of interest and She sat controlled the situation (*Lintang Kemukus Dini Hari*, 1985: 120).

In addition, in the Banyumas community, Srintil is also known as the name of a type of plant, namely tobacco which tastes the best when made into cigarettes. This type of tobacco needs to be developed continuously because it contributes great benefits to tobacco farmers. Do not let it be extinct. The price of this type of tobacco is the most expensive one. The name Srintil still represents an object or goods that have a high value in the environment. Srintil as the main character in the novel represents a plant that is familiar to farmers, namely tobacco which has great benefits in their lives.

As *beribil*, goat dung provides the environment with great benefits because it can be used as fertilizer. The environment becomes greener and the plants are fertile. As one of the most delicious types of tobacco when smoked, it also has great benefits for the environment. In this case, there has been the production and exchange of meanings as revealed by Hall (1997: 15) that representation is part of the process of producing and exchanging meaning and through language, the process is carried out.

The name of the character Srintil as a ronggeng dancer in Hamlet Paruk also represents nature, and the ronggeng dance is related to fertility. Ronggeng or tayub dance is closely related to agrarian society, especially for ritual ceremonies, such as village cleansing (*bersih desa/ metri desa/sedhekah bumi)*. This dance is believed to have magical powers related to fertility purposes (Suharto, 1999: 15, Soedarsono, 1991: 35). Initially, the ronggeng dance was a fertility rite among the farming communities (Simatupang, 2013: 230). The survival of agrarian communities in

rural area is the result of the interaction between human work and the natural environment, such as soil fertility and rainfall. This shows that the choice of the type of art in Ahmad Tohari's novel is not arbitrary because it represents a separate message from the writer to his readers. The message of fertility is the one that must always be maintained and preserved, including, the natural environment in an agrarian society.

The characters in the *Ronggeng Dukuh Paruk* trilogy are always close to nature and maintain harmony with the natural environment. The beautiful natural environment with the plants and animals that inhabit it is described to live side by side with humans. The characters in the story are always united and integrated with nature, taking care of the natural environment properly. The characters in the story presented by Ahmad Tohari in his story live together and unite with all living things and nature around them. Almost all of the characters created by Ahmad Tohari are depictions of people who always emphasize the importance of establishing harmonious relations between humans, living things, and the universe (http://sastra-indonesia.com/2009/03/lingungan-dunia-dalam-sastra).

In addition, the representation of the natural environment can also be seen in the use of the novel title used by Ahmad Tohari. The title of the first novel is *Ronggeng Dukuh Paruk*. Ronggeng as a form of folk art is related to fertility problems in agrarian societies or farmers. Dukuh Paruk also revealed a hamlet with a rural natural environment. The second novel is *Lintang Kemukus Dini Hari*. 'Lintang Kemukus' is one of the types of stars in the universe which according to Javanese belief is a sign of a big event in nature. 'Early morning' is also a representation of the natural environment in the form of time. It is a change of time from night to morning and related to the natural environment. The third novel is *Jantera Bianglala*. The *Jantera Bianglala* also represents natural events. Rainbow is a natural event related to the environment and it will usually look clear and beautiful when it rains, especially in rural areas.

Through his work, Tohari wants to give a message to readers about life and how the examples in the story solve a problem that is sometimes intelligent but absurd in the view of the readers (Roqib, 2007: 116). The stories in the novels *Ronggeng Dukuh Paruk, Lintang Kemukus Dini Hari, Jantera Bianglala, Orang-Orang Proyek, Di Kaki Bukit Cibalak*, and other novels are packaged in simple terms with straightforward and communicative language and a natural environment setting that can soothe the hearts of readers. Although sometimes it is exaggerated in its expressions, readers can happily enjoy it. For Tohari, the broadest and deepest motivation for writing a trilogy of novels is to achieve “nur”, the light of life. Therefore, he is more solemn in describing nature, especially humans, animals, and plants (Roqib, 2007: 155). The illustration of the natural environment in the three novels is more dominant. Each chapter or section in these novels always has a description of the natural

environment, especially the rural natural environment which is still well preserved and beautiful with various plants and animals that live and thrive in it.

The novels *Di Kaki Bukit Cibalak*, Bekisar Merah, and *Lingkar Tanah Lingkar Air* also imply the use of the environment. The titles of these novels stimulate the readers to imagine a good environment, even though the title of the novel Bekisar Merah is only used as an analogy, not the real red bekisar, namely the jungle fowl.

3. The Function of Environmental Representation in Ahmad Tohari's Fiction Works

Ahmad Tohari's fiction works make use of and represent the environment. This representation of the environment serves to obtain the aesthetic elements of the story. By utilizing the depiction of the environment in his fiction, Ahmad Tohari managed to make the story more interesting and beautiful. For example, the illustration of the environment at the beginning of the novel *Ronggeng Dukuh Paruk* is as follows.

A pair of cranes soared in the wind high in the sky. Without even flapping their wings, they moved in harmony for hours. Its voice was shrill. It sounded like a long groan. Water. These two birds had drifted hundreds of kilometers looking for puddles. They had longed for the mud on which they sought prey; frogs, fish, shrimp, or other aquatic insects.

However, the drought is not over. Thousands of hectares of rice fields surrounding Dukuh Paruk had been barren for seven months. The pair of cranes would not find any puddle of water. The rice fields turned into gray dry fields. All kinds of grass died. The green spots here and there were *kerokot* (a pest plant looking like a cactus), the food for grasshoppers and crickets. This type of cactus plant only appeared during summer.

In the other part of the field, a sparrow was trying to defend its life. It flew like a rock from a slingshot while screaming wildly. A kestrel chased it at an excessive speed. The air that the two beasts traveled through made a whooshing sound. The screech of the sparrow was heard as the beak of the kestrel bit its head. .... (*Ronggeng Dukuh Paruk*, 1982: 5)

The beginning of the story in the novel *Ronggeng Dukuh Paruk* makes readers feel like they are in the real environment told by the writer. The story becomes more attractive and beautiful, and even the description of his living environment is quite detailed.

The same thing can also be seen in the depiction of the environment in the middle or at the end of the story. The example of the environmental illustration found in the middle of the story in the novel *Ronggeng Dukuh Paruk* is as follows.

Quiet morning. The sun's rays in small beams went through the shade of the Dukuh Paruk cemetery. Drops of dew on the leaf tips caught the light and refracted it into a soft rainbow that glowed. A squirrel slid down from the tree.

Among the thick parasite plants, a pair of honey birds chased. The red-colored male chased the female. After being caught, the two wrestled for a moment and then fell down while making love.

The large banyan tree as the crown of the Dukuh Paruk cemetery was the palace of the birds. On a hidden branch perched a plop. He was dozing off after spending the night hunting for mice, fish, or frogs. Only the little magpie bird dared to disturb the king of birds at night. The pitch-black crickets and the green stilts perched in groups (*Ronggeng Dukuh Paruk*, 1982: 65-66).

In addition to obtaining the aesthetic elements of the story, the representation of the environment in Ahmad Tohari's fiction also serves to convey a message for people to maintain the environment. For example, in the novel *Lintang Kemukus Dini Hari*, Ahmad Tohari is also worried about the damage to the natural environment, which is done by irresponsible people.

When the forests had been damaged. When the rice fields smelled like pest spray, and when too many youths had air rifles. So, the Segara Anakan area and the marshy area around it was the last place for various types of birds to survive (*Lintang Kemukus Dini Hari*, 1985: 94).

Protecting the environment is a shared obligation, and Ahmad Tohari through his fiction has tried to remind us all of the significance of protecting our environment. In the novel *Orang-Orang Proyek*, the characters also always take care of the forest environment where they work on the bridge project. In the forest, they are always careful not to damage the various plants and animals that live around the project they are working on. The same can be found in other novels.

Conclusions

Ahmad Tohari's fiction works often represent the natural environment in his neighborhood. In his works of fiction, Ahmad Tohari represents the environment in the background elements, story characters, and novel titles. In the background of the story, fertility and the variety of plants that grow as and small animals that usually live in the countryside and forests are well narrated by him. The writer describes the setting of the places, for example, the forest environment around the Cibawor River, the Cigobang forest environment, the mouth of the Citandui River, Cibalak Hill, Tanggir Village, and Dukuh Paruk where various types of plants and animals live in the hamlet environment. The representation of the environment through the name of a character, for example, the name Srintil, in the Banyumas area, is one type of tobacco that has a fairly high economic value compared to other types. 'Srintil' tobacco can have high economic value if it is cared for properly; the leaves are green

and not damaged by pests. The representation through the title can be found in the *Di Kaki Bukit Cibalak*, *Ronggeng Dukuh Paruk, Lintang Kemukus Dini Hari,* and *Jantera Bianglala novels*. The representation of nature in Ahmad Tohari's fiction serves to add an aesthetic element and convey the message to protect the environment.

References

[1] Buell, Lawrence. 1995. *The Environmental Imagination.* Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
[2] Damono, Sapardi Djoko. 1979. *Sosiologi Sastra Sebuah Pengantar Ringkas.* Jakarta: Pusat Pembinaan dan Pengembangan Bahasa Depdikbud.
[3] Dermawan, Taufik. 1992. "Trilogi *Ronggeng Dukuh Paruk* Ahmad Tohari Telaah Semiotik dan Strukturalisme-Genetik" *Tesis.* Jakarta: Program Pascasarjana UI (tidak diterbitkan).
[4] Faruk. 1994. *Pengantar Sosiologi Sastra.* Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
[5] Glothfelty, C. dan H. Froom (ed). 1996. *The Ecocriticism Reader: Landmarks in Literary Ecology.* London: University of Georgia Press.
[6] Hall, Stuart. 1997. *Representation: Cultural Representation and Signifying Practices.* London: SAGE Publications Ltd.
[7] Harsono, Siswo. 2008. Jurnal Ekokritik "Kritik Sastra Berwawasan Lingkungan".Semarang:Undip.*http://ejournal.undip.ac.id/index.php/kajian sastra/article/ view/2702/pdf.* Diunduh pada tanggal 3 Agustus 2017.
[8] Juliasih. 2012. "Manusia dan Lingkungan dalam Novel Life in The Iron Millis Karya Rebecca Hardings Davis*". Jurnal Litera (Volume 11, nomor 1, April 2012), Halaman 83-97.*
[9] Mahayana, Maman S. 1989. "Prakata" dalam *Senyum Karyamin.* Jakarta: Gramedia.
[10] ----------. 2007. *Ekstrinsikalitas Sastra Indonesia*. Jakarta: PT. Raja Grafindo Persada.
[11] Nurgiyantoro, Burhan. 1998. *Teori Pengkajian Fiksi*. Gadjah Mada University Press: Yogyakarta.
[12] Pradopo, Rachmat Djoko. 1995. *Beberapa Teori Sastra, Metode Kritik, dan Penerapannya.* Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
[13] Roqib, Moh. 2007. *Harmoni dalam Budaya Jawa (Dimensi Edukasi dan Keadilan Gender).* Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
[14] Simatupang, Lono. 2013. *Pergelaran, Sebuah Mozaik Penelitian Seni-Budaya.* Yogyakarta: Jalasutra.
[15] Soedarsono, RM. 1991. "Tayub di Akhir Abad 20" dalam Soedarso S.P. (ed). *Beberapa Catatan tentang Perkembangan Kesenian Kita.* Yogyakarta: BP ISI Yogyakarta.
[16] Suharto, Ben. 1999. *Tayub, Tari, dan Ritus Kesuburan.* Bandung: Masyarakat Seni Tari Indonesia.

[17] Swingewood, Allan and Diana Laurenson. 1972. *The Sociology of Literature.* London: MacGibbon & Kee.
[18] Teeuw, A. 1980. *Sastra Indonesia Baru.* Ende Flores: Nusa Indah.
[19] Tohari, Ahmad. 1980. *Kubah.* Jakarta: Grmedia.
[20] ----------. 1982. *Ronggeng Dukuh Paruk.* Jakarta: Gramedia.
[21] ----------. 1985. *Lintang Kemukus Dini Hari.* Jakarta: Gramedia.
[22] ----------. 1986. *Jantera Bianglala.* Jakarta: Gramedia.
[23] ----------. 1986. *Di Kaki Bukit Ci Balak.* Jakarta: Gramedia.
[24] ----------. 1995. *Lingkar Tanah Lingkar Air.* Jakarta: Gramedia.
[25] ----------. 2002. *Orang-Orang Proyek.* Jakarta: Gramedia.
[26] Yudiono K.S. 2003. *Ahmad Tohari: Karya dan Dunianya.* Jakarta: Grasindo.
[27] http://sastra-indonesia.com/2009/03/lingkungan-hidup-dalam-sastra/Maman S.Mahayana, diakses 12 Agustus 2016.
[28] https://fatchulfkip.wordpress.com/2013/01/06/ekokritisisme-kajian-ekologis-dalam -sastra- oleh-fatchul-muin. diakses 12 Agustus 2016.

Aleel's Transcendental Vision in W.B. Yeats's The Countess Cathleen

Fawziya Mousa Ghanim

Ins. , University of Baghdad-College of Arts

Abstract

W.B. Yeats (1865-1939) discussed different issues in his plays. He dramatized the Irish society, folklore, and nationality. The Abby Theatre became his platform for Irish national art and his struggle for the Irish unity, prosperity and strength. The poet according to Yeats is a visionary, a wanderer, and an activist. The paper aims at analyzing Aleel's self-conflict and his repeated attempts to persuade Countess Cathleen of leaving her quest for the sake of their love and sublime life. Besides, it will explain Aleel's journey towards Countess Cathleen 's pole of objectivity.

Keywords: Countess Cathleen, Aleel and vision.

The Countess Cathleen is a short play in five scenes, set in sixteenth century Ireland. It is the first play, Yeats has written especially for the stage and the first play to be performed by the Irish literary. Theatre seated in the hall of the Ancient Concert Rooms in Dublin. It represents every aspect of the social and political life of the province (Frazier 1987,p.240). The Countess Cathleen [originally Kathleen] was written in 1889. Published in 1892, but produced on stage only in 1899, the play was written with Maud Gonne in mind, shortly after she met Yeats.

The story of the play is based on a traditional tale of ''the Countess Cathleen Oshea , a story, he has found and thought suitable for a poetic drama''(Jack1984,p.150), when he was preparing his *Fairy and Folk Tales of the Irish Peasantry* (1888), and was intended for Maud Gonne to act in Dublin. The play has a simple episodic plot, the Countess Cathleen rejects her dreams for the reality of life; she opposes the efforts of two-demon-merchants to buy the souls of her starving peasants. She insists to sell her soul for a high price, in order to free her people's soul and save them from starvation. Aleel, the Countess's bard, tries to prevent her from fulfilling her will, but she prefers the world of responsibility and sacrifice rather than the world of dreams and love. In spite of Aleel's attempts to persuade her, she goes on to

achieve her holy quest. The salvation of her people is her only wish, though; even she sold her soul to the demon-merchants. As a result she dies of grief for her own lost soul,"but, because her motives are pure, she is permitted to enter heaven"(Demastes 1997,p.403) , the gates of heaven are described by the angel who is seized by Aleel;

> The Angel: The light beats down; the gates of pearl are wide;
>
> And she is passing to the floor of peace,
>
> …The light of lights
>
> Looks always on the motive, not the deed,
>
> The Shadow of Shadows on the deed alone.(Yeats 1982,p.50)

Yeats has written *The Countess Cathleen* out of a general ambition to create a great distinctive poetic literature out of Ireland's pagan legends so, it is a mixture of his personal thought and feeling with the beliefs and customs of Christian Ireland, besides it represents "the perennial Yeatsian conflict of dreams versus human responsibility''(Flannery 1976,p.143). In this play, Yeats longs for a one Ireland that is unified by one spirit and religion. The world of famine and misery is shown at the opening scene of the play. The dramatist portrays it throughout the peasants' family, the father Shemus, the mother Mary and the son Teique.

As a result of the starvation, they are in a hard situation, besides, they are incapable of bearing the burden of hunger and thirst. Shemus and Teique are described as blasphemous persons, because they are disturbed by Mary's prayers and patience;

> Teique: What is the good of praying?....
>
> God and the Mother of God have dropped a sleep.
>
> Mary: You'll bring misfortune with your blasphemies
>
> Shemus: I'm in no mood to listen to your clatter.
>
> Although I tramped the woods for half a day,
>
> I've taken nothing. (I: p.4)

At the same time, the Countess Cathleen, Aleel and her Foster-mother Oona appear on the stage, they lose their way towards Cathleen's castle. When Cathleen sees and hears about the peasants' agonies she decides to put all her wealth at the service of the peasants. Aleel's character, the poet in the play is not found in the original legend, as David R.Clark points out that Aleel is invented for dramatic purposes and through five revisions of the play, his role is [strengthen] and widened more and more.(Clark 1965,p.162). He represents the voice of passion and spirituality, and he longs for a world of peace and love, the same world, he invites Cathleen to, by his

music and song. Throughout the character of Aleel and Cathleen, Yeats shows two kinds of realities, and two opposing worlds, the world of dream and imagination, that is depicted by Aleel's poetry and songs, and the world of materialism and exploitation of man's life and dignity, that is portrayed by Cathleen's sacrifice. The Countess Cathleen's conflict is deepened by the existence of Aleel, perhaps, he is regarded as the subconscious, which digs deep or tries to over control Cathleen's consciousness, in order to escape the world of responsibility. About the role of Aleel in the play, Peter Ure states that

> [Aleel] is the poet, dreamer, and lover who urges Kathleen's retirement to dreams and the Druid forest, to self-absorption, and the subjective life of peaceful beauty, away from responsibilities and the objective life of self-sacrifice and war; he is wrought into a successful symbol (which has many links with Yeats later verse) of "the un christened heart", the messenger of Aedh and Aenqus.(Ure 1967,p.23)

Aleel cannot be distributed by the terrible situation of the peasants, while they are busied by their troubles, he is singing and playing his lute. Once, he answers Shemus who cannot bear his music and songs, "who mocks at music mocks at love" (I: p.8), and he reveals his feeling of love, and shows his unawareness of the peasants misfortune:

> Aleel [singing], were I but crazy for love's sake,
>
> I know who'd measure out his length,
>
> I know the heads that I should break,
>
> For crazy men have double strength.
>
> I know all out to leave or take,
>
> Were I but crazy for love's sake, (I:p.8)

Thus, Aleel, as a poet who plays a crucial role, is not only "a non-Christian celebrate of primal joy, but also as Cathleen's would-be lover"(Rosenthal 1997,p.38). He begs her to go off with him, "And live in the hills/Among the sound of music and light" (III: p.25). As a Yeatsian poet, his world is inhabited by visions and prophesies, for he prophesies the coming of a disaster, "For who say what walks, or in what shape/Some devilish creature flies in the air, but now/Two grey horned owls hooted above our heads" (I: p.9). Cathleen, according to Aleel's idea is a symbol of the unity of the country, of religion and love, if she dies, he will lose the spirituality of everything. Cathleen's sorrow and sadness lead Aleel to keep her mind in peace. Because she rejects the world of dreams in favour of responsibility, this desire weakness the force of her attraction to Aleel. Moreover, Aleel is disturbed by Oona's speech and interpretation, when he sings about the dancers, and their physical and spiritual joy:

Aleel [sings]

Lift up the white knee;

Hear what they sing.

Those young dancers

That in a ring

Raved but now

Of the hearts that broke

Long, long ago

For their sake. (II: P.19)

He struggles to attain this world, but by Cathleen's sacrifice, he will not achieve it. Ultimately for Aleel this dream-world is not simply "a negative escape from the world of reality but a positive assertion of a different order of reality altogether'' (Knowland 1983, p.11). He grasps Cathleen's sorrow and fear, he tries to release her by his songs and speeches, but Oona does not give him time, and she regards him as an unchristian man. Oona tries to distract Cathleen from Aleel's profane thoughts, "What Queen Maeve thinks on / when the moon is pinched, / And whether now…as in the old days the dancers/Set their brief love on men" (II: P.18). Oona answers him that "these are not thoughts for any Christian ear" (I: p.18), while Aleel ignores her, picks up his lute, and sings a song to Cathleen

inviting her to forget her moral burdens and take Queen Maeve as her model. Aleel wants Cathleen to be as Queen Maeve in her behavior, who has the ability to forget the name of her lover, so, Cathleen should forget her supposed duty. The poet calls for both spiritual and national art instead of subjugating "himself to the hopeless martyrdom of religion, he has chosen to give his soul, in love to the Christian Cathleen''(Clark ,p.161), which the devil cannot take from her. Aleel-Oona debate reveals Aleel's knowledge, which is richer than Oona's knowledge that is chained by religious prohibition:

Aleel: I thought to have kept her from remembering

The evil of the times for full ten minutes.

But now when seven are out you come between.

Oona: Talk on; what does it matter what you say,

For you have not been christened?

Aleel: Old woman, old woman,

You robbed her of three minutes' peace of mind,

And though you live unto a hundred years,

And wash the feet of beggars and give alms,

…you shall not be pardoned. (II: P.19)

Yeats believes that Ireland can be united through the superiority of art, and he is not against the Christian doctrine but against the religious prohibition and Man's tyranny. In spite of Oona's protest and accusation, and Cathleen's resistance to Aleel's appeal, he goes on to his goal. In scene three, when Cathleen is kneeling in front of the alter in the oratory, he talks to her about his dream, "My dream became a fire; and in the fire/One walked and he had birds about his head" (III: P.25). The god with "birds about his head", that appeared to Aleel is Aenqus who is described by Yeats elsewhere as the poetry ancient Celtic 'master of love', who reigned in Tir-nan-Oge, the pre-Christian paradise, where Aleel wishes Cathleen to fly with him:

Cathleen: I have heard that one of the old gods walked so.

Aleel: It may be that is angelical;

And, Lady, he bids me call you from these woods.

…, and live in the hills,

Among the sounds of music and the light

Of waters, till evil days are down.

For here some terrible death is waiting you,

Cathleen: No, not angelical. (III: P.25)

Actually, Cathleen realizes that Aleel is speaking for another set of values. Aenqus is "not angelical" in the sense that "he does not share the orthodox Christian belief in sacrifice and shared burden of sin''(Clark& Knowland 1975,p.15). Aleel's possession of poetic vision and his capacity for love presume the ultimate supremacy of the spiritual world over the material one. Cathleen describes the life that Aleel invites her to as a happy life:

Cathleen: Although I weep, I do not weep

Because that life would be most happy and here,

I find no way, no end, nor do I weep

Because I had longed to look upon your face,

But that a night of prayer has made me weary. (III: P.26)

The poet argues that the maker of mankind is responsible for what happens, therefore, Cathleen should get rid of her quest; "let Him that made/mankind, the angels and devils/ And death and plenty, mend what he has made" (III: P.26). He

thinks that what he has seen in dream is divine and not like the old god who lingered in Ireland, he identifies the god as an angelical being by his spirituality and inspiration. Cathleen refuses Aleel's love, not because of their difference in social class and religion, but because she has become like 'an empty pitcher. J.J. Cribb remarks that Cathleen has become an empty vessel because she has chosen a path of self-destruction rather than one of such as that of the pagan poet [Aleel] or of the Irish mother [Mary].(Cribb 1981,p.178). The hero's frustration of gaining his quest leads to selling his soul to the demons, "Here, take my soul for I am tired of it/I do not ask a price" (V.p40). He sells his soul out of love, as opposite to Cathleen's behavior , who sells her soul out of duty. Aleel cannot stand forcefully to change Cathleen's decision, she moves towards the oratory door, he simply lets his clasped hands, which he holds out beseechingly to her, fall, and moves towards the door through which the wood can be seen. Many critics interpret that Aleel's behavior is regarded as a kind of passivity which is due to his failure or the inability to express his love strongly, such as Brenda S. Webster who states that

> Aleel fails to convey a sense of heroic or creative abundance and is almost as unable to love or at least to express his love forcefully as the Countess's goodness, which makes him feel unworthy and by fear of his own energy impulses. (Webster 1973,p.47)

In fact, Aleel accompanies Cathleen in different situations, he uses all his means to prevent her, firstly he soothes and comforts her, then he faces and discusses Cathleen's situation with Oona. Secondly, he expresses his love to Cathleen by his poetic and imaginative language. In addition, he has an inner power which is seen by the two demon-merchants; "His gaze has filled me, brother,/ with shaking and a dreadful fear" (v: p.41). This kind of premonition leads to the demons final defeat, that is interpreted by Aleel "at the end of the play in the artist's vision of an ultimate reality''(Clark & Knowland,p.15). The demon-merchants stand against the idea of buying Aleel's soul, for Aleel's love is enduring him with power, the effect of which, is to envelop his heart with a shield too strong even for the devils to penetrate. Truly, he is the only person who is saved from the demon's temptation. He tells himself:

> Aleel: Impetuous heart be still, be still,
>
> Your sorrowful love can never be told,
>
> Cover it up with a lonely tune.
>
> He who could bend all things to His will
>
> Has covered the door of the infinite fold
>
> With the pale stars and the wandering moon. (IV: P.36)

In this last attempt, he tries to recover his power and persistence, when Cathleen leans forward to sign the pact. Aleel rushes towards Cathleen and snatches the pen from her, and addresses her "leave all things to the Builder of Heaven" (v. p.44). She answers him by her saying "I have no thought; I hear a cry-a cry" (v: P.44). Cathleen sees him as a man who sang about the dancer of the woods/ That know not the hard burden of the world" (v: p. 48). Aleel's world seems as a world of irresponsibility, he shows that his world is worthier than the world that Cathleen will sacrifice her soul. He becomes loyal to his principal of love, beauty and transcendental reality. Yeats depicts Aleel as a man "who prophesies [Cathleen]'s death, at the fulfillment of that prophecy, sees the vision of Hell, a pagan Hell "(Stallwrthy 1969,p.3).The playwright combines the pagan world with the Christian one. Both worlds are threatened by the demons. The hero, a pagan poet describes the pagan hell and a Christian heaven, the pagan hell is peopled by "ancient Irish mythical personages superficially like Milton's demonized deities. But it exists without reference to anything like Lucifer's revolt against heaven or original sin"(Rosenthal,p.41).

Aleel: The brazen door stands wide, and Balor comes
Borne in his heavy car, and demons have lifted
The age-weary eyelids from the eyes that of old
Turned gods to stone; Barach, the traitor, comes
And the lasevisious race, Cailitin,
That cast a Druid weakness and Decay
Over Sualtim's and Old Dectora's child;
When he killed Naoise and broke Deirdre's heart;
And all their heads are twisted to one side,
For when they lived they warred on beauty and peace.
With obstinate, crafty, sidelong bitterness. (v.p.45)

The poet portrays the conflict between two groups of old Irish legendary characters, Balor is the leader of hosts of darkness in "the decisive war between good and evil. He is a one eyed demon who had a role in the death of Naoise who eloped with Deirdre who was the beloved of Concubar"(Clark&Knowland ,p. 175).The poet's visionary world is depicted fully in the play. Aleel as a visionary is one "whose mind is smitten of God" (v: p.49). His vision becomes real, he prophesies the defeat of demonic power and the triumph of the divine order in his new vision;

Aleel:I have seen a vision under a green hedge,
A hedge of hips and haws-men yet shall hear
The archangels rolling Satan's empty skull

Over the mountain-tops. (v: p.44)

He seizes one of the angels and asks him about the fate of Cathleen, the angel's answer reveals that Cathleen is now on her way to heaven. Naturally, it is Aleel's pagan imagination "which conjures a vision of Christian angels made real upon the stage"(Parkin 1978,p.73).The poet is satisfied by his loyalty to ancient art and beliefs, in the same sense, he is a rebel, and Cathleen who rejects the lure of the past in favour of loyalty to an Irish present. Perhaps, Cathleen's sacrifice is justified by Aleel's actions; he is ready to abandon his soul to the demon without any price, when he is rejected by Cathleen. The same as Aleel, Forgael in *The Shadowy Waters* is an equally crazed visionary who is steadfast in his quest 'through the waste places of the great sea' for the love of an immortal woman, while Cathleen has rejected Aleel, Dectora, in the end of the play decides to sail with Fragael away from the experience of an earthly world into the world of eternal shadows.

Balachandra Rajan states that the Countess Cathleen "is clearly a statement of responsibility, with Aleel representing the temptation of dream"(Rajan 1965,p.25).

She expresses the uncertainty of Aleel's world. She is haunted by the idea of saving her people, also she reveals to Aleel that if the economic or political situation is changed the old tales about "Queens have wed shepherds" are true, and he will become more than kings, and not as his situation now. Aleel gives up his quest especially when Cathleen goes straightforward towards her mission. When he holds his clasped hands towards her for a moment hesitatingly, and then lets them full beside him, Cathleen says:

Cathleen: Do not hold out to me besseching hands.

This heart shall never waken on earth

I have sworn,

Aleel: [who has risen] when one so great spoken of

Love to one

So little as I: though to deny him love,

…knowing how greatly

They have overdared?

Cathleen: If the old tales are true,

Queen have wed shepherds…

God's procreant waters flowing about your mind

Have made you more than king's or Queen's and no

You. (III: P.27)

He explores "altruistic motives in his attempts to restore the peace of the Countess. He sees her as destroying her chances for both peace and love without necessarily gaining anything more valuable in return"(Webster, p. 43).Yeats calls for the 'ultimate insight' which connects him with "redemption from the pressure of time and chance through the exercise of the poetic imagination"(Dennis &Mulryne 1965,p.124). The peasants are redeemed by Cathleen's sacrifice, Aleel redeems his soul by Cathleen's spiritual regeneration. He dislikes Cathleen's world of incarnation, but, when she is dead, and she enters heaven instead of hell, Aleel's insight and spirituality achieve its fullness. He prophesies and recognizes the heavenly end that is waiting Cathleen. Though, he curses "Time, Fate, and Change" (v: p.49). T. Bronowski equates Cathleen's purpose fully sacrifice with the "imaginative arts". He points out that

> it is not sympathy alone which wins grace for the countess
> Cathleen. It is not enough for her to forgive her people like Prometheus, or to bless them unaware like the ancient Mariner. She plans to save the people whom she loves as purposefully as the 'imaginative arts' are planned; and it is the planned and active, the purposeful deed which wins grace for her.(Bronowski 1939,p.230)

This idea is supported by Yeats's saying that Blake believed that "the sympathy with all living things, sinful and righteous alike, which the imaginative arts awaken, is that forgiveness of sins commended by Christ"((Ibid., p. 231).Cathleen's self-annihilation is an act of love beyond self, at the same time, she represents the social responsibility of art strongly against the responsibilities of the individual. J. J. Cribb assumes that Cathleen represents the spirit of the artist that knows no compromise with nationality, language, or religion.(Cribb, p. 176).

Cathleen recognizes the richness of Aleel's world, and feels sorry about it. The voice of duty is the only voice, she hears . Unlike Forgael and Dectora in *The Shadowy Waters*, who achieve an immortal world. Forgael's supernatural world is intermingled with Dectora's natural world to attain spiritual world. In *The Countess Cathleen*, neither Aleel tries to enter Cathleen's world, nor she enters his world. The starving peasants seem her only object. She also becomes responsible of saving them from the famine and demons. Perhaps, she symbolizes Ireland as a whole. The country is exploited and occupied by the British's occupation. Ireland is in need to regenerate its power and position through art and beauty. The poet represents the superiority of art and poetry. This shows Yeats's goal in all his life, he calls for an independent life and art. At the end of the play, Aleel's subjective world is inspired by Cathleen's objective world. The play becomes a subject for different

interpretation, most of them are mentioned in this study. One of them is about the role of Aleel, as Brenda S. Webster states that Aleel lacks a heroic tendency. In a sense of objective life, Cathleen seems a heroic character. In the subjective life, Aleel is a hero of his own world. The hero's character is endowed with a mysterious power. Aleel is unlike Forgael, who knows the effect of his power. Aleel ignores his ability, while the Demon-Merchants feel fear of his strange gaze. He defends his world strongly. In his conversation with one of the peasant, he defends his music and love. With Oona, he discusses his philosophy of peace and his altruistic love of Cathleen. Like Cathleen, he is ready to sacrifice his life, but out of love. Apparently, Yeats makes the two worlds divine, the world of sacrifice and the poet's world of imagination.

Cathleen's death becomes as a source of Aleel's regenerated insight. As Terence Brown remarks that a poet's idealistic vision of an Ireland in harmony as a result of spiritual sacrifice.(Brown 1949,p.126). Aleel's transcendental world unifies with Cathleen's world of renunciation and duty.

Bibliography

[1] Bronowski Jacob (1939). The Poet's Defence .Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
[2] Brown Terence. The Life of W. B. Yeats: A Critical Biography. Oxford: Blackwell publishers, Ltd.
[3] Clark Daid R. (1965). Vision and Revision in "Yeats the Countess Cathleen" in The World of W.B Yeats: Essays in Perspective, ed. Robin Skelton & Ann Saddlemyer, Dublin: The Dolmen Press.
[4] Cribb J. J. (1981). "Yeats, Blake and the Countess Cathleen". Irish University Review, ed. Maurice Hamon, vol.II.
[5] Dennis Donoghue & Mulryne J. R. (1965). An Honoured Gest: New Essays on W. B. Yeats. London: Edward Arnold.
[6] Demastes William W(1997). Irish Playwright,1880-1995: A. Research and Production Source Book. Westport: Green wood press.
[7] Frazier Adrian(1987). "The Making of Meaning: Yeats and the Countess Cathleen", The Sewance Review, vol.xcv.
[8] Flannery James W.(1979). W. B. Yeats and the Idea of Theatre .London: Yale University Press.
[9] Knowland A. S. (1980). Yeats: Dramatist of Vision. Totoway: Barnes & Noble Books.
[10] Jeffares A. Norman & . Knowland A.S (1975). A Commentary on the Collected Plays of W. B. Yeats. London: Coxwyman Ltd.
[11] Jack Ian (1984). The Poet and Audience, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
[12] Parkin Andrew (1978). The Dramatic Imagination of W.B. Yeats. New York: Barnes & Noble Books.

[13] Rajan Balachandra (1965). W.B. Yeats: A Critical Introduction. London: Hutchinson & Co. Ltd.
[14] Rosenthal M.L. (1997). Running to Paradise: Yeats's Poetic Art, (New York: Oxford University Press.
[15] Stallwrthy Jon(1969). Vision and Revision. Oxford: Clarend Press.
[16] Ure Peter(1967). Yeats. London: Oliver and Boyd.
[17] Webster Brenda S. (1973). Yeats: a Psychoanalytic Study. London: The Macmillan Press.
[18] Yeats William Butler(1982). The Countess Cathleen, from The Collected Play of W.B. Yeats. London: Macmillan & Co. Ltd.

Images in Educational Textbooks and Educational Audiovisual Media

Archontia Foutsitzi

Laboratory Teaching Staff, Department of Primary Level Education,

Democritus University of Thrace, Greece

Abstract

The role and contribution of images to the educational process has been pointed out by many researchers. Images are a source of information and for this reason their use in education is both important and valuable. Their enduring nature is demonstrated by their long-lasting presence in educational textbooks at every level of education. The introduction of new audiovisual media into the practice of teaching has resulted in a change in the traditional way in which they appear and are displayed. However, the factor which has remained stable and unaltered is the benefit which results from their being used.

Keywords: image, illustration of educational textbooks, images in audiovisual media.

Introduction

The question of images and the role they play in teaching and learning has been and still is a major concern for both researchers as well as active teachers. In the relevant literature, both in Greek and foreign languages, there have been, especially over the last few decades, many works which refer to the illustration of audiovisual teaching materials (Kantartzi, 2002; Demetriadou, 2007; Syriou, Katsantoni&Loukeri, 2015) and to images in audiovisual teaching materials. The reason being that the role which images play in the educational process is very important. For many decades the images which teachers used when teaching their pupils mainly came from school textbooks. Nowadays this has changed. The new technological media constitute an integral part of the learning process and their use helps teachers to provide their pupils with abundant visual material and through this to form new visual representations. The ultimate goal of this activity is so that the teaching of the lessons is more graphic and attractive. When the presentation of new knowledge is not solely restricted to verbal descriptions by the teacher but is also accompanied by plenty of other stimuli, mainly visual stimuli, then the new knowledge becomes more complete and the learning is more efficient.

Images in educational textbooks

The first books to host images were manuscripts, the so-called codexes. In the intervening centuries, from the time of manuscript books until today, a lot of things have changed. Images, however, continue to be found in educational textbooks for every level of education. Their value remains timeless, because the benefits which pupils derive from their use are many (Taratori-Tsalkatidou, 2005).

All images are *visual representations.* By the term *visual representations* we mean "any representation apart from the text of unities, i.e. images, diagrams or other schematic depictions" (Christodoulou, Spiliotopoulou & Karatrantou, 2005). Not included in the above term are the boxes which contain texts and are set out in the margins of the normal course of the texts in a book.

In the newer school textbooks visual representations are very preponderant in comparison to the past. From just one simple glance one can easily ascertain that the current form of educational textbooks bears no relation to the older ones issued some decades ago. In books today the proportion of images in relation to the text is much greater (Kress & Van Leeuwen, 2010). Nowadays images do not simply represent, or just repeat everything that has been said in the text. On the contrary, they carry out extra functions: they provide didactic and communicative dimensions, apart from their representational content.

The opinions of experts diverge regarding the presence of images in educational textbooks. According to the first opinion, images explain the text next to which they have been placed. In other words, images give information which completes the meaning of the written word, because they are explanatory and clarificatory by nature. According to the second opinion, images are decorative and artistic items which accompany a text and in essence do not contribute anything more than pleasure and enjoyment (Kantartzi, 2002). Linked to the above is the question: to what extent, ultimately, do images contribute to the understanding of each conceptual unit to which they refer? Because, according to critics, the various categories of photographs, for example, which are put into many school textbooks do not contribute at all to the understanding of the language content. Or, in other cases, the new information which they present is placed outside of the text. For this reason the visual education by the writers and illustrators of school textbooks is an substantial feature, which should be seriously taken into account when a school's curriculum is being organised and structured (Arnheim, 2005).

The influence exercised by illustrations is very considerable. One of their particular features is the large number of messages they convey and the alternative way in which their messages are perceived by the recipients. The messages coming from an image are different for every single one of the recipients, because each of them can ascribe to them his own personal meaning (Marantz & Marantz, 1988). Illustration

contributes significantly to the development of the individual, because the eye is the most important input of messages to the brain (Kantartzi, 2002).

Images give a text a pedagogical character, especially when they are aimed at small children. For this reason the illustration of school textbooks has been deemed to be essential from a very early age, in order to increase their attractiveness. Every year a large number of illustrated books are released. Thanks to these book releases children's illustrated books have flourished the most in comparison with the rest. The reason why this is happening is the significant improvement not only in their contents, but also in their pictorial appearance.

Images come first nowadays. School textbooks are filled with images (Palikidis, 2009). The development of printing and of computerised systems ushered in new printing techniques, significantly improving the look of educational textbooks. Illustrated educational course books are still being produced and released just as other books, through images, are being transformed by organising their development as an art form from now on (Mastrothanasis & Kaplani, 2006).

Images in educational audiovisual media

Referring to the images in audiovisual teaching materials, we must provide one essential clarification: the perception that many people have about these images is of a static representation of an object. However, in the more important audiovisual teaching materials (cinema, television) the images are animated. So there are three approaches to the concept of images in these materials.

The first approach relates to the identification of audiovisual images with the audiovisual application as a whole. Thus, in the case of cinema, the audiovisual images can coincide with the entire film being shown and in the case of television they can concern the entire broadcast. The second approach concerns the viewing of excerpts, which is carried out selectively. In this case the teacher edits the content of the images so that viewing them can be adapted to the individual educational needs. In the third approach, one single image from the audiovisual medium is isolated and reference is made to it alone.

Of these three alternative approaches, the first is the one where the use of the medium is prevalent in the educational approach. In this case the pedagogical value of the medium depends on the content and on how closely it relates to the subject being taught. Cinema and television are applications of this type. However, films or broadcasts not made for educational purposes but whose content is useful in education cannot be excluded. The only disadvantage in this case is where the image or broadcast being shown contains superfluous information and messages which have no connection with the subject being taught.

In the second case the traditional didactic approach prevails and the medium performs and plays a complementary role in the educational process. The lesson can

become more interesting and the teaching objectives be more easily achieved. The teacher must have the time and special skills in order to edit the images, whilst the possibility of structuring the knowledge anticipated by the use of the audiovisual medium is lost to a great extent. Lastly, the application of the third approach in the educational process is virtually identical with that of images in school textbooks or those which accompany a text. The only difference is that if the pupil is familiar with the visual object of the image chosen, the medium may be more attractive and it may be easier to understand its content.

The rapid developments in the audiovisual technology sector have increased the frequency of the use of images in the practice of teaching and have enriched the form and the means by which these are shown. Apart from the radio, in most audiovisual media the emphasis is still on images, which, however, have ceased to be the only factor providing stimulation. This is happening because in complex media images are accompanied by sound. The sound, which replaces the spoken word, creates auditory stimuli, which, in conjunction with the visual stimuli, provide better results. In this case the images shown are no longer static but are animated.

One example of an audiovisual medium where animated images prevail is the cinema. In theory, the chance to use it in the educational process could act as a catalyst. Cuban (1986) said that Edison, as early as 1922, had spoken prophetically about the cinema, maintaining that it was expected to bring about “a revolution in the education system, since within a few years it would replace books”. This, however, never occurred. Apparent reasons for this are the shortage of facilities in schools, the lack of expertise on the part of the teachers as well as the inability to change the traditional culture in education, whereby an audiovisual medium comes in order to support the existing educational process and not in order to overthrow it (Koronaiou, 2001).

However, we should point out that successful teaching experiments have been carried out using cinematographic films, which emphasise the role of cinematographic images. Indicative of this trend is the use of the film “The Prestige” in the teaching of Physics, Art and the Principles of the Economy (Kabouropoulou, Fokiali & Hadzigeorgiou, 2011; Hatdzigeorgiou, Fokiali, & Kabouropoulou, 2012). According to the authors, the contribution of cinematographic images aided the understanding of natural phenomena (electricity in particular), economic phenomena (competition, oligopoly), the development of the imagination and the forming of positive attitudes towards art. At the same time, it gave rise to the development of dialogue, reasoning and critical thought. On the whole, however, the use of cinematographic films in the classroom is very limited. Vrasidas, Zembylas & Petrou (2005), referring to the research results concerning the opinions of nursery school teachers about the use of the cinema in school, support the limited use of this medium.

Regarding televisual images, their use in education is also limited. Teachers maintain a rather negative attitude towards them, even if there are have been recent results (Linebarger, 2011), which are positive, especially with respect to their contribution towards the understanding of concepts and phenomena. Buckingham (1990), referring to the importance of animated images, maintains that children come to school already having a knowledge of these media, which, however, they have acquired outside of school. According to this opinion, the teacher can help the children to build up new data and information on top of the existing knowledge more easily than if they were starting from an initial baseline. This helps in deepening and understanding each subject better.

Finally, animated images, in spite of the criticism occasionally made of their role, will have to be reviewed from two perspectives: The first concerns the possibility which they provide of bridging the link between the knowledge acquired at home and that at school, using the former in support of the latter. The second concerns the opportunity within schools which is now available to both the teacher and the pupils in a class to produce animated images by using simple applications.

In lieu of an epilogue

The images which are shown via educational textbooks require a thorough and in-depth empirical investigation. There are authors who contend that those book editions which do not contain any illustrations are incomplete. Because, as they maintain, illustrations, apart from their decorative and aesthetic nature, work in addition to the information and the meanings contained within a text. Of course, the interpretation of an image depends on several factors, which are directly related to each individual's level of knowledge, culture, experiences and know-how. Every reader interprets and deciphers what he sees in his own way, very often giving other interpretations apart from the ones intended by the author or the illustrator of the book.

The images which are shown via the new technological media and which are used in the pupils' tuition are highly realistic, graphic and diverse. The class teacher can choose and show to his pupils, depending on the circumstances, the appropriate visual material required for him to teach his lesson. This material can sometimes be derived from static and sometimes from animated images. It can, in other words, involve the simple presentation of an image with the students being asked to comment on and interpret the information it portrays. It can, however, involve the presentation of a video or the showing of extracts from a film or a documentary. The above activities are the responsibility of each teacher. He, having considered and assessed the expected outcome, decides which of these activities to choose each time.

Bibliography

[1] Arnheim, R. (2005). *Art and visual perception. The psychology of the creative vision*. Athens: Themelio.
[2] Buckingham, D. (1990). Making it explicit: towards a theory of media learning. In: D. Buckingham (Eds.) *Watching Media Learning: Making Sense of Media Education.* London: Falmer Press.
[3] Christodoulou, D., Spiliotopoulou, B. & Karatrantou, A. (2005). The Illustration of Schoolbooks for the Internet and the Pedagogical Relationship with the Pupils. In: A. Tzimoyiannis (Eds.) *Proceedings of the 3rd Panhellenic Conference "Computer Science Education".* Corinth: 7-9/10.
[4] Cuban, L. (1986). *Teachers and machines. The classroom use of technology since 1920.* New York: Teachers College Press.
[5] Demetriadou, K. (2007). The Image as a context for language teaching. The case of the textbooks for the "The Programme for the Education of Muslim Children" In: K. Dinas & A. Hatzipanayiotidi (Eds.) *The Greek language as a second/foreign language. Research, Teaching, Learning.* Thessaloniki: University Studio Press.
[6] Hadzigeorgiou, Y., Fokiali, P. & Kampouropoulou, M. (2012). Thinking about Creativity in Science Education. *Creative Education,* 3 (5), 603-611.
[7] Kampouropoulou, M., Fokiali, P. & Hadzigeorgiou, Y. (2011). Using a feature film to integrate art, science and economics. In: A. Karpati & E. Gaul (Eds.) *Proceedings of the 33InSEA World Congress: Art, Space, Education*. Budapest: 26/6-1st/7.
[8] Kantartzi, E. (2002). *Historical Background of the Illustration of Children's and School Books*. Thessaloniki: Kyriakidis Brothers Publishing House S.A.
[9] Koronaiou, A. (2001). *Educating outside of school. The contribution of audiovisual media and of the new technologies.* Athens: Metaichmio.
[10] Kress, G. & Leeuwen, T. (2010). *The reading of images. The grammar of visual design.* Athens: Epikentro.
[11] Linebarger, D. L. (2011). Teaching with Television: New Evidence Supports an Old Medium. *Phi Delta Kappan*, 93 (3), 62-65.
[12] Marantz, S. & Marantz, K. (1988). *The Art of Children's Picture Books*. New York, London: Garlan.
[13] Mastrothanasis, K. & Kaplani, P. (2006). Humour in illustrated books. *Virtual School, The science of Education Online, 3(3).* Available in: http://www.auth.gr/virtualschool/3.3/Praxis/MastrothanassisKaplaniHumor.
[14] *Palikidis, A. (2009).The role of images in school History textbooks in Secondary Education (1950-2002). Didactic, ideological and aesthetic function of images.* Thessaloniki: Kyriakidis Brothers Publishing House S.A.

[15] Syriou, I., Katsantoni, S. & Loukeri, P. I. (2015). Criteria for the quality assessment of schoolbooks. *Review of Educational-Scientific Affairs*, 7, 130-145.
[16] Taratori-Tsalkatidou, E. (2005). *Primary School Lesson Planning.* Thessaloniki: Kyriakidis Brothers Publishing House S.A.
[17] Vrasidas, C., Zembylas, M. & Petrou, A. (2005). Contemporary pedagogical models and the role of educational technology. In: S. Retalis (Eds.) *Advanced Internet Technologies in the Service of Learning*. Athens: Kastaniotis.

ISSN 2411-9598 (Print)
ISSN 2411-4103 (Online)
European Journal of
Language and Literature Studies
July - December 2022
Volume 8, Issue 2

Bernhard Schlink's the Reader, the Trauma of Second-Generation Germans

Gamze Sabancı Uzun

Assistant Professor at İstanbul Aydin University

Abstract

Bernhard Schlink's novel *The Reader* (1995) has been a very controversial book since its publication. Not only it portrays a sexual relationship between a 15-year-old Michael and 36-year-old Hanna without any judgment on the part of the author as the voice of the society, but it also leaves a space for the reader to sympathize with a Nazi criminal. The analyses presented in this article will take the cue from the current discussion of *The Reader* as a Holocaust novel. Thus, it will be argued that Michael's victimization by Hanna is similar to her treatment of the Jews in the camp. The examination of the novel commences with the analysis of his relationship with Hanna, which is the focus of the first part of the novel, revealing that silence is the key element of their oedipal mother–son relationship, which they use as a strategy for safeguarding their bond. This will be followed by the analysis of Michael's silence during Hanna's trial, the findings of which indicate that, as an adult, Michael is keen to put his traumatic past behind him and thus distances himself from language by remaining silent about his experiences. Henceforth, his actions resemble the Jewish survivors' refusal to discuss what happened to them in the camps. Therefore, "silence" emerges as an overarching theme in the novel and will be the key term in this article that links Jewish victims with the German perpetrators, as well as their descendants. In closing, it will be posited that *The Reader* can be viewed as a Holocaust novel, not due to its treatment of the Holocaust through Michael's solidarity with an ex-perpetrator, but because of his genuine empathy with and understanding of the nameless Jewish survivor that is revealed at the end of the novel.

Keywords: Holocaust, Trauma, Nazi, Abuse, Silence

Introduction

Bernhard Schlink's novel *The Reader* (1995) has been a very controversial book since its publication. Not only it portrays a sexual relationship between a 15-year-old Michael and 36-year-old Hanna without any judgment on the part of the author

as the voice of the society, but it also leaves a space for the reader to sympathize with a Nazi criminal. In the second half of the novel, dedicated to Hanna's trial for the crimes committed as an Auschwitz guard, her horrific acts are seemingly justified by her illiteracy, which rendered her unaware of her assigned responsibilities. Some critics, like Cynthia Ozick take this attempt at justification of Holocaust as an insult to the Jewish victims and in her article "The Rights of History and the Rights of Imagination" published in the Commentary Magazine she asks a very pivotal question, "Have we ever before, in or out of fiction, been asked to pity a direct accomplice to Nazi murder?" Ozick satirically adds, "Had she been able to read, she would have been a factory worker, not an agent of murder. Her crimes are illiteracy's accident. Illiteracy is her exculpation". By ironically using illiteracy as an excuse for the murder of nearly 7 million Jews, Ozick explicitly avoids any form of apologia and tales of German suffering within the Holocaust period. Yet, there are others that do not see Hanna as a murderer only, claiming that she is also a victim, who was presented with a "choiceless choice."[1] Kim Worthington's essay is based on a similar approach, where the author applies Derridanian reading of true forgiveness. In the article, Worthington presents Hanna "as a victim of circumstances rather than an agent of horror" (204). Similarly, Jeffrey I. Roth posits that the author "creates a character that would elicit our pity" (171) whereas Ursula Mahlendorf notes that Bernard Schlink "encourages the reader to ask about the price the seduced pays for his seduction" (459). Since the majority of the criticism Hanna is subjected to focuses on the causes of her actions rather than their consequences, one wonders whether this is the difference between the Jewish and the German perspective of the Holocaust, whereby the former focuses on its aftermath, and the latter on its source. When discussing Nazi novels, in *Holocaust as Fiction: Bernhard Schlink's "Nazi" Novels and Their Films* William Collins Donahue explains that, in the novels in which the Holocaust is approached through the prism of German perspective, the aim is not to deny the history, as the authors are merely "retiring, rewriting, or simply thumb indexing the Holocaust" (2). Yet, Donahue also notes that "affirmation of guilt and responsibility … lead not to a more differentiated consideration of the genocide but precisely away from it" (2). Thereupon lies the distinction between German and Jewish acts of remembering the Holocaust, as—according to Barbie Zelizer—the latter remember in order to live with it, while the former are trying "to forget" (35). This is what Bill Naven and Paul Cooke coin as the policy of post-unification, where the general motto is to normalize the conflicted past by simply moving forward.

As noted above, majority of the critics examine the novel with respect to its presentation of the Holocaust. Although Bernhard Schlink has always maintained that his novel is not about the Holocaust, it is both criticized and praised for its

[1] The term is coined by Lawrence Langer in *Versions of Survival: The Holocaust and the Human Spirit* (1982), explaining the unusual situations of dilemma Jews experienced in the camps, such as having to kill a relative to avoid being killed.

minor treatment of it. The analyses presented in this article will take the cue from the current discussion of *The Reader* as a Holocaust novel, noting that it is Michael Berg's remembrance of his childhood sexual abuse by Hanna Schmitz. Thus, it will be argued that Michael's victimization by Hanna is similar to her treatment of the Jews in the camp. The examination of the novel commences with the analysis of his relationship with Hanna, which is the focus of the first part of the novel, revealing that silence is the key element of their oedipal mother–son relationship, which they use as a strategy for safeguarding their bond. This will be followed by the analysis of Michael's silence during Hanna's trial, the findings of which indicate that, as an adult, Michael is keen to put his traumatic past behind him and thus distances himself from language by remaining silent about his experiences. Henceforth, his actions resemble the Jewish survivors' refusal to discuss what happened to them in the camps. Therefore, "silence" emerges as an overarching theme in the novel and will be the key term in this article that links Jewish victims with the German perpetrators, as well as their descendants. In closing, it will be posited that *The Reader* can be viewed as a Holocaust novel, not due to its treatment of the Holocaust through Michael's solidarity with an ex-perpetrator, but because of his genuine empathy with and understanding of the nameless Jewish survivor that is revealed at the end of the novel.

The Reader is divided into three parts, the first of which focuses on Michael and Hanna's sexual relationship. It begins with Michael vomiting on the street[1] and being assisted by 36-year-old Hanna, who takes him to her house to wash and recover. Following their initial encounter on the street, Michael starts fantasizing about Hanna, waking up "every day feeling guilty" (18). As his fantasies only perpetuate his infatuation, Michael eventually finds the courage to visit Hanna. She acts rather unperturbed by his arrival and asks him to fill the scuttles with coke in the cellar and bring them up to the apartment. When Michael returns completely covered in dust, with a motherly concern, Hanna "slapped her hand on the table. 'Look at you kid […] You can't go home like that. I'll run you a bath and beat the dust out of your clothes'" (24). Michael obliges and starts washing himself. Shortly after, Hanna returns with a towel. Michael recalls the experience, "From behind, she wrapped me in the towel from head to foot and rubbed me dry" (25), akin to a mother drying her baby. Yet, what the reader immediately witnesses is a metaphorical master–slave relationship consisting of a domineering sexual intercourse:

[1] One can also read this vomiting scene in the light of Kristeva's abject theory, suggesting that it signals the process of becoming by excluding the excess that is not a part of him. 'I expel *myself*, I spit *myself* out, I abject *myself* within the same motion through which "I" claim to establish *myself*" (Powers of Horror, 3). By vomiting, Michael excludes any motherly attachment—Kristeva would see this as the vomiting of the breast milk.

"Take your clothes off carefully…"

…

"Come!" I turned my back as I stood up and climbed out of the tub. From behind, she wrapped me in the towel from head to foot and rubbed me dry. Then she let the towel fall to the floor. I didn't dare move. She came so close to me that I could feel her breasts against my back and her stomach against my behind. She was naked too.

…

I was afraid: of touching, of kissing, afraid I wouldn't please her or satisfy her… I explored her body with my hands and mouth, our mouths met, and then she was on top of me, looking into my eyes until I came and closed my eyes tight and tried to control myself and then screamed so loud that she had to cover my mouth with her hand to smother the sound. (25–26)

Although, at the beginning, the scene is indicative of motherly care, it develops into a coercive relationship between a woman and a child. Indeed, the child is so submissive and innocent that he succumbs to sexual abuse by a mature woman whose intentions are unknown to both Michael and to the reader. His victimization is not apparent to him, because it is not reflected back at him by anyone, since nobody knows about his relationship with Hanna. As he remains silent about it, it prompts the reader to wonder if he is choosing not to speak about their relationship in order to safeguard it.

According to Ernestine Schlant, there are two kinds of silence, whereby one signifies too much knowledge, while the other implies repression of guilt and memory:

One might be tempted to identify "too much knowledge" with the silence of the victims and the "refusal to become aware" with the silence of the perpetrators, but such an identification ignores the undoubted fact that the perpetrators kept silence because they had "too much knowledge" and that many victims, in an effort to survive after they survived the Holocaust, took refuge in a "refusal to become aware" of the atrocities to which they had been subjected. (7)

Schlant implements the idea that silence has two distinct functions that are employed by perpetrators and the victims. According to the author, the perpetrators are silent because they know too much about the atrocities they committed, whereas the victims resort to silence in order to forget about the atrocities they were subjected to. In light of this interpretation, Michael's silence during his relationship with Hanna is akin to the silence of camp victims. They refuse to speak about their horrific experiences, not to safeguard them from the others, but from themselves. Similarly, Michael refuses to reason or rationalize his sexual affair with an adult, which he at some level must perceive as inappropriate. Yet, an alternative interpretation about Michael's silence is also possible. According to Lacan, there are three stages in the individual's psychosexual development. He calls the first stage

Real, which pertains to the neo-natal period that ends once the infant starts acquiring language. It is followed by the Imaginary order that corresponds to the Mirror stage, during which the child starts recognizing the separation between his/her body and the world, and thus his/her mother. The process culminates with the Symbolic stage, whereby the child becomes aware of his/her uniqueness and starts expressing opinions through language. This stage is considered the period when the child learns to accept the norms and dictates of the society, and shapes and limits his/her desires accordingly. Therefore, silence can be seen as a rejection of language, refusing to be separated from the (m)other through the use of language.

A closer inspection of Michael's relationship with Hanna from a mother–son connection perspective makes his silence more comprehensible. The son who desires to achieve completeness with the mother can only do it in the Real stage, at the time when language does not yet exist. Therefore, by remaining silent in and about their relationship, Michael rejects the Lacanian Symbolic order, the rules and norms of society, in order to remain in the secluded world of the Real with the (m)other.

The rituals of their sexual contact in the context of the mother–son, master–slave relationship can also be seen as the alternative order of their secluded world. Every time they are in Hanna's "windowless apartment," their contact starts with Michael being bathed by Hanna like a baby, only to be taken to her bed for the intercourse, which ends with Hanna demanding that Michael reads the German classics to her. The first and the last steps present a contrasting image of Hanna, who is the creator of this plotline, first as a powerful mother, only to be transformed to a helpless infant. In parallel, Michael who experiences Hanna as his pre-oedipal phallic mother, his object of desire, finds himself first as Hanna's toy, then her master. Henceforth, his silence can also be seen as a result of his suspension between the pre-oedipal mother and the oedipal mother figure. She is simultaneously castrating Michael during their domineering sexual affair, and feels her castration more strongly when she forces Michael to read to her because she does not want to admit that she is illiterate.

Hanna, as the mother-lover, simultaneously castrating and castrated, slowly starts consuming Michael's life by encouraging him to be submissive and withdrawn. Whenever they have a fight, which resembles a fight between lovers, Michael "instantly and unconditionally surrendered… [He] took all the blame… admitted mistakes [he] hadn't made… Whenever she turned cold and hard, I begged her to be good to me again, to forgive me and love me" (49). The more time they spend together, the greater Michael's passive victimization becomes. During their four-day bike trip, Hanna no longer acts as a caring mother/lover, but a violent abuser, as seen in the scene in which Hanna hits Michael on the face with a belt, because she could not see him in the room when she woke up. Clearly, her fury is not aimed at Michael per se, but rather at what he represents. A working-class illiterate woman,

when faced with an upper-class educated boy, starts fully appreciating her impotence. She acts as a typical Freudian castrated women, enraged by her inferiority, channeling her revenge toward the most suitable target.

In his article "The Aetiology to Hysteria", Freud declares that adult violence in an ill-matched relationship is a substitution of impotence:

People who have no hesitation in satisfying their sexual desires upon children cannot be expected to jib at finer shades in the methods of obtaining the satisfaction; and the sexual impotence, which is inherent in children inevitably forces them into the same substitutive actions as those to which adults descend if they become impotent. All the singular conditions under which the ill-matched pair conduct their love-relations—on the one hand the adult, who cannot escape his share in the mutual dependence necessarily entailed by a sexual relationship, and who is yet armed with complete authority and the right to punish, and can exchange the one role for the other to the uninhibited satisfaction of his moods, and on the other hand the child, who in his helplessness is at the mercy of this arbitrary will, who is prematurely aroused to every kind of sensibility and exposed to every sort of disappointment, and whose performance of the sexual activities assigned to him is often interrupted by his imperfect control of his natural needs—all these grotesque and yet tragic incongruities reveal themselves as stamped upon the later development of the individual. (108)

The relationship between an infantile and an adult can be viewed as a power exchange, where the adult, who feels impotent in the outside world, creates an alternative world, which promises the authority and power he/she is lacking (yet craving) in the real world. In order to escape from the feeling of insubstantiality, the adult establishes a relationship where he/she has the full authority and right to punish, as the sense of being punished evokes the experiences of life outside.

In Hanna's case, her illiteracy is the greatest punishment she has had to face through her entire life because, as a woman who lacks the ability to read, she was obliged to move from one place to another like a shadow, always remaining on the margins. Being invisible seems to be her mission in life, as she goes to work at dawn, comes to a windowless home in the morning, making sure not to interact with her neighbors, none of whom knows who she is. Thus, as long as she lives in a shadow, she is in need of someone who is much more powerless and defenseless than she is. The micro world that she creates with Michael within the confines of her windowless apartment is a substitute for the outside world, where she hardly exists. Her existence does not extend beyond the darkness of her room, and she is in need of another to resolve her existential crisis.

The first part of the novel finishes when the tender mother–son relationship transforms into a domineering master–slave relationship, which urges Michael to look for comfort elsewhere, seeking company of his peers. When Hanna realizes his

temptation to forge a life in the real world without her, sensing that their micro world is no longer enough, she leaves the city and thus Michael. Her departure evokes a sense of guilt in him, as he sees it as a direct consequence of his betrayal. This separation can also be interpreted as the breaking of the bond between the mother and the son as the first step of subjectivity, which is also the primal repression.

The second part of the novel commences with Michael as a law student. As a part of his studies, he observes the trial of six female Auschwitz guards—one of whom is Hanna—charged with war crimes with potential sentence of life imprisonment. He is no longer the naïve submissive child, wearing a posture of superiority so as not to "let [himself] be humiliated after Hanna, never to take guilt upon [himself] or feel guilty, never again to love anyone whom it would hurt to lose" (88). Michael's emotional distress stems from losing Hanna, as well as his present acknowledgement of his past humiliation. Yet, he is still incapable of seeing himself as a victim of sexual abuse. Schlink's maneuver towards drawing attention to Michael's victimization starts with the account of the atrocities Hanna committed during the war.

As a law student, attending the trial of Holocaust ex-perpetrators, Michael easily recognizes his responsibility towards the victims of the Nazis.

Exploration! Exploring the past! We students in the seminar considered ourselves radical explorers. We tore open the windows and let the air in, the wind that finally whirled away the dust that society had permitted to settle over the horrors of the past. We made sure people could breathe and see. (91)

He, as the explorer, assigns himself the task of breaking the silence of his parents about the Holocaust, so they can see and breathe, hoping that they will find the way to live again. Schlink's dust metaphor is a very apt representation of the German wartime generation remaining silent because they know too much. Such description has been previously associated with perpetrators by Ernestine Schlant, who is of view that those that remain silent about the Holocaust atrocities can be equated to the Nazi perpetrators. However, being aware of the silence as a way a hiding the reality, the second-generation Germans find themselves in a similar situation. They are as silent as their parents:

What should our second generation have done, what should it do with the knowledge of the horrors of the extermination of the Jews? … instead of accepting them as something in the face of which we can only fall silent in revulsion, shame, and guilt? To what purpose? ... that some few would be convicted and punished while we of the second generation were silenced by revulsion, shame, and guilt—was that all there was to it now?

In the Holocaust literature, the term "second generation" pertains to the descendants of Jewish victims and survivors. Yet, this term can also have the

connotation of "secondary"—those that have to come to terms with living under the shadow of their survivor parents. However, in recent studies, this term is increasingly being applied to the cohorts of children of the bystanders or perpetrators of the Holocaust. The 1945–1960 period was marked by German silence on the WWII atrocities. In the early 1960s, the second-generation Germans finally broke their silence about the crimes their parents committed. As explained by Harold Marcuse, the children of the perpetrators and the subsequent generation "felt that they had somehow been victimized by the silence of their 1943er parents, and they were determined to teach about it themselves."[1] This German tendency of coming to terms with their Nazi past, which lasted into the 1980s, was not aimed at apologia, but rather at victimization. Instead of asking for forgiveness for the mass murder their ancestors committed, they presented themselves as the victims of the Nazism. In 1985, when Ronald Reagan gave a speech marking the fortieth anniversary of the war's ending, he pointed out that SS soldiers were "victims of Nazism also… They were victims, just surely as the victims in the concentration camps," since the bombings killed around 600,000 civilians, millions were left homeless, thousands of German women were raped by Red Army soldiers. With an emphasis on their loss, German literati created rhetoric of victimization, rather than aptly ascribing responsibility for the loss lives. Schlink emphasizes such rhetoric of victimization through the court case that is in the focus of the novel's second part, prompting the reader to ponder on who the real victim is. In the way he depicts Hanna, Schlink presents a twofold victimization, as she was victimized by the Nazis, and later on by the other female defendants. When the judge asked her if she was sending the prisoners to death because she wanted to make room for the newcomers, Hanna's reply was enlightening for the audience, yet their silence persists:

" I … I mean … so what would you have done?" Hanna meant it as a serious question. She did not know what she should or could have done differently, and therefore wanted to hear from the judge, who seemed to know everything, what he would have done (47).

The judge's failure to respond appears to signal indulgence of Hanna's crime, acceptance of the harshness of the environment Hanna belongs to, one that did not

[1] Harold Marcuse delineates the Nazi generation into six categories. The first category is the group who were born between 1903 and 1915, described as **1933ers**, who experienced the Weimar Republic and the transition to Hitler's government and saw Nazism as a positive turning point. They were the generation of the perpetrators. The second group is called **1943ers**, born in the 1916–1925 period, who grew up under Nazism and fought for it during WWII. Following this group is the group of **1948ers**, born at the end of Nazism and referred to as reconstructing generation. According to this nomenclature, **1968ers** are the first postwar generation born between 1937 and 1953, the children of the 1943ers. Similarly, **1979ers** are the children on 1948ers, the second postwar generation, who grew up under historical information of the Nazi government. Finally, **1989ers** are the children of 1968ers; as neither they nor their parents had any contact with the Holocaust, they learned of the Nazi past through media. They are the third postwar cohort.

provide any other possibility but to let the Jews die. Hanna's implied victimization stems from the absence of choice, which Lawrence Langer described as "choiceless choice," albeit in reference to the Jews. Yet, the unavoidable response still exists, for she had the choice when she was offered the job as a camp guard.

In *Mothers in the Fatherland*, Claudia Koonz explains that "Germans, whether or not they were Jewish, did not comprehend that Hitler really meant what he said in *Mein Kampf*. It seemed too insane. True, Nazi propaganda was laden with portentous metaphors, but few translated those images into concrete threats" (347). Madeline Kent also emphasizes the difficulties in perceiving Nazi's intention as "Their vocabulary was oiled with euphemisms which served a treble purpose: They deceived the simple-minded at home and abroad, added insult to the injuries of the persecuted, and pleased… the slave mind of the masses" (216). As Koonz summarizes "Deception, diversion, and euphemism shrouded Hitler's true intent" (347). Nazi ideology presented the camps "as a legitimate, necessary institution, in which aliens of the community would have to be re-educated" (Gellately 184). Therefore, "for a long while the dominant opinion was that it was quite proper that 'enemies of state' be confined in a concentration camp" (Gellately 53). Moreover, Hitler's propaganda that the Jews were responsible for losing World War I and that they were the enemies within allowed the civilians to repudiate the reality behind the Holocaust especially, in the wake of a new threat after Britain's and France's declaration of war on Germany in 1939.

Even though voluminous studies have addressed the killings and the terror of the concentration camps, a few authors have scrutinized the cultural foundation of these institutions. For example, it would be important to elucidate what led civilians to choose a career as concentration camp guards. Anna Pawelczynska claims,

Acceptance of a job in Auschwitz (w)as especially alluring because it satisfied a need for daily experiencing one's own dominance and strength, the right to decide life and death, the right to dispense death personally and at random and the right to abuse one's power over the prisoners, even in relation to the limits prescribed by regulation and camp custom … (19)

According to Pawelczynska, besides seeing it as a career occupation, being a camp guard was alluring as it entailed practice of omnipotent power. It provided an opportunity to acquire a prosperous life under the shelter of the divine Third Reich. Without oversimplifying, the majority of the employees were selected among the uneducated section of the lower class thirsty for self-enrichment, who would succumb to Nazi training of moral depravation. People like Hanna—alone, in need of income and social status—would not have questioned the responsibilities of the job due to their own fear of authority and sense of inferiority. Hanna simply stated, "SS was recruiting women as Siemens and other factories for guard duties and she had applied and was hired" (96). At the beginning, it was only a job she had applied for

and was given, yet once inside, she was captivated and eventually paralyzed by the power assigned to her. As Michael also reveals:

[…] behavior becomes completely selfish and indifferent to others, and gassing and burning are everyday occurrences. In the rare accounts by perpetrators, too, the gas chambers and ovens become ordinary scenery, the perpetrators reduced to their few functions and exhibiting a mental paralysis and indifference, a dullness that makes them seem drugged or drunk. (42)

Although the novel is at the risk of exculpation, as Richard Wiesberg notes "Hanna never loses her quality as victimizer" (231) for what she caused to Michael after she sexually abused him. The trial has two significant consequences for Michael. First, the distance between him and the Nazi past is shattered because of Hanna's stance at the trial. Comparing his family to other parents who had direct roles in the Nazi regime, he feels distance from such cooperation, since his father "had got himself and us through the war as an editor for a house that published hiking maps and books" (37). Therefore, his involvement in the trial is mainly "out of sheer curiosity" about the events he "read and heard about" (37). Even though the Holocaust is a national responsibility, as he does not have any personal involvement because he "had no one to point at. Certainly not [his] parents, because [he] had nothing to accuse them of," he implicitly remains an outsider. He is therefore the third person in the history, observing from distance, until he sees Hanna at the courtroom accused for participating in the selections as a camp guard. Henceforth, for Michael, the murderous Nazi regime is no longer political, but very personal. Furthermore, when it dawns on Michael that Hanna is illiterate, as she contradicts herself by denying some of the charges, yet easily acknowledges the most evil acts and refuses to give a sample of handwriting, he keeps his silence. In line with Ursula R. Mahlendorf's argument that the silence of the Germans about the Holocaust "becomes collusion with the perpetrators" (464), Michael's silence about Hanna can be considered as his alliance with an ex-perpetrator, which he strongly rejects at the beginning of the trial. His view of himself as a "radical explorer" who "tore open the windows and let air in" to "whirl away the dust that society had permitted to settle over the horrors of the past" so that "people could breathe and see" (91) has also been shuttered. One may surmise that, by simply keeping silent about Hanna's illiteracy, which could be an implied justification for her crime, Michael let Hanna be punished. Alternatively, as Jeffrey Roth claims "by not helping her, he has repeated the conduct of some ordinary German during the Nazi era. Like them he stood idly by while someone he could have helped suffered injustice" (168). Yet, it should be noted that it is Hanna's choice to keep her illiteracy secret, which she does because she is ashamed of it. Thus, Michael's silence is also a sign of his desire to honor Hanna's wish. The second effect of the trial is that it evinces Michael's trauma. While trying to solve the trauma of his nation, Michael de facto discovers his personal trauma, finally coming to terms with the fact that he was sexually abused by an elder.

For the reader, following Hanna's sentence at the end of the trial, it is poignant to learn that Michael left the house, "brushed off the few acquaintances" and rented a small room all by himself. In so doing, he refuses to deal with his traumatization, for he restages it. His loneliness is reminiscent of his childhood loneliness, and the small room he rented is akin to that he shared with Hanna. He refuses anything that is not a reminder of Hanna and the time they spent together. His marriage is an example of his rejection. Gertrud, his wife, "was wrong, that she moved wrong and felt wrong, smelled wrong and tasted wrong" (77). She is wrong simply because she is not Hanna. Inevitably, they get divorced and Michael's subsequent relationships remain under the shadow of Hanna's memories.

The final scene of the novel presents the similarity between Michael's relationship with Hanna and her bond with a Jewish girl in the camp, who also used to read to her. The two children Hanna used as her readers share the same past. The victimization of the second generation of Germans is akin to that of the Jews, in a sense that they are victimized by silence. As a conclusion, it can be suggested that the post-unification German literature not only unites the two sides of the nation in the culpability for the Holocaust, but also aims to create a community of the Jews and Germans with victimization by the previous generations as the common denominator. In other words, both Jews and the Germans can be considered as the victims of the same silence.

References

[1] Bernhard Schlink's 'Der Vorleser' and the Problem of Shame." *The Modern Language Review*, vol. 98, no. 2, 2003, pp. 381–396. *JSTOR*, JSTOR, www.jstor.org/stable/3737818.

[2] Cooke, Paul. *German Culture, Politics, and Literature into the Twenty-First Century: Beyond Normalization.* Rochester, NY: Camden House, 2006.

[3] Freud, Sigmund. "The Aetiology to Hysteria",1896.

[4] Gellately, Robert. *Backing Hitler: Consent and Coercion in Nazi Germany*. Oxford University Press, 2001.

[5] Kent, Madeline. *I Married a German*. London: Allen and Unwin, 1939.

[6] Koonz, Claudia. *Mothers in the Fatherland: Women, the Family, and Nazi Politics.* St. Martin's Press, 1987.

[7] Langer, Lawrence. *Versions of Survival: The Holocaust and the Human Spirit.* State Univ of New York Pr; 1982.

[8] MacKinnon, John E. "Law and Tenderness in Bernhard Schlink's *The Reader*." *Law and Literature*, vol. 16, no. 2, 2004, pp. 179–201. *JSTOR*, JSTOR, www.jstor.org/stable/10.1525/lal.2004.16.2.179.

[9] Mahlendorf, Ursula R. "Trauma Narrated, Read and (Mis)Understood: Bernhard Schlink's 'The Reader': "... Irrevocably Complicit in Their Crimes ..."." *Monatshefte*, vol. 95, no. 3, 2003, pp. 458–481. *JSTOR*, JSTOR, www.jstor.org/stable/30161685.

[10] Marcuse, Harold. "Generational Cohorts and the Shaping of Popular Attitudes Towards the Holocaust" in *Remembering fort he Future: The Holocaust in the Age of Genocide*. Ed. By John K. Roth et al. Palgrave, 2001.
[11] Metz, Joseph. "'Truth Is a Woman': Post-Holocaust Narrative, Postmodernism, and the Gender of Fascism in Bernhard Schlink's 'Der Vorleser.'" *The German Quarterly*, vol. 77, no. 3, 2004, pp. 300–323. *JSTOR*, JSTOR, www.jstor.org/stable/3252259.
[12] Niven, Bill. "Bernhard Schlink and the Legacies of 1968." *Colloquia Germanica*, vol. 48, no. 1/2, 2015, pp. 35–42. *JSTOR*, JSTOR, www.jstor.org/stable/44478222.
[13] Ozick, Cythia. "The Rights of History and the Rights of Imagination". *Commentary Magazine.* March 1, 1999.
[14] Pawelczynska, Anna. *Values and Violence in Auschwitz: A Sociological Analysis*, trans. Catherine S. Leach. University of California Press, 1979.
[15] Revesz, Eva B. "Introduction: Bernhard Schlink's 'The Reader' and the Problem of German Victimhood." *Colloquia Germanica*, vol. 48, no. 1/2, 2015, pp. 3–12. *JSTOR*, JSTOR, www.jstor.org/stable/44478219.
[16] Roth, Jeffrey I. "Reading and Misreading *The Reader*." *Law and Literature*, vol. 16, no. 2, 2004, pp. 163–177. *JSTOR*, JSTOR, www.jstor.org/stable/10.1525/lal.2004.16.2.163.
[17] Schlant, Ernestine. *The Language of Silence: West German Literature and the Holocaust*. Routledge, 1999.
[18] Schlink, Bernhard. *The Reader*. Vintage, 1997.
[19] Weisberg, Richard H. "A Sympathy That Does Not Condone: Notes in Summation on Schlink's *The Reader*." *Law and Literature*, vol. 16, no. 2, 2004, pp. 229–235. *JSTOR*, JSTOR, www.jstor.org/stable/10.1525/lal.2004.16.2.229.
[20] Worthington, Kim L.; Suturing the Wound: Derrida's "on Forgiveness" And Schlink's *The Reader*. *Comparative Literature* 1 June 2011; 63 (2): 203–224. doi: https://doi.org/10.1215/00104124-1265484.
[21] Zelizer, Barbie. *Remembering to Forget: Holocaust Memory through the Camera's Eye*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 2004.

The Effect of Perceived Interest and Prior Knowledge on L2 Reading Comprehension via Several Assessment Methods in a Higher Education Context

Ana Cristina Lahuerta Martínez

PhD University of Oviedo

Abstract

The aim of the present study is to examine the effect of perceived interest and prior knowledge on EFL reading comprehension. Participants were 227 undergraduates with advanced competence in English. With respect to the method, participants had to read a 450-word text entitled Wales. After that, they had to complete a Perceived Interest Questionnaire (PIQ), which consisted of 9 items and two assessment tasks: a written recall and a multiple choice task. The results of our study show the significant effect of perceived interest and prior knowledge on L2 reading comprehension. Thus, comprehension assessed via written recall and multiple choice questions had higher scores when readers read texts related to their interests. Besides, prior knowledge had a positive effect on the reader's comprehension irrespective of the assessment method used. This study concludes that different assessment tasks may be crucial factors that affect the relationship between factors like interest and prior knowledge, and L2 reading comprehension.

Keywords: interest, prior knowledge, L2 reading, written recall, multiple choice.

1. Introduction

Reading elements like motivation, interest and background knowledge are considered by some reading experts like Bernhardt (2000, 2005, 2011) significant components that seem to contribute the most to second-language reading performance. With respect to reading, recent research on the predictors of successful reading comprehension in a second language (L2) has been focused on motivational factors (e.g., Koda, 2007; Nassaji, 2002, 2003; Xu and Durgunoğlu, 2019).

Bernhardt's (2005, 2011) sees reading as an interactive process involving the combination and integration of various sources of knowledge and devises an L2 reading model that could capture this interactive nature. This is a three-dimensional model that includes three knowledge sources: L1 literacy knowledge, L2 language

knowledge, and unexplained variance that incorporates dimensions yet to be explained such as interest, motivation, etc. In this model, based on Stanovich's (1980) model, knowledge sources assist for other sources that are deficient or non-existent. It reflects a compensatory processing that tries to model how knowledge sources help or substitute other inadequate or nonexisting sources, that is, what they use to compensate for such deficiencies.

The present study examines interest and background knowledge as variables involved in this L2 reading process. It intends to contribute to this research topic exploring the relationship between interest, background knowledge and L2 reading comprehension via different assessment tasks in a higher education context and focussing on students at an advanced level of English language competence.

2. Review of the literature

In the last few years several studies have approached the relationship between interest, prior knowledge and comprehension. Results of the interest-prior knowledge studies that have been conducted in L2 reading show however little concordance. Some authors did not find a relationship between topic interest and/or L2 readers' knowledge of the topic (e.g. Carrell and Wise 1998; Joh, 2006).

On the contrary, studies by Erçetin (2010) and Brantmeier (2006) found a positive correlation between both perceived interest and/or prior knowledge, and reading comprehension. Erçetin (2010) concluded that topic interest had a significant main effect on text recall while prior knowledge did not. Brantmeier´s (2006) results varied according to the assessment tasks used. Thus, she found a positive correlation between perceived interest and two assessment tasks, i.e., sentence completion and multiple choice, but she did not find a positive correlation between perceived interest and written recall. In the same vein, Lahuerta (2013) studied interest and reading comprehension using different assessment methods. She found a positive effect of perceived interest and prior knowledge on university students´ L2 reading comprehension. Specifically, the results showed that comprehension assessed via written recall and multiple choice questions was enhanced when readers read texts related to their interests and that prior knowledge had a positive effect on the reader's comprehension irrespective of the assessment method used. Isusi and Lahuerta (2016) analysed familiarity and interest on foreign language reading comprehension of secondary education students. The comparison is made in general terms, and also by gender, L2 proficiency level, and assessment method (written recall and multiple choice). The results show that (a) the influence of familiarity outscores significantly that of interest; (b) as proficiency improves, the influence of both variables diminishes; (c) gender does not seem to affect reading comprehension of not gender-biased texts; and (d) the multiple choice task seems to help comprehension to a large extent. In a recent work, Asgari, Ketabi and Amirian (2019) conclude that selecting the instructional materials based on learners' interest areas could improve their performance in L2 reading comprehension

As we can observe, the results of the studies reviewed about the effect of interest and prior knowledge on reading comprehension show little concordance. In order to clarify this issue, the present work aims at examining the effect of perceived interest and prior knowledge on L2 reading comprehension via several assessment tasks in a specific context, a higher education context.

3. Research questions

The following Research Questions were formulated:

Q 1: Is there a significant relationship between readers´ perceived interest and their reading performance when this is measured by means of test that implies an individual reconstruction of the text (written recall)?

Q 2: Is there a significant relationship between readers´ perceived interest and their reading performance when this is measured by means of a test characterized by recognition and selection of the right answer (multiple choice questions)?

Q 3: Is there a significant relationship between readers´ previous knowledge and their reading performance when this is measured by means of test that implies an individual reconstruction of the text (written recall)?

Q4: Is there a significant relationship between readers´ previous knowledge and their reading performance when this is measured by means of a test characterized by recognition and selection of the right answer (multiple choice questions)?

4. Methods and procedures

4.1. Participants

Participants were 227 undergraduates with an advanced level of English competence. They belong to the following University degrees: Music History, Tourism and Modern Languages and their Literature.

4.2. Reading passage

The reading passage was selected after carefully looking at different texts. The text used was a 450-word passage describing Wales from a geographical, social, political and economic perspective entitled *Wales*.

4.3. Assessment methods

Two assessment methods were used, a written recall task and a multiple choice task. In the written recall task, we asked participants, without turning back to the passage, to write down as much as they could about the passage just read. For the multiple-choice method ten questions were elaborated for each passage. While creating the multiple choice items for the present study we followed Wolf's guidelines (1991) for writing multiple-choice questions. This researcher recommends that all items should be passage dependent so that the reader always needs to read a passage in order to choose the correct answer, that some of the

items should be elaborated so that the reader could make inferences and that all the distracters in the multiple choice questions should be plausible (or believable) in order to prevent participants from immediately disregarding responses.

4.3. Perceived interest questionnaire

The Perceived Interest Questionnaire (PIQ) was adapted from Schraw et al. (1995), and it contained 9 items. For each item readers indicated the degree to which they agreed or disagreed with each statement. This instrument assessed feelings of personal interest. The items were: I thought the text was very interesting; I'd like to discuss this text with others at some point; I would read this text again if I had the chance; I got caught-up in the story without trying to; I thought the text's topic was quite interesting; I think others would find this text interesting; I would like to read more texts like this in the future; This text was one of the most interesting ones I've read in a long time; This text really grabbed my attention.

4.5. Topic familiarity

We assessed topic familiarity with a 5-point scale (from 5: "I knew a lot about the topic" to 1: "I did not know anything about the topic at all).

4.6. Data collection procedure

Participants were told to read one passage and then complete comprehension assessment tasks. They were instructed not to look back at any previous pages while reading and completing all tasks. Participants were asked to read the text and answer five multiple choice questions based on the passage and next they were asked to write everything they remembered from the text without looking back at the passage. After that, they completed the topic familiarity questionnaire. Finally, they completed the perceived interest questionnaire. The researcher was present at all data collection times to ensure that participants followed the instructions correctly.

4.7. Scoring and analysis procedure

The text was divided into idea units by two different raters. Idea units were identified following Riley and Lee's (1996) criteria. Separately, the researcher and an additional rater identified the total idea units for each text and then compared results. A template of idea units was then created for codifying purposes. The text was divided into 21 idea units. The researcher and an external rater identified separately the idea units correctly reproduced in each text by each participant and compared results.

Sentence completion items were scored according to a template of correct and acceptable answers. The researcher and an external rater separately scored the exercises and compared results. Finally, these were compared with the template.

5. Results

A regression analysis was carried out to answer the four research questions formulated. With respect to the first research question, intended to examine if the reader's perceived interest in the text affects the reader's performance measured by means of written recall, the results (see Table1) show that the greater the readers´ perceived interest, the greater their reading performance measured by means of written recall. The perceived interest explains more than 18% of reading comprehension as measured by written recall. Moreover, these results are significant at p<0.001.

Variables	*B* not standardized	Beta (B)	t-value	P
Dependent variable: *WR SCORE*				
Constant	5.439 (0.000)			0.000
PI	1.459	0.329	4.547	0.000
R^2	0.194			
R^2 adjusted	0.185			
F	21.592			
Probablity of F	16.835			
N	227			

Table 1 Regression Equation-Relationship Between Perceived Interest/Written Recall

With respect to the second research question formulated, results show that the greater the readers´ perceived interest, the greater their reading performance measured by means of multiple choice questions (see Table 2 below). The perceived interest explains more than 17% of reading comprehension as measured by multiple choice questions. Moreover, these results are significant at 0.001.

Variables	*B* not standardized	Beta (*B*)	t-value	*P*
Dependent variable: MC SCORE				
Constant	4.815 (0.000)			0.000
PI	1.472 (0.000)	0.477	5.000	0.000
R^2	0.189			
R^2 adjusted	0.172			
F	2.159			
Probablity of F	17.677			
N	227			

Table 2 regression equation-relationship between perceived interest

Regarding the third research question, results also showed that the greater the reader's previous knowledge of the topic of the text, the greater his/her reading performance measured by means of written recall (see Table 3 below). The prior knowledge explains more than 15% of reading comprehension as measured by written recall. Moreover, these results are significant at p<0.001.

Variables	B not standardized	Beta (B)	t-value	P
Dependent variable: WR SCORE				
Constant	2.580 (0.000)			0.000
PRIOR KNOWLEDGE	1.674 (0.000)	0.432	4.793	0.000
R2	0.159			
R2 adjusted	0.152			
F	22.125			
Probablity of F	3.304			
N	227			

Table 3 regression equation-relationship between prior knowledge / written recall

Finally, as Table 4 shows, we see that the greater the readers´ previous knowledge of the topic of the text, the greater tehir reading performance measured by means of multiple choice questions. The prior knowledge explains 12% of reading comprehension as measured by multiple choice questions. Moreover, these results are significant at p<0.001 (see Table 4 below).

Variables	***B* not standardized**	**BETA (*B*)**	**t-VALUE**	***P***
Dependent variable: MC SCORE				
Constant	**3.717 (0.000)**			**0.000**
PRIOR KNOWLEDGE	**0.733 (0.078)**	**0.590**	**1.980**	**0.000**
R^2	**0.129**			
R^2 adjusted	**0.120**			
F	**4.169**			
Probability of F	**5.760**			
N	**227**			

Table 4 regression equation-relationship between prior knowledge / multiple choice questions

6. Discussion

The results obtained in the present work show the significant effect of the two factors approached, prior knowledge and perceived interest on L2 reading comprehension.

Prior knowledge has a positive effect on the reader's comprehension irrespective of the assessment method used. It affects reading comprehension when assessed both via a method that implies a reconstruction of a text and a method that implies selection. Prior knowledge reveals itself as a significant factor to increase university reader's interest.

The results also show that comprehension assessed via recall and multiple choice questions is enhanced when readers read texts related to their interests. The readers' perceived interest has a significant effect on reading comprehension when written recall and multiple choice are used as assessment methods.

7. Conclusion

Reading is a complex process that involves various elements like interest and prior knowledge that, as this study shows need to be taken into account when approaching readers' comprehension performance. An important contribution of this study is the importance of considering assessment methods not in an individual way, but examining the differences among them and how they may affect the relationship between both perceived interest and prior knowledge, and L2 reading comprehension. The results of this study are however limited since this study works with students from one level of L2 proficiency (advanced) who read only one type of text (expository). Future research work should expand on the present findings by examining the effect of both perceived interest and prior knowledge on L2 reading comprehension across stages of acquisition with different text types.

References

[1] Asgari, M., Ketabi, S., & Amirian, Z. 2019. Interest-Based Language Teaching: Enhancing students' interest and achievement in L2 reading. Iranian Journal of Language Teaching Research, 7(1), 61-75.

[2] Bernhardt, E. B. 2000. Second language reading as a case study of reading scholarship in the twentieth century. In M. Kamil, P. D. Mosethal, D. Pearson & R. Barr (Eds.), Handbook of Reading Research Volume III (pp. 793-811). Hillsdale, NJ: Erlbaum.

[3] Bernhardt, E. B. (2005). Progress and procrastination in second language reading. Annual Review of Applied Linguistics, 25, 133-150.

[4] Bernhardt, E. B. (2011). Understanding advanced second-language reading. New York: Routledge.

[5] Brantmeier, C. (2006). Advanced L2 learners and reading placement: Self-assessment, computer-based testing, and subsequent performance. System, 34(1), 15-35.

[6] Carrell, P. L., & Wise, T.E. (1998). "The relationship between prior knowledge and topic interest in second language reading". Studies in Second Language Acquisition, 20, 285-309.
[7] Erçetin, G. (2010). Effects of topic interest and prior knowledge on text recall and annotation use in reading a hypermedia text in the L2. ReCALL, 2, 228-246.
[8] Isusi, A., & Lahuerta, A. (2016). Análisis de la familiaridad y del interés en la comprensión lectora de estudiantes españoles de inglés como lengua extranjera. Revista Española de Lingüística Aplicada, 29(1), 141-164.
[9] Joh, J. (2006). What happens when L2 readers recall? Language Research, 42, 205–238.
[10] Koda, K. (2007). Reading and language learning: Crosslinguistic constraints on second language reading development. Language Learning, 57 (1), 1–44.
[11] Lahuerta, A. (2013). The use of various assessment tasks in the analysis of the effect of prior knowledge and interest on L2 reading comprehension. Revista Española de Lingüística Aplicada 26: 289-306.
[12] Nassaji, H. (2002). Schema theory and knowledge-based processes in second language reading comprehension: A need for alternative perspectives. Language Learning, 52 (2), 439-481.
[13] Nassaji, H. (2003). Higher-level and lower-level text processing skills in advanced ESL reading comprehension. The Modern Language Journal, 87 (2), 261-276.
[14] Riley, G. L., & J.F. Lee (1996). A comparison of recall and summary protocols as measures of second language reading comprehension. Language Testing, 13(2), 173-189.
[15] Schraw, G., Bruning, R., & Svoboda, C. (1995). Sources of situational interest. Journal of Reading Behavior, 27 (1), 1–17.
[16] Stanovich, K. E. 1980. "Toward an interactive-compensatory model of individual differences in the acquisition of literacy". Reading Research Quarterly 16: 32-71.
[17] Wolf, D. 1991. The Effects of Task, Language of Assessment, and Target Language Experience on Foreign Language Learners Performance on Reading Comprehension. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign.
[18] Xu, H. & Durgunoğlu, A.Y. (2019). Motivational factors underlying different levels of reading comprehension of English language learners. TESOL Journal.

The Journey of Self-Discovery and Wholeness in To the Light House: From the 'Body for Others' to the 'Visionary Body'

Muzaffer Derya Nazlıpınar Subaşı

PhD, Dumlupınar University,
School of Foreign Languages, Kütahya, Turkey

Abstract

Having been defined as an 'incomplete man' or an 'incidental being' that lacks certain qualities, women have gradually internalized the patriarchal ideology, claiming that they are essentially insufficient. Considering themselves as the insignificant 'Other' in relation to men, women are full of self-loathing and shame over their bodies. Thus, always seeking men's approval, women drown out the inner voice of their bodies and resort to being 'the body for others'. However, for Woolf, it is a self- destruction not a salvation. She claims women have to get rid of those docile bodies and disembodied minds to be able to take control of their own lives cleared from all the social constraints, society constructed gender roles and patriarchal demands. For Woolf, this is only possible when women assert themselves through their bodies, thereby realizing a new sense of being inside themselves that is powerful and autonomous ready to actualize its potential. Therefore, basing its argument on those assertions of Virginia Woolf and one of her most influential novels, *To the Lighthouse*, this study puts forward women's body image largely influenced by phallocentric world and its typical patriarchal system can be challenged and subverted through the 'visionary body' that enables women to achieve the unique process of self-discovery and wholeness.

Keywords: phallocentric order, patriarchy, gendered body/body for others, fluid body/visionary body, semiotic chora, de(con)struction

Introduction

Aptly-named as "a psychological poem" (Woolf, 1982, p. 102) by Leonard Woolf, *To the Lighthouse* (*TTL,* henceforth) is considered by many critics to be one of the most influential novels written by Virginia Woolf. Moreover, since perhaps Woolf has woven a great deal of her personal experiences and unresolved issues with her deceased parents into the novel, *To the Lighthouse* is accepted as a semi-autobiographical work. In this masterpiece, Woolf aims to discharge that intensified psychic energy with two main characters based on her parents: Sir Leslie Stephen,

who provides a model for Mr. Ramsay, "... sitting in a boat, reciting We Perished, Each Alone, while he crushes a dying mackerel" (Woolf, 1982, p. 75), and Julia Stephen, a model for Mrs. Ramsay, staying "there... in the very center... from the very first" (Woolf, 1985, p. 81). Woolf, obsessed with her parents, admits that she has to write this novel, *To the Lighthouse*, to release herself from them, especially from her mother:

I wrote the book very quickly; and when it was written, I ceased to be obsessed by my mother. I no longer hear her voice; I do not see her. I suppose that I did for myself what psychoanalysts do for their patients. I expressed some very long felt and deeply felt emotion. And in expressing it I explained it and then laid it to rest (1985, p. 81).

Therefore, *To the Lighthouse* is a kind of journey for Woolf, a metaphoric journey to her own past, to the maternal space and semiotics from the phallocentric symbolic order. In fact, Woolf has to set out on that journey to distinguish her self-identity from that of her identity with the mother, but she cannot resist the attraction of this complex relationship and always finds herself being drawn "into its orbit not only as a daughter but as a writer" (Rosenman, 1986, p.15). Thus, like in many other works, Woolf aims to regress back to the beginning, also in *To the Lighthouse,* to re-experience and re- create the early experiences of semiotic chora full of ecstasy and rapture. As she writes in *Moments of Being*, achieving that satisfaction "is only a question of discovering how we can get ourselves again attached to it, so that we shall be able to live our lives through from the start" (1985, p.67). Briefly, by descending into a realm of semiotic fluid that spilled over the restraints of symbolic language, Woolf seeks the secret essence that she carries within her throughout the novel, particularly in relation to the mother, represented by Mrs. Ramsay.

The question here is that why the relation to the mother and her maternal body is so crucial for Woolf to be able to create a less sexist and less phallocentric model for women. According to her, women, who have been the objects of male theorizing, male desires, male fears and male representations for ages, have to reclaim their usurped bodies and silenced voices back. For this aim, they have to create both a new female language and a new politics. However, it is a challenging process since the system of the patriarchal language and its hegemonic powers have penetrated into almost every field of experience. The obvious place to begin is the silent place, the 'dark continent', as Helene Cixous points out:

The Dark Continent is neither dark nor unexplorable. – It is still unexplored only because we've been made to believe that it was too dark to be explorable. And because they want to make us believe that what interests us is the white continent, with its monuments to Lack (1976, p.884-85).

For Freud and Lacan, women are excluded from any available connection with culture and the cultural order as they lack any relation to the phallus, the

'transcendental signifier'. According to them, female subjects, not having the phallus, cannot signify speech and desire, because all individuals must symbolize their desire in terms of the male penis. Hence, women acquire a split identity and self-understanding as they are merely considered speechless objects of male desire. In order to move beyond the limitations of this oppressive formulation of desire, with its basis in the Oedipal conflict, and achieve their unity again, women must listen to the call of the chora; an echo reminiscent of original bliss, or the "semiotic chora", a term for the 'enclosed space, womb' or 'receptacle' that Kristeva derives from Plato's *Timaeus* (Kristeva, 1984).

During the time of infancy, there is no sense of separation from the body of the mother. The infant and mother are one and whole. There is no self, no other, no this or that; everything is one and the same. Their world is composed entirely of sensations elaborating wholeness and jouissance. As there is no absence, there is also no need for language. Thus, the concept of 'other' is not conceivable to the infant yet. However, this situation significantly changes once patriarchy reaches his hands to the child. The process of othering starts both for the child and the mother: s/he becomes an 'Other' to the mother and the mother turns into the 'm/other', a selfless object, whose sole reason for existence is to gratify the wants and needs of the family. The child views the mother not as a person but as an object who fails to give her/him what s/he desires from her. Acquiring the 'Law of the Father', the child becomes a subject of the system (Lacan, 1977) and loses the union with the mother. The feeling of wholeness producing laughter disappears gradually, and "the child's laughter [becomes] one of a past event" (Kristeva, 1980, p.283). Therefore, the entrance of the child to the Father's law means both separation from the mother and losing touch with the semiotic chora; as clarified in the following:

Once the subject has entered into the Symbolic Order, the chora will be more or less successfully repressed and can be perceived only as pulsional pressure on symbolic language: as contradictions, meaninglessness, disruption, silences and absences in the symbolic language. The chora is a rhythmic pulsion rather than a new language. It constitutes, in other words, … the disruptive dimension of language, that which can never be caught up in the closure of traditional linguistic theory (Moi, 1996, p.162).

Even though a person loses touch with the semiotic in the symbolic stage, the chora is always there for her/him. The mother's voice has been repressed, though, not silenced. It is present but defined as "an invisible, formless being, a mysterious" (Irigaray, 1985, p.307) within the patriarchal discourse. In order to re-experience the sensations, experiences, and most importantly the wholeness of the chora, the tightly wound structures of phallocentric discourse and its man-made language must be unraveled, because all of these have been formed to separate one from the mother. By re-uniting with the chora, in which there are no binaries or hierarchies but only unity and harmony, one can create a new world, where the Law of the

Father does not count. It is not a utopian dream as there was such a place once in everyone's life: the pre-symbolic period, where the child is one with the m/other.

Therefore, Woolf claims that the other, which is at the same time the mother, is the source of de(con)structing everything related with the phallocentric discourse: its cultural norms, laws, language, and power. Once women get to the other side of the looking glass and become one with their image, instead of seeing it from the outside as an 'other', their female language will be brought into the foreground of consciousness. Eventually, the female language finds its source, the m/other's body, "mak[ing] everything all right, nourish[ing] and stand[ing] up against separation" (Cixous, 1976, p.882). This poetic female language, coming from the 'semiotic chora/the maternal body' eliminates the dominating sense of the symbolic and lets women overcome their initial silence and express themselves outside the bounds of phallocentric signification.

The Voice(s) of M/other: Mrs. Ramsay and Lily Briscoe

Mrs. Ramsay, like Julia Stephen, is a typical Victorian woman who has sacrificed herself for the sake of her husband and children. She is the 'Angel in the House', who "warmed and soothed" (*TTL*, p.41) everybody around her with her maternal realm, especially her children, who long for the secure world of the chora and semiotics. She is the looking glass, "possessing the magic and delicious power of reflecting the figure of man at twice its natural size" (Woolf, 1929, p.30) not just for her husband, Mr. Ramsay, desiring "to be assured of his genius, ... to be taken within the circle of life, ... to have his senses restored" (*TTL*, p.32), but she also provides solace to her guests:

[Mr. Tansley] should have been a great philosopher, said Mrs. Ramsay, ... but he had made an unfortunate marriage. It flattered him; snubbed as he had been, it soothed him that Mrs. Ramsay should tell him this. Charles Tansley revived. Insinuating, too, as she did the greatness of man's intellect, even in its decay, ... she made him feel better pleased with himself than he had done yet (*TTL*, p.9).

Despite all her efforts of self-sacrifice and surrender, Mrs. Ramsay is sometimes faced with dilemmas and serious doubts about her marriage. In some certain moments, "when, in a state of mind..., half plaintive, half resentful, she seemed unable to surmount the tempest calmly, or to laugh as they laughed, but in her weariness perhaps concealed something. She brooded and sat silent" (*TTL*, p. 168). She thinks that her entire life is in vain. In fact, Mrs. Ramsay feels like she has a split personality represented by two kinds of body – the 'body for others', "the body cast in social roles and bound by the laws of social interaction", and the 'visionary body', "a second physical presence in fundamental respects different from the gendered body constituted by the dominant social order" (Hite, 2000, p.1). When she is alone and isolates herself from everything – her husband, children and chores – she feels that her visionary body "offer[s] an inviolable place for momentary but definitive

experience" (Hite, 2000, p.17). In those times, Mrs. Ramsay sees the light reflected from the lighthouse:

... the steady light, the pitiless, the remorseless, which was so much her, yet so little her, which had her at its beck and call ..., but for all that she thought, watching it with fascination, hypnotized, as if it were stroking with its silver fingers some sealed vessel in her brain whose bursting would flood her with delight, she had known happiness, exquisite happiness, intense happiness, and it silvered the rough waves a little more brightly, as daylight faded, and the blue went out of the sea and it rolled in waves of pure lemon which curved and swelled and broke upon the beach and the ecstasy burst in her eyes and waves of pure delight raced over the floor of her mind and she felt, It is enough! It is enough! (*TTL*, p.54).

With the touching of the light, Mrs. Ramsay has reached beyond the limits of a 'dark continent', which has been defined as uncanny and a threatening place for women by the phallocentric tradition. However, there, she experiences jouissance and freedom, not fear and uncertainty. She feels as if her body was fluid, which cannot be controlled or shaped. Unfortunately, this 'exquisite happiness and ecstasy' do not last long, because Mr. Ramsay, regarding his wife just as a body that merely belongs to him, realizes the change in Mrs. Ramsay. He senses the threat of her new 'fluid body', which will "deform, propagate, evaporate, consume him, to flow out of him and into another who cannot easily be held on to" (Irigaray, 1985, p.237). Fearing the loss of his authority over his wife, Mr. Ramsay turns up the heat. All the strength and energy of Mrs. Ramsay is absorbed "by the beak of brass, the arid scimitar of the male, which smote mercilessly, again and again, demanding sympathy" (*TTL*, p.32). Very soon, she cannot resist being the 'body for others', and her quest for truth ends in unconditional surrender to Mr. Ramsay, like "a bride to meet her lover" (*TTL*, p.53). In that way, by letting her husband exploit her body, Mrs. Ramsay has no staying power and dies unexpectedly.

By exemplifying two different bodily experiences of Mrs. Ramsay, Woolf tries to prove how the phallocentric world and its typical patriarchal system mold and ideologically program women's bodies. With this controlling idea in her mind, she challenges and subverts women's body image largely influenced by false assumptions of male opinions, and creates sensuous and passionate female characters who remain aloof from the unresolved problems of motherhood and love affairs. These female characters, having the modernist body, or in other words, the 'visional body', represent "an inspired solution to the problems of women's culturally sanctioned vulnerability" (Hite, 2000, p.6). Woolf creates that body, "sealed off from social consequences, secure from interruption or invasion" (Hite, 2000, p.6), through the character 'Lily'. Unlike Mrs. Ramsay, representing the typical Victorian woman, Lily does not align with the ideologies of the mentioned period. She is "an independent little creature" (*TTL*, p.15), who deals with art and artistic creation instead of getting married and having children. In this respect, in *To the*

Lighthouse, Woolf has laid foundations for transforming the patriarchal 'docile body' into the 'fluid body' that cannot be controlled or shaped, and kills the 'Angel' in the house and creates the female modernist body, or in other words, the 'visionary body' so as to reach the states of enlightenment and transcendence.

Women, defined as an 'incomplete man' or an 'incidental being' that lacks certain qualities, have internalized the patriarchal ideology, claiming that women are essentially insufficient. Considering themselves as the insignificant 'Other' in relation to men, who are the 'Absolute', women are full of self-loathing and shame over their bodies. Thus, always seeking men's approval, women drown out the inner voice of their bodies and resort to being 'the body for others'. However, for Woolf, it is a self- destruction not a salvation. She claims women have to get rid of those docile bodies and disembodied minds to be able to take control of their own lives cleared from all the social constraints, society constructed gender roles and patriarchal demands; that is, from all the reductive systems of masculine confinement and oppressive language. For Woolf, this is only possible when women assert themselves through their bodies, as it is "one's body feeling, not one's mind" (*TTL*, p.148). She believes that once a woman reclaims her body, she eventually realizes a new sense of being inside her that is powerful and autonomous ready to actualize its potential as a whole and healthy person. Thus, Woolf encourages women to resist the patriarchal representations of their bodies and accept the fact that their body is an essential aspect of self-expression.

Correspondingly, Lily, who cannot complete her painting however hard she tries, understands that she needs a new way to express her feelings and spiritual energy, which is not controlled through the moral codes of phallocentricism and its man-made language. This new way is her body, as the place of self-expression, as Woolf states in *A Room of One's Own*: "No doubt we shall find her knocking that into shape for herself when she has the free use of her limbs; and providing some new vehicle (1929, p. 65). Realizing this fact, Lily stops considering her body as an obstacle and sets it free:

Then, as if some juice necessary for the lubrication of her faculties were spontaneously squirted, she began precariously dipping among the blues and umbers, moving her brush hither what and thither, ... with some rhythm which was dictated to her. ... she lost consciousness of outer things, and her name and her personality and her appearance, ... her mind kept throwing up from its depths, scenes, and names, and sayings, and memories and ideas, like a fountain spurting over that glaring, hideously difficult white space, while she modelled it with greens and blues (*TTL,* p. 134).

Only when Lily decides to trace her body does she feel the rhythm of her 'visional body', and trembles in "a painful but exciting ecstasy" (*TTL,* p.132). Gradually, with the help of those rhythms, what seems like "ghost, air, nothingness ... a center of complete emptiness" (*TTL,* p.149) at the beginning of her journey becomes clear,

and Lily lifts the veil of the mystery. Now, she understands very well that this "white space" is the maternal body, which is a rich and fertile terrain for creation. Realizing this fact, Lily decides to find her lost mother and re-establish the dual union through which she can obtain the feeling of wholeness and creative spirit, because only then she will be able to complete her masterpiece, which is not "single and solitary births; ... but the outcome of many years of thinking in common" (Woolf, 1929, p.55) (italic is mine). Desiring to seek a mode of representation outside of the father's symbolic universe, the only way for Lily to explore and describe the archaic and primary relation to 'the maternal feminine' (Irigaray, 1985) is to paint in 'white ink'. For this purpose, she affiliates with her figurative mother, Mrs. Ramsay, who will nourish her with all that she needs.

Conclusion

In fact, by focusing on the reintegration with the lost mother and her maternal body, Woolf aims to de(con)struct the ignorant patriarchal gaze over the mother-daughter and/or woman to woman relationship in *To the Lighthouse*, because she believes that women are "confidantes, ... mothers and daughters" (Woolf, 1929, p.69). To clarify the problems of the patricentric texts, she interrogates Freud and Lacan's arguments on the pre-Oedipal structure, and prognosticates the matricentric theory as a gateway to the symbolic register (Abel,1989). Unlike Freud and Lacan, advocating the complete separation from a mother for a successful individuation, Woolf believes that nothing is required to be repressed. She identities the fourth dimension of human life in which one can obtain the lost unity with the mother again: "I mean: I: & the not I: & the outer & the inner [...] New combinations in psychology & body – rather like painting" (Woolf, 1982, p.353). What Woolf emphasizes with the fourth dimension is the mother's womb, or the chora, "a receptacle of all becoming" (Kristeva, 1980, p.38) that offers equal chances to both sexes. It is not a place of emptiness or mystery but a place of production. When Lily comes to term with this fact, she "[goes] on tunneling her way into her picture, into the past" (*TTL*, p. 145), like Woolf does during her creation process. There, she returns to the pre-oedipal phase of 'unity' with the mother and identities with Mrs. Ramsay, representing the mother archetype that promises the primordial unity. With this unification, Lily Briscoe resolves her own insecurities and comes to peace with the memory of the deceased Mrs. Ramsay. Now, it is the right time for Lily to complete her painting:

Quickly, as if she were recalled by something over there, she turned to her canvas. There it was—her picture. Yes, with all its greens and blues, its lines running up and across, its attempt at something. It would be hung in the attics, she thought; it would be destroyed. But what did that matter? She asked herself, taking up her brush again. She looked at the steps; they were empty; she looked at her canvas; it was blurred. With a sudden intensity, as if she saw it clear for a second, she drew a line

there, in the center. It was done; it was finished. Yes, she thought, laying down her brush in extreme fatigue, I have had my vision (*TTL*, p.176).

Lily finishes her painting just after "peace had come" (*TTL,* p. 120). She, at last, finds the way to express her body's feelings that have been inexpressible before, and transforms what seems indefinite and absent into the certitude and properness of a vision. In other words, Lily succeeds in making "the shadow on the step" (*TTL*, p. 170) visible and turns it into a sign of presence. It is not just somebody but Mrs. Ramsay, the primary source of everything. She is still part of the "picture" Lily seeks. Thus, by catching the essence of Mrs. Ramsay, Lily Briscoe finally manages to conceptualize Woolf's vision at the end of the novel. She transfers what she sees into a form. That is, she makes visible the world's invisible form by uncovering the language of art. That language, purified from the patriarchal ideologies and male gaze, erases all the binaries and creates a new image of the female body defined by female experience. It puts an end to the rule of phallic authority and logocentrism over the female body, and lets this visional body assert itself in Lily and her attitude towards life and art. Her body, urged by "a curious physical sensation" (*TTL,* p. 133) to paint, connects with the rhythms of the mother's womb, or the semiotic chora that always ensures peace and truth along with the primordial unity. Through this unity and the pre-linguistic experience with the mother, Lily Briscoe ascertains her transcendent vision and manages to reach the maternal jouissance, the source of aesthetic revolution, and violates the constraints of the symbolic discourse by "connect[ing] the mass on the right hand with that on the left" (*TTL*, p. 44) (the italic is mine).

References

[1] Abel, E. (1989). *Virginia Woolf and the Fictions of Psychoanalysis*, University of Chicago Press: Chicago.
[2] Cixous, H., Cohen, K., & Cohen, P. (1976). The Laugh of the Medusa, *Signs,* Vol. 1, No. 4, pp. 875-893.
[3] Hite, M. (2000). Virginia Woolf's Two Bodies, *Genders Online Journal* 31, pp. 1-22 pp.
[4] Irigaray, L. (1985). *Speculum of the Other Woman,* Trans. Gillain C. Gill, Cornell University Press: New York.
[5] Kristeva, J. (1984). *Revolution in Poetic Language*, Columbia UP: NY.
[6] Kristeva, J. (1980). *Desire in Language: A Semiotic Approach to Literature and Art*, (Ed.), Leon S. Roudiez, Trans. Thomas Gora, Alice Jardine and Leon S. Roudiez, Columbia UP, NY.
[7] Lacan, J. (1977). *Ecrits: A Selection*, Trans. Alan Sheridan, W.W. Norton & Company: London.
[8] Moi, T. (1996). *Sexual/Textual Politics: Feminist Literary Theory*, Routledge: London.

[9] Rosenman, E. B. (1986). *The Invisible Presence: Virginia Woolf and the Mother-Daughter Relationship,* Louisiana State University: USA.
[10] Woolf, V. (1990). *To the Lighthouse,* HB Classics: USA.
[11] Woolf, V. (1929). *A Room of One's Own,* Harcourt, New York, Project Gutenberg, Retrieved from http://gutenberg.org
[12] Woolf, V. (1982). *A Writer's Diary: Being Extracts from the Diary of Virginia Woolf*, (Ed.), Leonard Woolf, Harcourt: New York.
[13] Woolf, V. (1985). *Moments of Being*, (Ed.), Jeanne Schulkind, Harcourt: New York.

ISSN 2411-9598 (Print)
ISSN 2411-4103 (Online)
European Journal of
Language and Literature Studies
July - December 2022
Volume 8, Issue 2

Exploding the Cancer Myths: Brian Lobel's Narrative Performance Ball

Yeliz Biber Vangolu

Ataturk University, Turkey

Abstract

In his personal account of cancer, *Ball* (2003), the performance artist, Brian Lobel, intently refuses to succumb to the myths about the illness, challenging the cancer narratives that have traditionally been based on a discourse of heroism or martyrdom. While his performance is, at times, sensational with a keen focus on sexuality and a determination to produce humour out of a grave matter, they invite criticism for the way cancer has been perceived and presented as a medical condition and for the social stigma attached to the disease. This paper addresses the numerous ways in which Lobel challenges the assumptions, expectations and taboos regarding cancer, cancer patients and survivors by examining his strategies in the light of cultural studies on cancer and humour theories. *

Keywords: *Brian Lobel, Illness, Ball, Cancer, Susan Sontag, Humour*

Introduction

One of the recurring statements made by Susan Sontag (1978) in her seminal study on illness, "Illness as Metaphor", is that cancer is a disease "unimaginable to aestheticize" (p. 20), one which "nobody has managed to glamorize" (p. 35) as opposed to tuberculosis which has invariably been romanticised in both fictional and non-fictional contexts. Contemporary narratives of cancer, however, have to some extent confuted Sontag's observation, mainly following two lines of representation: either the cancer patients are depicted as fragile, over-sensitive and vulnerable humans unable to cope with the ruthlessness and competitiveness of the outside world or the cancer survivors are presented in all their glory as strong and invincible super-humans.[1] While the illness itself is usually not glamourised due to the obvious physical decline it brings on, its stark power to cause a sudden rupture by impairing life to a severe degree has inspired many to compose aestheticised

* This essay is a revised and expanded version of a paper entitled "A Response to Cancer Myths: Brian Lobel's *Ball*" presented at the 12th International Conference on Social Sciences, held in Amsterdam, The Netherlands, on 19-20 May 2017.

[1] Jackie Stacey, the author of *Teratologies*, also notes this two-fold approach adopted in representations of cancer patients and survivors. See Stacey (1997), pp. 1-2.

narratives around it. In fact, the aestheticising of the disease had already shown signs of appearing in cinema as early as 1970 with one of the most romantic movies of all times: *Love Story*. The cancer narratives in cinema were still very infrequent at the time, but were followed in the eighties and nineties by a number of movies such as *Terms of Endearment* (1983), *Dying Young* (1991), *My Life* (1993) and *One True Thing* (1998), and by a significantly increased number of cancer movies in the first quarter of the 21st century, such as *Sweet November* (2001), *One Week* (2008), *Letters to God* (2010), *50/50* (2011), *Decoding Annie Parker* (2013) and *Miss You Already* (2015). These movies, most of which are family dramas touching upon themes of loss, noble suffering and emotional vulnerability, have contributed to the gradual aestheticisation of cancer along with copious numbers of publications on the disease. Treating the aspects of cancer reality in an idealised manner is sustained in particular by first-person pathographies presenting daily occurrences in the background of illness, like *Chicken Soup for the Cancer Survivor's Soul* (1996), *When God and Cancer Meet* (2002) and *When Breath Becomes Air* (2016). Compared to almost forty years ago when Sontag wrote her influential study on illness and how we perceive it, we are certainly better informed about cancer in today's world where it has become a major public health problem, particularly in upper-middle-income and high-income economies.[1] The current alertness to cancer in these countries owes much to cancer awareness campaigns and exhaustive publications, as well as to the extensive web and media coverage of the disease, all of which run parallel to the increase in the number of cancer patients and the fear mongering that usually accompanies the cancer narratives, compelling the public to take preventive measures. Books, pamphlets or websites, produced by doctors or from cancer-related institutions and societies, offer detailed information on cancer types and definitions, risk factors, prevention, treatment models, and statistical data. Cancer patients and survivors, as well as their families and friends, also share their personal experiences through books, cancer blogs and vlogs, and other social media. Considered as a "healthy" outlet for a life-threatening condition, this sharing practice allows the patient to transgress the limitations of the ill body to a certain extent and converts the suffering into something meaningful by helping other cancer patients to cope.

While contemporary cancer narratives have largely contributed to the aestheticisation of the disease through a process of transforming a life-threatening condition into a romanticised adversity, attempts at exploding these myths – however slim they may be compared to the bulk of the victim-/survivor-glorifying rhetoric of these narratives – have also surfaced. One such attempt has been made by the London-based American academic and performer Brian Lobel who is one of

[1] According to the World Health Organisation's 2015 statistics on the leading causes of death by economy income group, cancer is a major cause of death threatening the lives of many in countries with developed economies. For further information, see www.who.int.

the millions of cancer survivors in the world. Utilising a critical approach that combines a first-person perspective on serious issues related to cancer with humour in resisting the aestheticisation of the disease, Lobel weaves a narrative around his experience as a cancer patient. Among his chief interests are bodies and body politics (http://www.blobelwarming.com/about/), which have resulted in performances intervening into the way bodies are culturally stigmatised and marginalised. Soon after he was diagnosed with testicular cancer in 2001 at the age of twenty, he started writing *Ball* (2003), the first piece of his trilogy of 'cancer comedies'[1], each of which, he informs us, "marked a specific point in my thinking about cancer, my body, and the relationship between my cancer, my body and the world outside of my own experience." (Lobel, p. 13). Alongside *Ball*, his trilogy includes *Other Funny Stories about Cancer* (2006) and *An Appreciation* (2009). Lobel has performed these three pieces either individually or as double-bills at conferences, festivals and theatres as well as in medical schools and hospitals, and in 2012 they were collectively published as a book. While primarily focusing on the text of the first part of his trilogy in the book, this essay also takes advantage of visual material in the form of Youtube videos of Lobel's performances from *Ball*. The ways in which Lobel resists, in his performance, the norms that have been formed around cancer will be exemplified and discussed at length in the light of numerous cultural theories on illness as well as humour theories.

To begin with, it will be useful to explain Lobel's employment of humour by referring to one of the most widely-accepted theories on humour. In his study on laughter, Henri Bergson (1900/2005) asserts that "A comic effect is always obtainable by transposing the natural expression of an idea into another key" (pp. 60-61). Bergson's timeless remark about the means of producing humour can indeed be observed in Lobel's entire performance. He exploits a rather light-hearted and blithe mode to tell his story of illness where the natural expression of a disease is defined by pain and suffering which is, more often than not, situated within a heroic discourse as the person inflicted with a life-threatening disease is imagined as fighting a battle.

Making humour out of such a grave matter as illness is an extremely challenging and audacious undertaking, insofar as it could easily disturb the sensibilities of other cancer patients and survivors (as well as their families and friends) who may feel as though their struggle against this fatal disease is being ridiculed and trivialised. My initial argument here is that, since Brian Lobel dramatises his very own, private

[1] In the descriptions of one of the short clips from *Ball* on Youtube (Lobel, 2016), the whole piece is described as a cancer comedy, which is the most fitting generic definition possible considering the uneasy togetherness of the grim subject matter and the light, joyful narrative style. The oxymoronic term, cancer comedy, has also been used by others such as Jeffrey P. May, Meg Torwl and H. Alan Scott in the accounts of their cancer experience: however, in their case the word comedy refers to a narrative mode, not to actual performances on cancer as it is the case with Brian Lobel.

experience of cancer, the truth of this lived experience gives him the license to represent it in the manner and style he chooses. In other words, the tragic suffering Lobel has endured during his cancer treatment authorises him to unlock more narrative possibilities within the context of illness, paving the way to comic catharsis. In the Acknowledgements section of his book, Lobel notes the taboo-breaking potential of his experience of illness and the license it gives him as the suffering agent of a tragedy that could have had a fatal outcome when he thanks his "family… for whom my cancer will never be as funny as it was to me." (p. 6). While admitting to the horror of his illness for his family (those who are emotionally close to him but still outside his embodiment of illness), he reckons through his personal experience that it is possible to sport with cancer and to contextualise it within humour. The fact that Lobel's was a genital cancer also arguably presents more opportunities to derive humour from it by making it all the more challenging to discuss openly. Regarding this, Sontag writes, "cancer is notorious for attacking parts of the body (colon, bladder, rectum, breast, cervix, prostate, testicles) that are embarrassing to acknowledge." (p. 17). As a disease with an A-Z list of its more than one hundred types (National Cancer Institute, n.d.) cancer unsurprisingly spreads in the genitals and the other body parts one may find difficult to mention. In Lobel's narrative performances on cancer, the anticipated feeling of embarrassment caused by reference to genitals is countered and subverted by the potential of humour to overturn established notions.

Lobel starts *Ball* by introducing its subject matter to his audience: "this is a story about cancer… But I don't die at the end, so this is less dramatic than you want it be – sorry to disappoint you." (p. 22) First by ruling out the likelihood of death in his pathography, which is stating the obvious as Lobel himself is the narrator/performer, and second by confronting the audience about what he presumes to be the secret expectation of healthy people from the sick, Lobel, sets the mode of his performance as both a critical and comic one. His mere existence on the stage as a cancer survivor defies the stamp of mortality on cancer, while his sarcastic approach invites the audience to re-evaluate their views on the disease and form a fresh perceptive ability to assess the performance being staged in front of them.

Lobel then continues with a dramatisation of how he responded to being diagnosed with a "problematic" (p. 22) testicle. By emphasising his doctor's choice of the word "problematic', he criticises doctors' customary treatment of their patients: "Problematic? I am a twenty-year-old boy whose last concern should be bumpy balls…problematic? A testicle as big and hard and bumpy as mine – I'd say that's more than just *problematic*." (p. 22). Lobel's words lay bare the patients' perspective when faced with an inconclusive word like 'problematic' and the absurdity of doctors' avoidance of the word cancer in an attempt not to terrorise the patient. It should be noted here that the common practice of not naming cancer contributes to its mystification, ultimately causing the completely opposite effect of magnifying it

in public imagination. Charles E. Rosenberg (1992) observes, "In some ways disease does not exist until we have agreed that it does, by perceiving, naming, and responding to it." (p. xiii). This rule also seems to apply in the microcosmic world of the patient. Medical authorities refrain from alarming their patients by not enunciating a cancer diagnosis as a way of lessening the enormity of the disease. However, research shows that "The terms used to talk about cancer or a tumour without saying the actual words have the same emotional impact on the patient" (Fainzang, 2016, p. 30). In Lobel's account of the occasion when he asks his doctor if he had cancer, we find a similar line of discussion:

> 'Well, I can't tell conclusively from the ultrasound' – but that was definitely bullshit. Later that night, I opened the ultrasound up and I don't even read ultrasounds and I knew it was cancerous… And sure enough, my right testicle, lymph nodes in my abdomen and seventeen spots on my lung had cancer. Now that was problematic. (p. 25)

Lobel's dwelling on the word 'problematic' used by his doctor to explain his medical condition opens up for discussion this common practice of avoiding to name the disease in front of the patient. In a humorous way, he criticises this by suggesting that as a twenty-year-old young adult with no medical knowledge at all, he could tell he had cancer while his doctor, a specialist in the field, preferred to define it in an unprofessional public term. Humour, in this instance, stems from the obvious contradiction in the attitudes of the patient on the one hand and the doctor, on the other.

The way in which Lobel playfully treats the grim issue of illness may be disconcerting; however, his discourse is never disrespectful nor is it short of statements declaring his awareness of the magnitude of his experience. For instance, in underlining the absurdity of doctors' concern over his sexual capabilities under the circumstances, he says:

> Every doctor I saw reassured me that I would have a normal and healthy sex life… they seemed obsessed with my erectile function as if it were my heartbeat. I'm sorry but when they said the word cancer, the farthest thing from my mind was – *oh, no! Will I still have regular erections? Early-morning boners? Awkward semi-hard-ons?* I mean, cancer. (p. 23)

As discussed before, the fact that Lobel narrates a first-hand experience entitles him to stretch the premise on which he builds his story. He employs humour initially by drawing a comparison between erection and heartbeat – two incompatible organ functionalities in terms of vitality. What causes laughter, in the humour scholar John Morreall's (1987) words, "is simply the sudden perception of the incongruity between a concept and the real objects which have been thought through it in some relation, and laughter itself is just the expression of this incongruity." (p. 52)

Doctors' repeated attempt to reassure Lobel that he would still have a healthy sexual life is indeed incongruous in the face of a life-threatening disease. The common response to reassurance is a sense of relief and gratitude as it is an entirely humanistic strategy used, in this context, by doctors to relieve their patients from unnecessary aggravation and worry. However, Lobel uses his stretched liberty of expression to undermine this humanistic attitude, albeit in a humorous manner, by using words to define erection in an attempt to unearth the implications in doctors' reassurance. In doing so, he emphasises the occasional ludicrousness of the attitudes of medical staff and their practice of reassuring cancer patients about details which are only important if they actually manage to survive the disease.

In another example from his personal pathography, Lobel renders problematic the measured politeness and attentiveness he received from the health personnel out of consideration for his life-threatening illness. He informs us that once his condition was apparent after ultrasound detection at the hospital,

> Humanity was truly embracing me, which could only mean that in five days they were chopping off my right testicle. It's my somewhat cynical belief that in life, people are only unconditionally nice to two types of people, and those are beautiful people and cancer patients. I knew I hadn't become beautiful overnight… (p. 24)

Lobel's cynicism is not only befitting but also vital in giving way to a comprehension of the way cancer is perceived in public imagination. He presents the disease as comparable only to beauty, but in the case of the latter, others are fascinated by its power and the ocular pleasure it provides whereas the former frightens with its power to arrest bodies and minds demanding from others a level of respect and tolerance not short of pity.

Lobel's humorous criticism of the attitudes towards cancer patients is not only directed at the medical authorities. He extends the span of his critical approach to include others immediately surrounding the patient such as acquaintances, friends and family. For instance, he presents the likelihood of a cancer patient's uneasy position when faced with questions about discovering the tumour: "I, Brian Lobel, found my grand, life-changing lump while sitting in a hotel bathtub and pleasuring myself as I listened intently to an episode of the family television series *Seventh Heaven*." (p. 23) The rhetoric Lobel uses here is one of testimony. Highlighting the investigative nature of such questioning – be it intended or not – his words make explicit the clash between the rhetoric of his statement (response to a public investigation) and its content (private matter). His playful use of adjectives in describing his cancerous lump demonstrates an understanding that the people asking to hear about the moment of discovery are actually making a clandestine demand on the cancer patient for a 'grand, life-changing' story. While providing humour, Lobel's story of discovering his testicular lump also highlights the simple

fact that these stories peculiar to individual patients are hardly inspiring, despite the tendency to create the anticipated hyperbolic narratives.

The hyperbolic narratives, which often make use of a heroic discourse, aim to dignify the cancer patients in order to keep them motivated. Often these narratives are built around a military language describing cancer as a 'battle' or a 'fight' the 'brave' patient can 'win' with strength and resilience. Such discourse has only recently been contested, on the grounds that it is not the active choice of patients to be involved in a fight they may never be able to win. (see Granger, 2014; and Worland, 2014). This also means that if the disease eventually kills them, it does so by leaving them to be remembered, based on this wartime rhetoric, as losers. From the beginning of his performance, Lobel repeatedly attempts to transform this discourse into one free from such tendencies and expectations, and in so doing, he expands the space of illness narratives to include more possibilities. For instance, one of the recurrent points in his performance concerns Lance Armstrong, the American former professional cyclist who won the Tour De France seven times after his recovery from an aggressive form of testicular cancer. Armstrong's (2000) widely-cited assertion that "cancer was the best thing that ever happened to me" (p. 4) is striking in its conversion of an extremely negative situation into something positive. While his heroic stance against cancer may admittedly be inspiring to some, for some others it signifies a level of heroism impossible to match. Lobel criticises such expectations from the cancer patients sarcastically by referring to Armstrong:

> People think that the greatest possible achievement for a testicular cancer survivor is to win the Tour De France seven million times like Lance Armstrong. Well, that's a close second. In reality, however, the greatest possible achievement for a testicle-cancer survivor is… Does anybody know? (*Solicits answers from the audience. The first answer is inevitably 'To survive?' which is met with a laugh and a 'Not good enough!'*.) Nobody knows? To be fruitful and multiply – fathering two blond male progeny would of course, of course, be ideal. (p. 26)

Here Lobel emphasises what must otherwise be the bare truth: surviving the disease must be the only concern for the cancer patient who is both physically and mentally distressed enough as it is. Cancer myths have, nonetheless, constantly been constructed regardless of the pressure they may inflict upon the patients. Lobel takes issue with this alarming situation, and by utilising humour, asks his audience if surviving the disease is not demanding enough, what is? Setting unrealistic and extremely challenging goals for the patient based on the heroic narratives of some cancer survivors is unnecessary and could cause feelings of insufficiency in the patients when they least need it.

Lobel ends his performance by relating how, soon after he became a cancer survivor, he decided to compete against eight little children at The Indiana University-Purdue

University Indianapolis Hospital Stem Cell Transplant Reunion Picnic Hula Hoop Contest:

> But what do I win? Lance Armstrong got Tour De France, speaking gigs and a ghost writer named Sally Jenkins (who I'm pretty sure never had testicular cancer…), everyone else gets all this wisdom and depth that only derive from cancer, and what do I get? If I wasn't going to become a better person because of all of those procedures then I sure as hell better win some kind of competition. (p. 47)

Lobel's argument here is that there is yet another source of uncalled-for pressure on the cancer patients to experience a huge mental leap as a result of which s/he views the world in more constructive terms. Such is the 'inspiring' cancer saga of Lance Armstrong! This expectation from the sick person is related to "the romantic view… that **illness exacerbates consciousness.**" (Sontag, p. 36). Faced with the imminent possibility of death, cancer patients are expected to have a moment of epiphany wherein they are transferred to a new level of existence. Lobel makes it clear that he has not learned any such lesson from cancer. The feeling of insufficiency he has experienced highlights the incongruity of this expectation; the mystical value often attached to the disease is thus disputed. Lobel's criticism of these pressures formed by cancer narratives manifests itself even more clearly in his mention of Sally Jenkins, the author of Lance Armstrong's books on his cancer. By referring to the fact that the most inspiring testicular cancer narrative was written by a woman who could not possibly have comprehended how the disease and the treatment affect the patient, he renders problematic the credibility of cancer narratives that make sweeping claims about the patients and the disease.

Another cancer myth Lobel argues against in *Ball* is that there is "an urgent medical reason to embrace cancer with a smile: a 'positive attitude' is supposedly essential to recovery." (Ehrenreich, 2010). During treatment, he goes through extremely difficult times, but he keeps reminding himself "This is just the hard part, but don't worry Brian, your spirit, your spirit will get you through it" (p. 39; p. 40; p. 41). Lobel repeats the reassuring words most cancer patients hear from the people around them revealing his wish to believe them, but in the end he concludes that 'your spirit doesn't get you through shit… My spirit made me not kill myself or get angry about losing months of my life to a silly bump on my ball… period, end of sentence." (p. 44). Society may expect the cancer patients to transcend to a new level of understanding where the patients' positive attitude will effect a good result however, as Lobel's example evinces, these expectations turn into normative values imposed on to the patients compelling them to respond. Lobel responds to this imperative, in a humorous way, when he decides to compete against little children in a hula hoop contest mimicking the way Lance Armstrong won the Tour De France seven times. As he relates his thoughts and feelings during the contest, he starts

twirling a hula hoop on the stage. His extremely funny hula hoop experience merges feelings resulted by the pressure to win with insights like "If cancer didn't define who I was, then the pressure of Lance Armstrong-like success or masculinity would never even apply… I would just be me. And that was, surprisingly OK." (p. 51-52). Lobel, thus, finalises his performance by underlining that any cancer narrative would naturally relate the personal and subjective experience of the patient and constructing myths around the disease only overburdens the patients with unnecessary expectations.

As Frank Krutnik (2000) writes of comedians, "Thrown into conflict with the social codification of gender and sexuality, the body and identity, class and ethnicity, comedians inspire a disorderly rewriting of normative protocols" (p. 14). Viewed from this perspective, in *Ball*, Lobel attempts to rewrite the illness protocol by emphasising the need to halt producing myths around an extremely difficult human experience. His performance may be viewed in different ways: to some, they may be providing a fresh perspective on the issue of illness while others may consider them as the exploitation of a serious condition to evoke a series of feelings in the audience varying from pity and guilt to shock. Some may even feel as though Lobel trivialises an extremely severe state of suffering to draw laughter from his audiences, but it is difficult to ignore the fact that Lobel relates his very own story of cancer, which he has every right to approach in any way he likes. In the final analysis, his private story surely has wider implications as it connects to a universal landscape of suffering. If it is true that 'all of us, as we read, use the literary work to symbolize and finally to replicate ourselves' (p. 816) as Norman Holland (1975) asserts, then it could be suggested that Lobel's performances on cancer may transform both the cancer patients and people without disease, because his narratives are, in a way, performative manifestoes that thwart the norms enveloping cancer, implying that each patient has the right to deal with the disease in any way they want and need not succumb to the expectations from them.

Bibliography

[1] Armstrong, L. & Jenkins, S. (2000). *It's Not About the Bike: My Journey Back to Life*. London: Yellow Jersey.
[2] Bergson, H. (2005). *Laughter: An Essay on the Meaning of the Comic*. C. Brereton & F. Rothwell, (Trans.). Mineola, New York: Dover Publications.
[3] Billig, M. (2001). Humour and Embarrassment: Limits of 'Nice-Guy' Theories of Social Life. *Theory, Culture and Society*, 18(5) 23-43.
[4] Fainzang. S. (2016). *An Anthropology of Lying: Information in the Doctor-Patient Relationship*. London and New York: Routledge.
[5] Holland, N. (1975). Unity Identity Text Self. *PMLA*, 813-22.
[6] Krutnik, F. (Ed.). (2000). *Hollywood Comedians: The Film Reader*. London: Routledge.

[7] Lobel, B. (2012). *Ball and Other Funny Stories about Cancer*. London: Oberon Books.
[8] Morreall, J. (Ed.). (1987). *The Philosophy of Laughter and Humor*. Albany: State University of New York.
[9] Rosenberg, C. E. (1992). Framing Disease: Illness, Society, and History. C. E. Rosenberg. & J. Golden (Eds.), *Framing Disease: Studies in Cultural History*. New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press.
[10] Sontag, S. (1978). *Illness as Metaphor*. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux.
[11] Stacey, J. (1997). *Teratologies: A Cultural Study of Cancer*. London & New York: Routledge.

Internet Resources

[12] Ehrenreich, B. (2010, January 2). Smile! You've Got Cancer. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from https://www.theguardian.com/lifeandstyle/2010/jan/02/cancer-positive-thinking-barbara-ehrenreich
[13] Granger, K. (2014, April 2). Having Cancer is not a Fight or a Battle. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from https://www.theguardian.com/society/2014/apr/25/having-cancer-not-fight-or-battle
[14] Lobel, B. [blobelization]. (2016, December 4) Ball-Sperm Bank [Video File]. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=gFVZguEHZJk
[15] Worland, J. (2014, December 17). How Calling Cancer a 'Fight' or 'Battle' Can Harm Patients. *Time*. Retrieved from http://time.com/3636102/fighting-cancer/
[16] Brian Lobel's Webpage. Retrieved from http://www.blobelwarming.com/about/
[17] National Cancer Institute. Retrieved from https://www.cancer.gov/types
[18] World Health Organisation. Retrieved from www.who.int

ISSN 2411-9598 (Print)
ISSN 2411-4103 (Online)
European Journal of
Language and Literature Studies
July - December 2022
Volume 8, Issue 2

Why is Locke's Linguistic Theory Still Current and Interesting Today?

Alessandro Prato

Department of Political and Cognitive Social Sciences, University of Siena, Siena, Italy

Abstract

In the Essay Concerning Human Understanding (1690), Locke set out to offer an analysis of the human mind and its acquisition of knowledge still very current and important today. Locke offered also an empiricist theory according to which we acquire ideas through our experience of the world. The article examines Locke's views on language and his principal innovation in the field of linguistic theory, represented by the recognition of the power of language with respect to the classification of the world, and its relative independence from reality. In particular the following topics are discussed: a) the polemical contrast with Cartesian philosophy b) the criticism that Locke levels against innatism c) the function of abstraction of the mind d) the concept of semiotics as a theory of thought and its expression e) the radical concept of arbitrariness f) the pragmatic factor intrinsic to Locke's linguistics described as "communicational scepticism".

Keywords: language, arbitrariness of words, communication, signification, knowledge, semiotics

1. Introduction

The present article aims to illustrate the originality and importance of the *Essay Concerning Human Understanding,* published by Locke in 1690, by highlighting the innovativeness of its analysis of the functioning of the human intellect and of its intrinsic relation to language. This originality accounts for the profound influence the work exercised on the Enlightenment philosophy of language. The article will examine and discuss some of the fundamental issues addressed in the *Essay*: 1. the power of language with respect to the classification of the world, and its relative independence from reality; 2. the historicity and arbitrariness of linguistic signs, which Locke interprets in a way that is still relevant to the history of modern linguistic thought; 3. the theory of signs, which encompass both ideas, i.e. the

content of the reflecting human mind (*Phantasm, Notion, Species*" I/I, 8)[1], and words, i.e. the signs of these inner conceptions contained in the mind, which become associated with them to the point of replacing direct experience by virtue of the automatisms that social usage establishes between words and ideas.

2. The anti-Cartesian polemic

From the very first book of the *Essay*, aimed at refuting innatism, Locke closely engages with Cartesian philosophy, establishing a dialogue marked by elements of continuity, but also by criticism and disagreement[2]. For example, Locke agrees with Descartes that our existence is the primary certainty: "I think, I reason, I feel pleasure and pain: can any of these be more evident to me *than my own existence*?" (Locke 1690, IV/ IX, 3). However, unlike Descartes, Locke does not grant that thought is the essence of the soul; rather, he regards it as one of its functions or activities, which is sometimes at work and sometimes not. For Descartes, reason is a spiritual force that attains its highest degree of purity and self-sufficiency in intelligence, to the point that the philosopher identifies reason with the Divinity. Locke's perspective is very different, because he rejects this conception of reason as the shutting up of man within the realm of his own thoughts as a means to attain irrefragable truths. In its place Locke establishes secular reason, which is based on man's dealings with things, sets out from empirical data (provided by sense-perception), and is constantly influenced by circumstances as well as by the economic and social conditions on which the possibility of receiving a good education rests (Locke, 1690, IV/XVII).

From Locke's perspective, the use of rational operations never leads to definitive and irrefutable results; nor is this faculty identical in all men. Descartes (like Spinoza and Berkeley) denies that it is possible to understand the human spirit through the tools of immanent intelligibility, and affirms the dependence of human thought upon that of God, insofar as the former is only a reflection or miniature copy of the latter[3]. By contrast, according to Locke human consciousness must be analysed without making any reference to realities belonging to a higher order: it must be free from all theological implications. The rise of psychology, to which Locke provided a crucial contribution, was only ensured by the severing of this bond, which made it possible to scientifically investigate the psyche without the need for any reference to the spiritual model based on religious identity.

Locke's representation of individual consciousness as a *tabula rasa*, therefore, constituted a sort of initiation for psychology, which required the mind to be cleared of all pre-existing elements. Locke himself presented his work as a clearing process,

[1] In quotations from the text, the first two Roman numerals stand for the book and chapter, while the Arab numeral indicates the paragraph.
[2] See Hamman & Pecherman (2018).
[3] On this topic the thought of Chomsky (1988) is interesting.

as the removal of the scaffolding of metaphysics. He made no compromise with transcendence, so as to ensure an objective study of the principles and mode of operation of human intelligence. This study was exclusively conducted on the basis of a "historical plain method", where the adjective "historical" refers to a natural history inspired by Bacon.

Locke's philosophy, in other words, follows the descriptive method, which seeks not to investigate the essence, substance and substrate of phenomena, but rather to describe phenomena and symptoms, and to classify them in order to understand their mode of operation regardless of their essence. The very use of the term "symptom" betrays Locke's long-standing interest in medicine, an interest which he pursued both first-hand and through his friends' studies – for instance, Sydenham's theory about the interpretation of illnesses. Again in polemical contrast to Descartes, Locke suggests that instead of venturing into abstract research on what lies beyond experience and which therefore can only be inferred, we should keep to what manifests itself in our experience and can actually be analysed by reason, since to trace the limits of our capacity to judge things is precisely to consolidate the sphere within which it can legitimately be exercised. Thought is not transparent to itself: reflection makes us aware of our intellectual activity yet does not reveal its ultimate nature and essence. This way of framing the whole enquiry was later adopted by all Enlightenment philosophers. Hume, for example, fully agreed with this approach: he described his landmark work *A Treatise of Human Nature* (1739) as an attempt to introduce the experimental method of reasoning into moral arguments, and to apply the method of Newtonian physics to the mental space.

The criticism that Locke levels against innatism constitutes another significant difference compared to Cartesian philosophy: Locke rejects the belief that there are innate principles in the mind, which is to say principles that are explicitly or potentially present within it from birth: for example, the logical principle of non-contradiction ("A is not non-A"), mathematical principles (equality, proportion, etc.), and practical or moral principles such as the ideas of virtue, duty, goodness, and God. Locke's polemic against innatism rests on his belief that man does not possess any original or primary characters imprinted upon his mind from birth, because at the initial phase of its existence the mind is like a white sheet of paper, devoid of any characters or ideas (Locke 1690, II/I, 2). Only later, and very gradually, does the child start developing some ideas which do not entail anything innate but derive from just two sources or "fountains": sense-perception and reflection (or inner perception). There are no ideas in the mind except those which have been impressed upon it by these two sources constituting experience, which alone furnishes the "materials" of our reason. As later confirmed by the development of 18th-century epistemology – from Hume to Kant – there can be no use of the intellect apart from experience. Contrary to what Descartes maintains, reflection is part of experience: even though it is not really a sense, insofar as it has nothing to do

with external actions, it is something similar, which is why Locke (1690, II/I, 4) describes it as an "internal sense".

In rejecting innate ideas, Locke does not at all deny that a child can develop ideas already in the pre-natal phase – for example, that before birth it can receive some ideas through the impressions left upon it within the maternal womb by certain objects, or by bodily needs and discomforts. In fact, Locke hypothesises that the ideas of heat and hunger probably fall within these so-called "original" ideas (1690, II/IX, 6). However, these should not be confused with the aforementioned innate principles, since they are still produced by some impression made on the body, which is to say via sense-perception, whereas the principles in question are assumed to be of a completely different nature from the body and indeed independent of sense-perception.

For Locke this refutation of innatism also has political implications, since it is associated with a criticism of the concept of authority. The rejection of the notion of innate and incontrovertible principles thus goes hand in hand with Locke's political and religious liberalism:

And it was of no small advantage to those who affected to be masters and teachers, to make this the principle of principles — that principles must not he questioned. For, having once established this tenet — that there are innate principles, it put their followers upon a necessity of receiving some doctrines as such; which was to take them off from the use of their own reason and judgment, and put them on believing and taking them upon trust without further examination: in which posture of blind credulity, they might be more easily governed by, and made useful to some sort of men, who had the skill and office to principle and guide them. Nor is it a small power it gives one man over another, to have the authority to be the dictator of principles, and teacher of unquestionable truths (Locke, 1690, I/IV, 25).

Sense-perception lies at the origin of simple ideas that directly pertain to sensible experience, as in the case of the impression of a colour, or the perception of a flavour; they are suggested *to* – and not produced *by* – the mind, which progressively receives them, without playing any creative role. As correctly emphasised by Yolton (1985, p. 164-66), it is important to clearly grasp this concept of "passiveness", which has engendered so many misunderstandings. When Locke states that in receiving simple ideas the mind is passive, he is not saying that the stimulus reaches the mind without the latter coming into play at all, without the perceiving individual being active in any way. The very image of the mind in its original condition as a sheet of white paper on which nothing is written offers a clear alternative to the innatists' idea that the mind is full of ideas from birth, yet at the same time it proves misleading, if it is taken too literally and used to argue that the mind starts from scratch. In this whole section of the *Essay*, what Locke means by passiveness is involuntariness, whereby it is impossible for us to recall a flavour we have never tasted or to describe a colour we have never seen. When Locke states

that the mind is inactive when a flavour or smell comes to our awareness, what he means is that the mind cannot exercise the kind of active power it exerts when we perform an intentional movement such as picking up a book, moving a hand or averting our gaze; in all such cases we are active in the proper sense, as we perform such movements by choice (Locke 1690, II/IX, 10). These simple ideas are the "materials" of all processes of knowledge, since the intellect stores, repeats or compares them, combining them into an almost endless array of complex ideas, such as the conceptions of "beauty", "man", "horse" and "gratitude".

For Locke the organisation of mental reality finds its regulatory principle in the notion of *association of ideas*, an expression that also occurs as the title of a chapter of the *Essay* (Book II ch. XXXIII). Through association, the elementary ideas, which are separate from one another, are organised into coherent wholes within our present experience, as well as through the remembrance of the past and the investigation of the future. This principle is also central to Hume's psychology, where it takes the form of a *geography of the mind*: the mind is seen as a flat surface whose layout can be determined with a fair degree of accuracy and reliability.

Upholding the dualism of body and soul, Descartes had argued that mind and matter do not share the same ontological nature. Locke derives linguistic consequences from this premise: representation is no longer considered to be analogous to what it represents, so that for example there is no longer any resemblance between a circle and the idea of a circle. Ideas are conceived as mental elements, as entities that cannot be spatially located; thoughts become signs of the same nature as phonemes: arbitrary signs. This break was to have momentous consequences for the modern philosophy of language: only on this basis was it possible to conceive language (and thought) as an arithmetical or algebraic calculation, as Hobbes, Leibniz and Condillac did[1]. The system of ideas or knowledge thus becomes a complex of historical-cultural choices that can never be laid out once and for all, since it is always open to change. The classes by which we classify the world do not correspond to the species that actually exist in nature. Therefore, we must abandon the illusion that ideas and names are guaranteed by real essences:

the mind in mixed modes arbitrarily unites into complex ideas, such as it finds convenient; whilst others that have altogether as much union in nature, are left loose, and never combined into one idea, because they have no need of one name. It is evident then, that the mind, by its free choice, gives a connexion to a certain number of ideas, which, in nature, have no more union with one another, than others that it leaves out (Locke, 1690, III\V, 6).

3. Language and knowledge

Human experience as a whole falls within the sphere of signs, as regards both the subjective act of knowing and the inter-subjective act of communicating. Mental

[1] On the history of linguistic ideas see De Mauro & Formigari (1990).

categorisation, therefore, is a semiotic activity in itself. According to Locke's way of framing the matter, semiotics is a theory of thought and its expression, since the activity of thinking can only take place in the mind if the latter has a material and sensible medium[1]. Signs are the means of ensuring this connection between the intellectual activity and the material element. For this reason, in the closing chapter of Book IV of the *Essay*, devoted to the distinction of three different species of science, alongside natural philosophy – which deals with the knowledge of things with respect to their essence, constitution and properties – and ethics – which instead consists in the search for those norms that make our conduct just and expedient – Locke posits semiotics, or the "doctrine of signs", which he identifies with logic:

the third branch may be called Semeiotike, or the doctrine of signs; the most usual whereof being words, it is aptly enough termed also Logike, logic: the business whereof is to consider the nature of signs, the mind makes use of for the understanding of things, or conveying its knowledge to others. For, since the things the mind contemplates are none of them, besides itself, present to the understanding, it is necessary that something else, as a sign or representation of the thing it considers, should be present to it: and these are ideas. And because the scene of ideas that makes one man's thoughts cannot be laid open to the immediate view of another, nor laid up anywhere but in the memory, a no very sure repository: therefore to communicate our thoughts to one another, as well as record them for our own use, signs of our ideas are also necessary: those which men have found most convenient, and therefore generally make use of, are articulate sounds (Locke, 1690, IV/XXI, 4).

In such a way Locke reveals that the study of language can shed light on the workings of the spirit and that the analysis of ideas is necessary in order to understand their mode of composition and transformation, and at the same time to investigate the limits of the intellect. What is being inaugurated here is a line of philosophical thought apart from which even Kantian criticism would be unthinkable[2].

Most of our vocabulary is made up of general terms and this, in Locke's view, is due not to chance, but to reason and necessity, given that a language consisting of personal names would exceed the limits of human memory. Moreover, the generality of a name ensures its intelligibility, enabling it to refer to ideas that are to some extent common to both the speaker and the listener: without general ideas and

[1] Formigari (1988, p. 173-95) remains a fundamental study on Locke's theory of language. See too Aarsleff (1982), Yolton (1985), Dunn (1986), Auroux (1988), Taylor (1990), Yolton (1993), Ayers (1997), Formigari (2004), Pritchard (2013), Stuart (2015) Prato (2017) and Thiel (2018).
[2] For an overview of the semiotic-linguistic ideas of the Enlightenment, I have chiefly taken account of: Aarsleff (1982; 1987), De Mauro - Formigari (1990), Auroux (1993), and Formigari (2017).

terms we would be left with a series of idiolects rather than a language. If all things in nature are particulars, then we can only experience this or that particular individual; however, in the vocabulary of languages words do not refer to particular entities, but designate more or less broad classes of meanings. This is the case, for instance, with the word "man", which refers to a whole class of individuals who fall within the common definition of man:

For, since all things that exist are only particulars, how come we by general terms; or where find we those general natures they are supposed to stand for? Words become general by being made the signs of general ideas: and ideas become general, by separating from them the circumstances of time and place, and any other ideas that may determine them to this or that particular existence. By this way of abstraction they are made capable of representing more individuals than one; each of which having in it a conformity to that abstract idea, is (as we call it) of that sort (Locke, 1690, III/III, 6).

The concept of abstraction is crucial for the whole subsequent development of Locke's theory and had already been introduced in Book II:

This is called ABSTRACTION, whereby ideas taken from particular beings become general representatives of all of the same kind; and their names general names, applicable to whatever exists conformable to such abstract ideas. Such precise, naked appearances in the mind, without considering how, whence, or with what others they came there, the understanding lays up (with names commonly annexed to them) as the standards to rank real existences into sorts, as they agree with these patterns, and to denominate them accordingly. Thus the same colour being observed to-day in chalk or snow, which the mind yesterday received from milk, it considers that appearance alone, makes it a representative of all of that kind; and having given it the name whiteness, it by that sound signifies the same quality wheresoever to be imagined or met with; and thus universals, whether ideas or terms, are made (1690, II/XI, 9).

Generality is the precondition for intersubjectivity, and hence for language itself, which necessarily comes into being through a process of abstraction. To abstract is to separate an element from its context: whiteness is never found in isolation, but represents that simple idea of a sensible quality to be found, for instance, in the milk we drank yesterday. Once we have done away with everything that connects the idea in question to that particular situation, it becomes representative of all the other similar qualities to be found across a wide range of elements we experience. The process of abstraction lies at the root of the formation of general ideas and of the signs that represent them, which is to say general terms (Locke, 1690, II/XI, 9). The function of abstraction of the mind, then, may be viewed as the criterion distinguishing human beings from animals: whereas according to Locke the other mental faculties (memory, discernment, and judgement) are common to all living beings, who no doubt possess them in different ways and to different degrees (1690,

II/X, 1-2 and II/XI, 1-2), only the faculty of abstraction is proper to man. Hence, there are no grounds to rule out the possibility that animals have some kind of notion pertaining only to the particular ideas they have received from their senses (1690, II/XI, 11). This leads Locke to address the long-standing issue of whether animals have some kind of language. This is a particularly important topic, considering the theoretical context within which it had been raised by 18th-century rationalists: a context in which the Scholastic identification of rationality with the immortal soul was deeply rooted and in which Descartes – in his *Discours de la methode* (1637) – had upheld a clear-cut distinction between animals and men, denying the former any form of language and creativity[1]. Assigning animals a particular form of language, albeit a much less developed one – which is precisely what Locke does, by once again distancing himself from Descartes – means freeing reason from all theological scaffolding and regarding man as different from animals only by degrees rather than essence. It also means framing the relationship between body and soul in new terms, by considering the possibility that matter might exercise more than merely a passive function with respect to knowledge.

Generality or universality does not belong to the real essence of things but to the activity of the intellect. Here we can appreciate the difference between Locke's concept of abstraction and that developed by Scholastic philosophy, which he polemically opposes precisely because he does not believe that the human intellect can grasp the real essences of things. By creating abstract ideas and designating them with names, human beings "enable themselves to consider things, and discourse of them, as it were in bundles" (Locke, 1690, III/III, 20); and this aids the arrangement of representations and the way they are communicated. The general ideas thus formed are the nominal essences of things, which is all that we can know. The real essences of things – whose existence we must certainly assume, since they are the origin of the sensible qualities on the basis of which we distinguish and classify things – are unknown to us. If constant and indissoluble causal nexuses exist that run through the substantial structure of reality, these can only be identified by God's intellect, and not by man. In any case – and most importantly – they do not contribute to the mechanism of signification. For Locke – as for Hume – concepts are relations between ideas and not actual "materials".

For all these reasons, the concept of the arbitrariness of signs takes on a completely different significance for Locke from the one it had previously been assigned: instead of referring only to the indifference of the sound with respect to the thing it designates – and without concerning the concept itself, which actually serves as an intermediary within the general scheme of knowledge precisely because it is free from arbitrariness – it involves the formation and number of the ideas designated by

[1] Locke's ideas on animal communication are confirmed by the most recent research, for example De Waal (2016): a passionate and convincing case for the sophistication of nonhuman minds.

the name, and which are found to be an arbitrary classification of reality. Locke thus questions the idea of the isomorphism between the linguistic level and the ontological one as the precondition for the existence of a non-arbitrary scheme of mediation. Whereas according to traditional metaphysics the relation between objects and the mind's knowledge of them is one of pure identity, given that the concept in the mind is the thing itself, according to Locke the relation between an idea and its external referent is purely nominal; although the nominal essence depends on and originates from the real essence, it is neither the same nor similar to it, but possesses a different character insofar as it is a sign or name. Acknowledging the problematic nature of the reference of words to things, Locke aims to overcome what – in his view – had been the underlying fallacy of Scholastic knowledge: the assumption that it is possible to attain reality starting from words, by envisaging reality as a sum of preordained meanings that only await to be assigned their respective linguistic signs.

The process of abstraction is a minimal one for simple ideas, whose names cannot be defined, since their definition would entail the breakdown of such ideas into simpler elements, which in turn could further be broken down, and so on *ad infinitum*. On the other hand, these names are the least controversial ones because they can be "explained" ostensively. The maximum degree of abstraction is instead to be found in relation to the names of mixed modes or relations that stand for combinations of ideas arbitrarily construed by men, and which therefore do not correspond to any real object in nature (as in the case of moral or juridical terms). Examples would be linguistic expressions such as "parricide", "sacrilege", "gratitude", "justice", "adultery", "homicide", etc. In the case of such combinations of ideas, the nominal essence and the real essence coincide. The name here is the only guarantee of the relative persistence and unity of the idea.

Abstraction, however, also comes into play in relation to the names of substances: for although these stand for complex ideas, which ought to correspond to real objects in nature, they are open collections that can constantly be enriched by new discoveries; hence, they do not constitute real essences that can be defined once and for all, in such a way to infer from their definition all the qualities and attributes of the corresponding objects. We thus use different names to distinguish water and ice, which are the same substance, yet do not do the same with molten gold and solid gold: this would not be possible if the nominal essences here coincided with the boundaries set by nature. Through ideas, or nominal essences, we certainly record characteristics that are concomitant in nature and the object of our perception; yet the choice of which and how many characteristics to make pertinent is arbitrary and contingent. Still, the fact that the procedures for the formation of ideas are arbitrary does not mean that they are unmotivated: on the contrary, Locke emphasises precisely the pragmatic motivations guiding our mind through this operation. What are established are only those ideas whose names human beings need, or which are useful for attaining knowledge. This theory of Locke will be confirmed by Jean

Itard's writings documenting the program of linguistic re-education of Victor de l'Aveyron, a wild child found in France at the end of the eighteenth century[1]. Victor was inclined to connect each linguistic sign with one and only one thing located in some place. For example, to his eyes, the word *book* always denoted a particular book, the concrete object of his experience and not a member of the class of objects indicated by this linguistic sign. In other words, Victor could not understand the symbolic function of the linguistic sign: for him every word was a "proper name" and not a general term denoting a multiplicity of referents. Victor found it very difficult to understand and master the process of abstraction, so well described by Locke, the process which presides over the constitution of institutional signs and represents the precondition for inter-subjectivity.

Through the theory of general names Locke newly addresses the old-standing question of the establishment of genera and species. He adopts the critical and innovative position put forward by Robert Boyle, to whom Locke was connected by bonds of friendship and collaboration, as a prominent member of the Royal Society of Sciences – founded in London in 1660, also thanks to his contribution – and as the promoter of the Boyle lectures[2]. In 1666 Boyle had published the essay *The Origin of Forms and Qualities according to the Corpuscular Philosophy*, in which he criticised the doctrine of substantial forms and explained natural phenomena on the basis of the two great principles of matter and motion. Locke was strongly influenced by Boyle's conception of nature, even before fully devoting himself to philosophical speculation. Like Boyle, he wished to avoid introducing metaphysical assumptions in the study of science. Besides, in Locke's theory the very concepts of "idea", "substance", "primary quality" and "secondary quality" are defined in a way that is closely reminiscent, even from a terminological perspective, of the definitions provided by Boyle in his essay *The Origin of Forms and Qualities* (1666). Here, among other things, Boyle had affirmed the inconsistency of the Scholastic concept of form: form is not a real substance, but only matter itself regarded from the point of view of what might be defined as its "specific or denominating state"; hence, it is not the substantial form that distinguishes the various classes of bodies. And it is precisely the relative independence of nominal essences from the world that makes names the element of continuity by which the intellect can systematise notions; it is precisely the use of names that makes knowledge possible (Locke, 1690, III/III, 19).

4. Communication is a problematic process: a discussion

Collections of ideas vary from one interlocutor to the next, meaning that different people will have different "nominal essences" of the same object: collections of particulars that are not necessarily the same for all interlocutors. We thus have a full acknowledgement of the dynamic character of the nominal essence, which ultimately also configures itself as the meaning of the name. This nominal essence is

[1] See Lane (1976).
[2] See Aarsleff (1982, p. 144-50).

the result of a conceptual choice designed to meet certain needs in terms of representation and communication, and conditioned by current linguistic usages. The emphasis is no longer on the stability of the relation between sign and concept, but on its unstable and ever-changing character.

The very possibility of communication is thereby always subject to the risk of misunderstanding, of incommunicability. It is very difficult to reach an agreement in discussions because the communication often occurs between subjects who use names with different meanings, as they attach different representations to the same words, which bear the imprint of their own particular way of being. In order to avoid misunderstandings, it would be necessary for the interlocutors to analyse the terms they intend to use, in such a way as to agree on their meanings beforehand and clarify the range of simple ideas encompassed by each complex idea. But this process is difficult to accomplish in the communicative praxis we all engage in. How, then, can we make ourselves understood when talking with others? Locke answers this questions by providing a pragmatic solution: we should talk as though the nominal essences were stable and identical for both the speaker and his interlocutor. This implicit pact is what enables all acts of communication; as it is not given once and for all, it must constantly be negotiated.

This problematic conception of communication, which sees it not as a linear, one-dimensional process, but rather as an interactive process that often yields uncertain and contradictory outcomes, was to become common in the modern philosophy of language. Steiner (1981) noted that every communication process can therefore justifiably be regarded as a form of translation, which makes it difficult, if not impossible, to find two human beings that use words and syntax to mean the same things. Rather, each person will refer to his own cultural level and private linguistic repertoire, which reflects his unique and irreducible identity. The pragmatic factor intrinsic to Locke's linguistics – what Taylor (1992) has described as "communicational scepticism" – was later be taken up again by Hume, who assigned the imagination the task of bringing out the full semantic power of names:

As the individuals are collected together, and placed under a general term with a view to that resemblance, which they bear to each other, this relation must facilitate their entrance in the imagination, and make them be suggested more readily upon occasion (…) Nothing is more admirable, than the readiness, with which the imagination suggests its ideas, and presents them at the very instant, in which they become necessary or useful. The fancy runs from one end of the universe to the other in collecting those ideas, which belong to any subject (Hume, 1740, p. 105).

The issue of communicational scepticism extends to that of the imperfections of words, which derive from the arbitrariness of our categorisation procedures – not from the arbitrariness of the sound of words. Hence they are proper to the names of complex ideas, rather than simple ones. Furthermore, these imperfections are found to the highest degree in the names of mixed modes, in particular ethical and political

terms. Common usage is a sufficient factor of stability for ordinary discourse, but not for scientific discourse, where we must often resort to definitions in order to clarify the semantic range of the terms we are employing.

Semantic asymmetry manifests itself in an even more prominent way in the transition from one language to another. Natural languages themselves lead people to classify the world in contrasting ways. The differences between them are not just a matter of sounds and signs, but of world view. A comparison between different natural languages thus shows how practical motivations give rise to ideas of mixed modes which do not coincide – or only apparently coincide – from one language to another. This explains the diversity of languages, which according to Locke is a phenomenon intrinsic to the very nature of language and human cognitive devices – by contrast to a long-established tradition that, through the myth of the Tower of Babel, had seen this diversity as a divine curse or at any rate as a condition of inferiority to be overcome.

Conclusion

To conclude, it may be argued that Locke's *Essay Concerning Human Understanding* has the merit of analytically showing how our mind works with regard to the cognitive process and what a fundamental role language plays within it. The topics and problems that Locke investigates with originality and rigour concern important aspects of the contemporary philosophy of language and semiotics. For example: the semantic indeterminacy, the radical concept of arbitrariness, the function of abstraction of the mind, the theory of thought and its expression, the pragmatic factor intrinsic to Locke's linguistics that we can describe as "communicational scepticism" and the difference between human language and the communication systems used by animals. For this reason the Lockian philosophy continues to to be of utmost importance even for modern readers, making his thought open to promising future developments.

References

[1] Aarsleff, H. (1982). *From Locke to Saussure.* Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
[2] Aarsleff, H. (1987). (ed) *Papers in the History of Linguistics.* Amsterdam-Philadelphia: Benjamins.
[3] Auroux, S. (1988). Le paradigm lockien et la philosophie du langage. *Revue international de la philosophie,* 42\165, 133-49.
[4] Auroux, S. (1993). *La logique des idées*. Montréal-Paris: Bellarmin-Vrin.
[5] Ayers, M. (1997). *Locke.* London: Orion.
[6] Boyle, R. (1666). *The works of Robert Boyle.* London: Pickering & Chatto, 1999.
[7] Chomsky, N. (1988). *Language and problems of knowledge.* Cambridge Mass: The Mitt Press.

[8] De Mauro, T. & Formigari, L. (1990). (eds) *Leibniz, Humboldt and the origins of comparativism*. Amsterdam-Philadelphia: Benjamins.
[9] Descartes, R. (1637). *Discours de la mehode.* Paris: PUF, 1990.
[10] De Waal, F. (2016). *Are we smart enough to know how smart animals are?* London: Granta Books.
[11] Dunn, I. (1986). *Locke.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.
[12] Formigari, L. (1988). *Language and Experience in 17th century British Philosophy.* Amsterdam-Philadelphia: Benjamins.
[13] Formigari, L. (2004). *A History of Language Philosophies.* Amsterdam-Philadelphia: Benjamins.
[14] Formigari, L. (2017). Theory and history of theory. A few notes on linguistic historiography. *Paradigmi,* XXI\1, 157-65.
[15] Hammon, P. & Pecharman, M. (2018). (eds) *Locke and Cartesian Philosophy.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.
[16] Hume, D. (1740). A *Treatise of human nature.* London: Penguin Books, 1985.
[17] Lane, H. (1976). *The wild boy of Aveyron.* Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
[18] Locke, J. (1690). *Essay concerning human understanding.* Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1975.
[19] Pritchard, T. (2013). Locke and the primary signification of words: an approach to word meaning. *British Journal for the history of philosophy*, available online: http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/09608788.2013.771611.
[20] Prato, A. (2017) La teoría lockiana del lenguaje. *De Signis*, 25, 107-116.
[21] Steiner, G. (1981). *After Babel.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.
[22] Stuart, M. (2015). (ed) *A companion to Locke.* Oxford: Blackwell Publishing Ltd.
[23] Taylor, T.J. (1990). Liberalism in Lockean Linguistics. *Historiographia Linguistica*, XVII, 50-73.
[24] Taylor, T.J. (1992). *Mutual misunderstanding.* London: Duke University Press.
[25] Thiel, V. (2018). (ed) *Locke: Epistemology and metaphysic.* Abingdon-on-Thames: Taylor and Francis Ltd.
[26] Yolton, J.W. (1985). *Locke: an introduction.* Oxford: Blackwell Publishing Ltd.
[27] Yolton, J.W. (1993). *A Locke Dictionnary.* Oxford: Blackwell Publishing Ltd.

The Frequency and Use of Communicative Verbs *Show, Speak, Talk & Argue* Within Adverbial Clauses in Written and Spoken Discourse

Božana Tomić

PhD, Assist. Prof., Faculty of
Philology, Slobomir P University

Abstract

The focus of this paper is on usage of communicative verbs show, speak, talk and argue within adverbial clauses. Since adverbial clauses are used to realize time, place, manner and contingency semantic categories, the main goal of this paper is to illustrate the use of adverbial clauses that have communicative verbs show, speak, talk, and argue as verbals. The aim is to analyze the frequency and distribution of the verbs show, speak, talk and argue in all types of adverbial clauses. We will also present similarities and dissimilarities of their use in the specific adverbial clauses, and show the specific features of their use within each type of adverbial clause. We will also determine the most frequent type of adverbial clause in each register. The goal is also to present certain features of the selected verbs along with their practical use in spoken and written language. Except that, we will also determine the most frequently used subordinators that introduce all types of adverbial clauses, their use and distribution across analyzed corpus.

Keywords: communicative verbs, adverbial clauses, distribution, frequency, subordinators

1. Introduction

Carter (2005) states that adverbial clauses act as modifiers in or of the main clause (p. 560). They specify circumstances such as manner, time, frequency, place, degree, reason, cause, and condition. In Longman's terms (1999), adverbial clauses, both finite and non-finite, are used to realize time, place, manner, and contingency semantic categories (p. 818).

Quirk (1985) states that adverbial clauses function mainly as adjuncts and disjuncts (p. 1068). Furthermore, he says that in their potentiality for greater explicitness, they are more often like prepositional phrases (Quirk, 1985, p.1048).

Đorđević (2007) divides adverbial clauses into clauses of manner, clauses of place, clauses of time, clauses of contingency, clauses of degree, clauses of condition, clauses of concession, reason clauses, clauses of purpose, clauses of result, clauses of comparison and similarity, clauses of exception, clauses of proportion, clauses of contrast, clauses of preference and comment clauses (p. 730).

Given that semantic analysis of adverbial clauses is complicated by the fact that many subordinators introduce clauses with different meanings, we will analyze each type of adverbial clause in context, and present results according to the primary meaning of their subordinator in context.

As we already stated, communicative verbs *show, speak, talk* and *argue* within adverbial clauses are the subject of this research, the analysis itself is related to the frequency, use and distribution of these verbs within each type of adverbial clauses.

2. Methodology

The corpus used for this research consists of 800 000 000 words and is made of three registers. The analyzed corpus is made of newspaper columns of The Guardian (politics, economy, culture, technology, sports and COVID-19) analyzed during the period 2017-2021, as well as the selections of texts from American and British novels, and, transcriptions of speech of various celebrities from the film industry, political scene and sports (2015-2019) taken from the official BBC website. Each one of the above-mentioned corpuses contains 1 million words. During the analysis, we combined qualitative, quantitative, and comparative methods. Qualitative and quantitative methods provide results regarding the frequency of the use of adverbial clauses and their subordinators, while the qualitative method enables us to emphasize the characteristics of each verb used in a specific type of adverbial clause, as well as all the differences and similarities between analyzed register, and their syntactic features.

3. Results and Discussion

Adverbial clauses are not frequently used in the analyzed written and spoken discourse. More precisely, 888 examples of adverbial clauses are registered in our material, which takes up only 0,01 of the total word count (8 million words). Table 1 presents the total frequency of each subclass of adverbial clauses in written and spoken discourse. Based on the Table 1, time clauses are most frequently used with 449 examples found. Reason clauses (98) and conditional clauses (86) are almost equally used in our material. Concessive (66), clauses of place (56), and manner clauses (32) are less frequent.

Frequency of adverbial clauses	
Clauses of Manner	32
Clauses of Place	56
Clauses of Time	449
Clauses of Contingency	-
Clauses of Degree	1
Clauses of Condition	86
Clauses of Concession	66
Reason Clauses	98
Clauses of Purpose	13
Clauses of Result	25
Clauses of Comparison & Similarity	13
Clauses of Exception	2
Clauses of Proportion	4
Clauses of Contrast	20
Clauses of Preference	7
Comment Clauses	16

Table 1: Frequency of adverbial clauses in written and spoken discourse

Clauses of contrast (20), comment (16), clauses of purpose (13) and clauses of similarity & comparison occur almost equally, while clauses of preference (7), proportion (4), exception (2) and degree clauses (1) are rare. Clauses of contingency are not found in our corpus.

When it comes to different registers, the use of adverbial clauses varies, as shown below.

Adverbial clauses across corpus								
	Economy	Culture	Politics	Sport	Technology	Short stories	Speech	COVID-19
Clauses of Manner	3	8	3	4	4	5	1	4
Clauses of Place	3	18	7	4	14	5	5	-
Clauses of Time	43	63	50	52	58	75	57	51
Clauses of Contingency	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Clauses of Degree	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	-
Clauses of Condition	11	7	10	8	11	7	12	20
Clauses of Concession	11	9	9	10	8	10	-	9
Reason Clauses	14	9	12	6	13	4	28	12
Clauses of Purpose	-	1	-	-	3	4	-	5
Clauses of Result	1	1	1	4	4	5	6	3
Clauses of Comparison & Similarity	1	1	1	4	4	2	-	-
Clauses of Exception	-	-	-	-	-	1	1	-
Clauses of Proportion	-	2	-	1	-	-	1	-
Clauses of Contrast	7	2	3	1	3	1	-	3
Clauses of Preference	1	-	3	-	2	-	1	-
Comment Clauses	-	4	3	-	-	-	1	8
TOTAL	95	125	102	94	124	119	114	115

Table 2: Frequency of adverbial clauses across corpus

Adverbial clauses are almost equally used in the texts on culture and technology, followed by short stories, speech and COVID-19. They are less frequent in politics,

economy, and sport. The use of time clauses is the most dominant in short stories (75), while they are almost equally used in other corpora. Reason clauses are dominant in speech (28), almost equally represented in economy, technology, COVID-19 and politics, while they are rare in other corpora. Conditional clauses are the most frequent in COVID-19, and they are almost equally used in other corpora. Clauses of place are most frequently used in culture, followed by technology; they are less frequent in other corpora while they are not used in COVID-19. The rest of adverbial clauses occur almost equally in all registers. What is common for all analyzed verbs is that neither of them is used within clauses of contingency.

As for individual communicative verbs that are the subject of our analysis, most frequently used verb is the verb *show* with 307 examples, followed by the verbs *talk* (284) and *speak* (237), while the verb *argue* (60) is less frequent.

Based on the results presented in Table 4, the verb *show* is most frequently used in time clauses (127), and the greatest number of examples is registered in COVID-19 (27) and economy (24), less is other corpora, while it is rare in speech (6). Conditional clauses are less frequent (48), and occur most frequently is COVID-19 (16). Reason clauses (37) are the most dominant in economy, rare in other corpora, and they are not used in short stories. Concessive (26) and manner clauses (26) are equally represented. While concessive clauses are the most frequent in economy, manner clauses are dominant in culture. It is common for both of these clauses that they are not used in speech.

Show								
	Economy	Culture	Politics	Sport	Technology	Short stories	Speech	COVID-19
Clauses of Manner	2	8	3	4	4	1	-	4
Clauses of Place	-	6	-	-	5	1	1	-
Clauses of Time	24	16	13	10	18	13	6	27
Clauses of Contingency	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Clauses of Degree	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Clauses of Condition	6	1	6	5	7	4	3	16
Clauses of Concession	7	4	3	5	2	1	-	4
Reason Clauses	12	5	3	2	6	-	2	7
Clauses of Purpose	-	1	-	-	-	3	-	-
Clauses of Result	1	-	1	2	1	2	3	1
Clauses of Comparison & Similarity	-	1	1	1	-	1	-	-
Clauses of Exception	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Clauses of Proportion	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Clauses of Contrast	1	2	1	1	1	1	-	1
Clauses of Preference	1	-	-	-	1	-	1	-
Comment Clauses	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

Table 4: Frequency of the verb *show* within adverbial clauses across corpus

Other clauses are rare. The verb *show* does not occur in clauses of contingency, degree, exception, proportion and comment clauses.

The verb *talk* is less used within adverbial clauses in the analyzed corpus. As seen from Table 5, this verb is most frequently used within time clauses (162), and they are most dominant in speech, followed by short stories. Time clauses occur almost equally in culture and politics, while they are not frequent in other corpora.

Reason clauses are less frequent with 40 examples found, and most of them are registered in speech, while they are not used in economy. Clauses of place (23) are the most frequent in culture and technology, while they don't occur in the texts on COVID-19.

Talk								
	Economy	Culture	Politics	Sport	Technology	Short stories	Speech	COVID-19
Clauses of Manner	1	-	-	-	-	1	1	-
Clauses of Place	2	6	2	2	6	1	4	-
Clauses of Time	4	28	24	7	14	31	44	10
Clauses of Contingency	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Clauses of Degree	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Clauses of Condition	3	1	1	1	2	3	5	2
Clauses of Concession	1	3	1	3	-	3	-	1
Reason Clauses	-	3	5	1	3	2	21	5
Clauses of Purpose	-	-	-	-	2	1	-	2
Clauses of Result	-	1	-	1	1	1	2	2
Clauses of Comparison & Similarity	-	-	-	2	1	-	-	-
Clauses of Exception	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	-
Clauses of Proportion	-	1	-	1	-	-	1	-
Clauses of Contrast	1	-	1	-	-	-	-	-
Clauses of Preference	-	-	3	-	-	-	-	-
Comment Clauses	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	-

Table 5: Frequency of the verb *talk* within adverbial clauses across corpus

Conditional (18) and concessive clauses (12) don't occur frequently, and while conditional clauses are almost equally used in all registers, concessive clauses don't occur in technology and speech. The rest of adverbial clauses are not frequent, while clauses of contingency and degree clauses don't combine with the verb *talk.*

Based on the results in Table 6, the verb *speak* is also dominant within time clauses (137), and the greatest number of examples is found in sport, less in short stories and technology, while they are not frequently used in other corpora.

Reason clauses are less frequent (19), and while they are not dominant in other corpora, not even one example of reason clauses is found in COVID-19.

Speak								
	Economy	Culture	Politics	Sport	Technology	Short stories	Speech	COVID-19
Clauses of Manner	-	-	-	-	-	3	-	-
Clauses of Place	1	4	5	2	2	3	-	-
Clauses of Time	9	19	9	34	23	28	7	8
Clauses of Contingency	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Clauses of Degree	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	-
Clauses of Condition	2	5	1	2	2	-	2	2
Clauses of Concession	-	1	4	1	4	6	-	1
Reason Clauses	2	1	3	3	3	2	5	-
Clauses of Purpose	-	-	-	-	1	-	-	3
Clauses of Result	-	-	-	1	2	1	-	-
Clauses of Comparison & Similarity	1	-	-	1	2	1	-	-
Clauses of Exception	-	-	-	-	-	1	-	-
Clauses of Proportion	-	1	-	-	-	-	-	-
Clauses of Contrast	4	-	-	-	2	-	-	-
Clauses of Preference	-	-	-	-	1	-	-	-
Comment Clauses	-	4	-	-	-	-	-	1

Table 6: Frequency of the verb *speak* within adverbial clauses across corpus

Clauses of place and concessive clauses are equally used with 17 examples respectively, and while clauses of place are not used in speech and COVID-19, concessive don't occur in speech and economy. Conditional clauses (16) are dominant in culture, while they are not used in technology. Other adverbial clauses are not frequent.

Comparing to the first 3 verbs, the verb *argue* is rarely used with only 60 examples found. As shown in Table 7, this verb is most frequently used within time clauses (23). Time clauses are equally used in economy and COVID-19, while the verb *argue* doesn't occur within time clauses in culture and speech.

Argue								
	Economy	Culture	Politics	Sport	Technology	Short stories	Speech	COVID-19
Clauses of Manner	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Clauses of Place	-	2	-	-	1	-	-	-
Clauses of Time	6	-	4	1	3	3	-	6
Clauses of Contingency	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Clauses of Degree	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Clauses of Condition		-	2	-	-	-	2	-
Clauses of Concession	3	1	1	1	2	-	-	3
Reason Clauses	-	-	1	-	1	-	-	-
Clauses of Purpose	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Clauses of Result	-	-	-	-	-	1	1	-
Clauses of Comparison & Similarity	-	-	-	-	1	-	-	-
Clauses of Exception	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Clauses of Proportion	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Clauses of Contrast	1	-	1	-	-	-	-	2
Clauses of Preference	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Comment Clauses	-	-	3	-	-	-	-	7

Table 7: Frequency of the verb *argue* within adverbial clauses across corpus

Concessive clauses are dominant in economy, while they don't occur in short stories and speech. Out of 10 examples of comment clauses found, 7 occur in COVID-19 and 3 in politics.

The rest of adverbial clauses are not frequent. The verb *argue* doesn't occur within manner, clauses of contingency, degree clauses, purpose, exception, proportion and clauses of preference.

As we already mention, **Time clauses** are widely used in our corpus. These clauses combine with our verbs in 449 examples, and as it can be seen from Table 8, they most frequently occur with the verb *talk* (162), followed by verbs *speak* (137) and *sho*w (127), while they are not frequent with the verb *argue* (23).

Time Clauses				
	talk	***speak***	***show***	***argue***
Economy	4	9	24	6
Culture	28	19	16	-
Politics	24	9	13	4
Sport	7	34	10	1
Technology	14	23	18	3
Short Stories	31	28	13	3
Speech	44	7	6	-
COVID-19	10	8	27	6
TOTAL	**162**	**137**	**127**	**23**

Table 8: Frequency of communicative verbs *talk, speak, show* & *argue* within time clauses across corpus

The clauses are the most frequent in speech with the verb *talk,* followed by the corpus of sport with the verb *speak;* while they are not used in culture and speech with the verb *argue.*

The commonest subordinator that introduces time clauses is the subordinator *when* (see the Table 9 below) with all verbs and 258 examples found. This subordinator is most frequently combined with the verb *talk* (115) in speech (38), followed by culture (19), short stories (19), and politics (17).

Time Subordinators				
	show	***talk***	***speak***	***argue***
when	50	115	80	13
after	46	6	18	6
as	5	13	18	1
while	3	9	9	3
before	12	7	6	-
whenever	-	1	3	-
since	3	3	1	-
once	1	2	-	-
as soon as	-	3	2	-
as long as	2	1	-	-
until	4	2	-	-
till	1	-	-	-

Table 9: Frequency of time subordinators

In the corpus with the verb *speak*; this subordinator is most frequent in sport (23) and short stories (20), while it is less used in other corpora.

With the verb *show,* this subordinator is most frequent in culture (19), while with the verb *argue* it is mostly used in economy (5), and it doesn't occur in speech, sport and culture.

The subordinator *after* occurs 76 times, and it is most frequent with the verb *show* (46), almost equally presented as the subordinator *when.* The greatest number of examples with the verb *show* is found in COVID-19 (19) and economy (12). This subordinator combines 18 times with the verb *speak* (mostly in sport and culture), while it is equally used with verbs *talk* and *argue* (6 times respectively).

The subordinator *as* occurs frequently with the verb *speak* (18), followed by the verb *talk* (13). This subordinator rarely combines with verbs *show* and *argue.*

The subordinator *while* is not frequently used and occurs 9 times with the verbs *talk* and *speak,* respectively, 3 times with the verbs *show* and *argue,* respectively. The conjunction *before* combines only with the verbs *show* (12), *talk* (7) and *speak* (6) and the subordinator *since* occurs with the same verbs: *show* (3), *talk* (3) and *speak* (1).

Subordinators *until, once* and *as long as* combine only with the verbs *show* and *talk*, while, on the other hand, subordinators *as soon as* and *whenever* occur only with verbs *speak* and *talk.* The subordinator *till* occurs only with the verb *show.*

As already stated, the verb *talk* is used in time clauses mainly in speech. The most numerous subordinator that introduces time clauses with this verb is the subordinator *when.* Interestingly, in the corpus of speech, in almost all examples found, the verb *talk* occurs twice in complex sentences, although we found that the verb *talk* also occurs twice within the same time clause:

Does your desire to fictionalize those stories you registered in your new novel, The Merry-Co-Round, have any bearing on a notion of Betty's in Davies: "She had often thought that when he was talking about himself he was talking about her too"?

When used with the subordinator *when,* the verb *talk* occurs with pseudo-intransitive complementation and the preposition *about,* which functions as a verb complement in the language of speech and culture As for other prepositions performing the same function, only a few examples of the preposition *to* are found in both corpora:

"But when there's something else to talk about, and there's something that's connecting people right in front of him, then that really really helps."

On the other hand, in short stories the preposition *to* performs the function of prepositional complement in almost all examples found, while the preposition *about* is rare:

'She gave it to me.' Ellie never called Magda by her name when talking to Robert; she didn't have to.

Unlike the verb *talk*, the verb *speak* occurs with more diverse prepositional complements—in the clauses introduced by subordinator *when*. A variety of prepositions such as *to*, *of*, *with*, *on* and *about* are registered in the corpus of short stories:

And when you spoke of Seaford in that lingering way, how happy you had been there with that dippy potter woman, I thought that would be clean at least.

In speech, the verb *speak* occurs with the compelmentation *speak +* to + NP + about + NP (a), while in culture this verb is used with the complementation *speak +* NP *+ to +* NP (b):

a) *When I speak to her about it, she so, so wants it to happen.*

b) *It starts in 1963 with the March on Washington when King spoke immortal words to more that 200,000 people from the steps of the Lincoln Monument.*

In the languge of sport, within time clauses introduced by the subordinator *when* the verb *speak* often occurs in the form of gerund*:*

Yet, when speaking to the 39-year-old Englishman about an Open appearance in his home country, his excitement is palpable.

The verb *show* less frequently combines with the subordinator *when.* In the language of short stories, technology and COVID-19, the verb *show* occurs in non-finite forms. While in short stories and technology, this verb is used in the form of *to*-infinitive (a), in the corpus of COVID-19, it occurs in the form of gerund (b):

a) *It seemed she was as aware of him as I was: she put her arm around my shoulders and talked in the loud and lively way people do when they want to show others that they are having a good time.*

b) *Yet still key workers can't get tested – even when they start showing symptoms – to confirm whether they pose a risk, either to those they help or to their own families.*

Although, the verb *argue* is not frequently used, it is still possible to emphasize certain characteristics of its use within time clauses with the subordinator *when.* In almost all examples in economy, adverbial clauses of time with the subordinator *when* are combined with nominal *that*-clauses (a), except in one example where instead of subordinate *that*-clause, it occurs the combination with non-personal subject (Quirk, 1985, p. 214) (b):

a) *Chadha says the Bank is manufacturing its own vicious circle when it argues that weak growth must lead to low interest rates for longer.*

b) *Soriot was on firmer ground when he argued there's more to AstraZeneca's pipeline and new products than just Mystic.*

Also, in the corpus of economy, *when* imply repetitiveness, and it is synonymous with *whenever* (Quirk, 1985, p. 1083):

It can also be seen when wealthy pensioners argue that the government should maintain the state pension as a universal benefit and even continue paying the winter fuel allowance.

Although the subordinator *after* is less frequent, this subordinator in the corpora with the verb *show* is almost equally represented as the subordinator *when,* and the greatest number of examples is registered in COVID-19 (19) and economy (12). In the majority of examples in the corpus of COVID 19, the verb *show* occurs in non-finite form, i.e. the form of gerund (a), while in all examples in economy, it is used in finite form, usually in the past simple tense (b):

a) *About a week after the cat's owner started showing symptoms, the cat also developed breathing difficulties, diarrhoea and vomiting, and subsequent tests by vets at the University of Liège showed the animal was infected with coronavirus.*

b) *Oil prices gyrated earlier in the day after US government data showed a surprise drop in domestic crude stockpiles for a fourth week in a row.*

In politics and sport, the verb *show* combines with the catenative construction with *appear to*:

a) *Labour has demanded answers from the government after leaked letters appeared to show ministers were repeatedly warned that fire regulations were not keeping people safe in high rise blocks like Grenfell Tower.*

This subordinator is less frequently used with the verb *speak* (18), and it is found in sport (4) and culture (4). In sport, the verb *speak* occurs within multi-word

construction, i.e. in the form of the phrasal verb *speak out,* and in the same corpus, this phrasal verb is combined with the preposition *against:*

Varnish claimed she was dismissed after speaking out against coaching decisions but the report stops short of this conclusion.

The verb *talk,* in almost all examples found, occurs in non-finite form, more precisely, in the form of gerund, while in this combination, the preposition *to* usually performs the function of the prepositional complement:

"After talking to the Arts Council and lawyers," says Biscuit, "it turned out that we wouldn't legally be allowed to use a funding grant in that way.

Time clauses introduced by the subordinator *after* and with the verb *argue,* in the texts on COVID-19 and sport usually occurs in non-finite form. Thus, in the corpus of COVID-19, this verb is used in the form of *to*-infinitive (a) and gerund (b), while in sport it only occurs in the form of gerund (c):

a) And some commentators are already lining up to argue that after this, the climate crisis will be pushed aside and business will have a clearer case against government regulation.

b) Julian Assange was denied bail after arguing he is at risk of contracting the virus in the British prison where he is being held.

c) Docked a point after arguing with Alves, he called for the supervisor.

The rest of the subordinators found is less frequent, while subordinators *directly, immediately, now (that), so long as, whilst* are not registered in the analyzed material.

Reason clauses are less frequent (98 examples), and most of the examples are found with the verb *talk*, followed by the verb *show.* Table 10 presents that these clauses are not frequently used with the verb *speak*, and that they occur in only two examples with the verb *argue.*

Reason Clauses				
	talk	***show***	***speak***	***argue***
Economy	-	12	2	-
Culture	3	5	1	-
Politics	5	3	3	1
Sport	1	2	3	-
Technology	3	6	3	1
Short Stories	2	-	2	-
Speech	21	2	5	-
COVID-19	5	7	-	-
TOTAL	**40**	**37**	**19**	**2**

Table 10: Frequency of communicative verbs *talk, speak, show* & *argue* within reason clauses across corpus

The most frequent use of these clauses is found in speech with the verb *talk,* less in all other corpora, while they are not used in economy with the verbs *talk* and *argue*, short stories with the verbs *show* and *argue*, COVID-19 with the verbs *speak* and *argue,* and culture with the verb *argue.*

As for subordinators introducing reason clauses, the most frequent one is the subordinator *because* (68), less used is the subordinator *as* (28), and there are only one examples of subordinators *now (that)* and *since* found, respectively. As seen from Table 11, there is a difference in the most frequent subordinators used with different verbs.

Thus, the subordinator *because* is more frequently used with the verbs *talk* and *speak*, while it is not used with the verb *argue*, and the subordinator *as* is more frequent with the verb *show.*

Reason Clauses Subordinators				
	talk	***show***	***speak***	***argue***
because	36	15	17	-
as	2	22	2	2
since	1	-	-	-
now (that)	1	-	-	-

Table 11: Frequency of reason clauses subordinators

In speech, the verb *talk* (20) is chiefly found in the clauses introduced by the subordinator *because.* In other texts it is less used with the same verb, for example it is not used in short stories. In speech, the verb *talk* almost always occurs with the preposition *about*, that performs the function of the prepositional complement, while the preposition *to*, performing the same function, is found in only 2 examples:

JEFFREY BROWN: I'm curious now, because you were talking about short stories, and one thing I didn't know about you — I know your novels, but I didn't, until I was just reading about this prize, you wrote crime fiction under a pseudonym?

In addition, in the same corpus, the verb *talk* occuring with the complementation *talk + about +* NP is premodified with the adjunct of universal frequency *always*, adjunct of high frequency *often,* adjunct of low frequency *never,* and exclusive subjunct *just:*

I now know something I never knew because it was never talked about, that on the eve of my third birthday, she was in a psychiatric institution having electroshock treatment.

In the corpus with the verb *speak*, this subordinator mostly occurs in speech (5), while in COVID-19 is not used at all. Like the verb *talk,* the verb *speak* is mainly used

with the complementation *speak + to +* NP, where the verb *speak* is premodified with the time-relationship subjunct *still:*

Most classics are classics for a reason, because they contain stories that still speak to us, stories that endure.

In the corpus with the verb *show*, this subordinator is mostly used in technology, and it usually occurs in the complementation with the *that*-clause, that performs the function of a direct object:

Testing without drivers is also critical because studies have shown that in partial automation, where a human is still behind the wheel, it can be difficult for a driver to stay engaged.

The subordinator *as* is most frequent in the corpus with the verb *show*, and it is mostly used in economy (12), less in COVID-19 (5), while it is not used in speech, sport and short stories. In economy, this verb often occurs with the complementation *show + that*-clause (a). The complementation *show +* NP is less frequent (b):

The ratings agency said there were signs of "renewed tremors" from the result of the UK's EU referendum on 23 June while the election of Trump as US president showed that political risk remained significant.

The government's spending deficit is on course to worsen this year as official figures show the economic slowdown is beginning to take a toll on the UK's public finances.

Within these clauses introduced by the subordinator *as,* the verb *show* occurs with the complementation *show* + *wh*-clause in the COVID-19:

"I was expecting to hear back but I heard that the government has been inundated with volunteers which is great news as it shows what we can do as a country when we come together."

Subordinators *since* and *now (that)* are respresented with only one example respectively, and occur in economy (*since*) and politics (*now (that*), while subordinators *in view of the fact that* and *seeing (that)* don't occur with our verbs.

There are 86 examples of **Clauses of condition** in our corpus, and the verb *show* is mostly used within them (48). Verbs *talk* and *speak* are less used within these clauses, while only a few examples of verb *argue* are found within these clauses. As resprented in Table 12, the most frequent use of these clauses is found with the verb *show* in COVID-19, while it is less used with other verbs.

Conditional Clauses are not found in short stories with the verb *speak,* and in most of the corpus with the verb *argue.* As the analysis has shown, the function of conditional clauses perform conditionals. The most frequent type of conditional is open condition (53), hypothetical condition is less frequent (21), while the indirect

conditional is only found in technology with the verb *show.* One example of mixed conditional is also found in economy with the verb *speak.*

Conditional Clauses				
	show	***talk***	***speak***	***argue***
Economy	6	3	2	/
Culture	1	1	5	/
Politics	6	1	1	2
Sport	5	1	2	/
Technology	7	2	2	/
Short Stories	4	3	/	/
Speech	3	5	2	2
COVID-19	16	2	2	/
TOTAL	**48**	**18**	**16**	**4**

Table 12: Frequency of communicative verbs *talk, speak, show* & *argue* within conditional clauses across corpus

The verb *show* appears in open conditional 28 times, with the greatest number of examples in in the texts on COVID-19 (5), and none in culture. Less frequently, *talk* occurs with this conditional (12), and it is almost equally used in all corpora. The same number of examples is found with the verb *speak* (12), where it is not used in sport and short stories. In the corpus with the verb *argue,* the open conditional is only found in speech and politics. Hypothetical condition is less frequent and it occurs rarely in all corpora with the verb *show* except in speech, culture and politics with the verb *talk*. In the coprus with the verb *speak,* this conditional occurs only in sport and speech, while it is found only in speech and politics with the verb *argue.*

The only subrodinators introducing conditional clauses are subordinators *unless* and *given*. The subordinator *unless* occurs in all corpora with the verb *show* except in short stories, and only one example of this subordinator is found in speech with the verb *talk.* In the conditional clause with the subordinator *unless* in technology, the verb *show* combines with the central modal verb *could:*

When Pistorius first applied to run in the Olympics, IAAF rules said that runners using prosthetics would be allowed to compete against able-bodied athletes unless the IAAF could show that the athlete received an unfair advantage over other athletes not using prosthetics.

The subordinator *given* is registered in only 2 examples in economy with the verb *show*:

That was a hypothetical example, obviously, given that data from Money facts shows a third of savings accounts now earn less than the 0.25% base rate. Even so, Haldane should keep banging on about numeracy.

Subordinators *as long as, assuming (that), if only, in case, in the event (that), just so (that), on condition (that), providing/provided (that), so long as* and *suppose/supposing (that)* are not found in the analyzed material.

Clauses of concession, with 66 examples found, are also not frequent in the analyzed corpus. As it can be seen from Table 13, verb *show* usually occurs within this type of clauses 26), and the other verbs less.

Clauses of Concession				
	show	***talk***	***speak***	***argue***
Economy	7	1	/	3
Culture	4	3	1	1
Politics	3	1	4	1
Sport	5	3	1	1
Technology	2	/	4	2
Short Stories	1	3	6	/
Speech	/	/	/	/
COVID-19	4	1	1	3
TOTAL	**26**	**12**	**17**	**11**

Table 13: Frequency of communicative verbs *talk, speak, show* & *argue* within conditional clauses across corpus

The most dominant use of these clauses is registered in economy with the verb *show* as their verbal, less in other corpora, while it is not used in speech with neither of our verbs. The list of subordinators introducing clauses of concession is given below.

Concessive Subordinators				
	show	***talk***	***speak***	***argue***
although	14	3	9	3
while	6	3	4	7
even if	3	2	2	/
even though	3	3	2	/
whereas	/	1	/	1

Table 14: Frequency of concessive subordinators

The most frequent subordinator is *although* (29), followed by the subordinator *while,* and subordinators *even though* (8), *even if* (7) and *whereas* (2) are less frequent. The verb *show* occurs in clauses introduced by subordinator *although* usually in sport (5), where the verb *show* is combined with the catenative construction *appear to:*

After their attack, Dumoulin called the Colombian and the Italian out for what he viewed as underhand conduct, although television images appeared to show Quintana and Nibali waiting initially as the race leader chased, fruitlessly.

In short stories, the verb *speak* is premodified with the adjunct of low frequency *never* and manner adjunct *directly.* As for other adverbials, in the same corpus, we registered manner adjunct *proudly* and time-relationship subjunct *yet:*

And although they never spoke directly to each other, Charlie kept joining in the conversation in an odd, once-removed manner.

When these clauses are introduced by the subordinator *while,* then the verb in the clause is *argue,* usually in technology (3) and COVID-19 (3). Within concessive clauses, the verb *argue* is often combined with central modals. In politics, this verb is combined with the central modal *might,* while in technology, it occurs with the central modal *could*, and in technology, it is used with the modal *can:*

a) While some might argue that it's what a person says that counts, they might change their minds when MPs start rocking up for government votes in beach shorts, with a skateboard tucked under their arm, to go down to the park later.

Other subordinators are not frequent, while subordinators *if* and *whilst* are not registered in our corpus.

Clauses of place are not frequent in our corpus (56). As a verbal, the verb *talk* occurs in 23 examples of these clauses, verb *speak in* 17, verb *show* in 13, and verb *argue* only in 3 (Table 15).

Clauses of Place				
	talk	***speak***	***show***	***argue***
Economy	2	1	/	/
Culture	6	4	6	2
Politics	2	5	/	/
Sport	2	2	/	/
Technology	6	2	5	1
Short Stories	1	3	1	/
Speech	4	/	1	/
COVID-19	/	/	/	/
TOTAL	**23**	**17**	**13**	**3**

Table 15: Frequency of communicative verbs *talk, speak, show* & *argue* within clauses of place across corpus

The most frequent use of these clauses is registered in culture and technology with the verb *talk* and culture with the verb *show* (6 examples in each). Interestingly, like concessive clauses, clauses of place are not used in speech with any of the analyzed verbs.

The only subordinator introducing clauses of place is the subordinator *where.* In all examples, the verb *talk* occur with pseudo-intransitive complementation *talk +* PP. The most frequent preposition that has the function of prepositional complement is the preposition *about* (13). The preposition *to* is less frequent (7). Prepositions that also perform the function of prepositional complement in the corpus with the verb *talk* are *with* & *into (e*conomy), *off* & *of* (technology):

The fear stems from a passage in the Bible's book of Revelation, where it talks of the mark of the beast on the forehead or right hand.

The subordinator *wherever* is not registered in our corpus.

Verb *show* occurs in **Manner clauses** 26 times, while verbs *speak* and *talk* occur 3 times each. The verb *argue* does not occur within these clauses.

With the verbs *show,* these clauses are most frequent in culture (8), while they are not used in speech. With the verb *talk*, manner clauses occur with one example in short stories, speech and economy, while with the verb *speak* are used only in short stories (3).

The most frequent subordinator is the subordinator *as* (23), and all examples found are used with the verb *show.* These clauses are most frequently used in culture (6), and less in other corpora. In culture, the verb *show* occurs with the complementation *show* + NP + *wh*-clause:

"Do you know what we used to do?" is the motif, as Bishop shows us how he first chatted up his wife, or (good routine, this one) how hard it used to be to start a car.

The subordinator *as if* occurs in culture (2) and short stories (1) with the verb *show,* short stories (1) and economy (1) with the verb *talk*, and in short stories with the verb *speak* (3). The subordinator *as though* occurs only in speech with the verb *talk* as verbal.

Clauses of result are not used frequently, and out of 25 examples registered, 11 is found in the corpus with the verb *show*, 8 with the verb *talk,* 4 with the verb *speak,* and only 2 examples with the verb *argue.* In the corpora with the verb *show*, 3 examples are found in speech, 2 in short stories and sport, respectively, and one example in the corpus economy, politics, technology and COVID-19, while they are not used in culture. In the corpus of speech, the verb *show* occurs in the form of *to*-infinitve, and has the function of adjective complementation:

Sometimes you have different challenges, so it's nice to show different sides and show different parts of your game.

In the corpus with the verb *talk*, clauses of result are used in speech (2), COVID-19 (2), and only one example in short stories, sport, technology and culture respectively, while it is not used in economy and politics. In the corpus with the verb *speak,* these clauses are used only in technology (2), sport (1), and short stories (1).

The most frequent subordinator is the subordinator *so* (23), the subordinator *so (that)* is found only in technology (1) and short stories (1) with the verb *speak,* while the subordinator *such* (*that)* is not found in the analyzed material.

Clauses of contrast are also not frequent. Out of 20 examples found, 8 is registered with the verb *show,* 6 with the verb *speak,* 4 with the verb *argue*, and 2 with the verb *talk.* In the corpus with the verb *show,* these clauses occur in culture (2), and all the other corpora with one example respectively, except in speech where clauses of contrast are not used. In the corpus with the verb *speak,* these clauses are found in economy (2), and technology (2). With the verb *argue*, clauses of contrast are used in COVID-19 (2), economy (1), and politics (1), while with the verb *talk*, we found in politics (1) and economy (1).

In our corpus, these clauses are mainly introduced by the subordinator *while* (19), while the subordnator *whilst* is found only in shorts stories (1) with the verb *show.* In culture, the verb *show* occurs with the complementation *show +* NP as direct object, where the NP consists of coordinated complex noun phrases:

One stand interprets "digital traces" in the city, like text messages and phone calls, in the form of abstract sounds, while another shows footage of flashmobs and protests in the Arab spring, both apparently the product of the internet and public space.

The subordinator *whereas* doesn't occur in our corpus.

Comment clauses are found with the verb *argue* (10), *speak* (4), and the verb *talk* (1). In the corpus with the verb argue, these clauses are found in COVID-19 (7) and politics (3), with the verb *speak* in culture (4) and COVID-19 (1), and with the verb *talk* in the corpus of speech. Interestingly, almost all examples found with the verb *argue* occur in the final position, except 2 examples that are used in the medial position. All examples of these clauses with the verb *speak* occur within the phrases *so to speak*, while the only one example in the speech with the verb *talk* is used in the medial position:

She said, 'I completely respect the mandate Jeremy has for the membership,' as you've been talking about, 'but in 7 Andrew Marr Show, 10th July, 2016 – JEREMY CORBYN I/V order to lead Labour in Westminster he has to have a parliamentary mandate too,' and you don't.

Clauses of purpose are found in the corpus with the verb *talk* (technology-2, COVID-19-2, short stories-1), the verbs *speak* (COVID-19-3, technology-1) and *show* (short stories-3, culture-1). The most dominant subordinator introducing these clauses is the subordinator *so that* (7), while subordinators *so* (3 in COVID-19 with the verb *speak* and 2 in technology and COVID-19 with the verb *talk*) are less frequent, and the subordinator *in order so* occurs only in technology (1) with the verb *talk:*

Launched way back in 2000, a naive age when people bought mobile phones in order to talk to each other, the handset is still famed for its lengthy battery life, structural solidity and Snake II.

Clauses of Comparison and Similarity occur with the verb *speak* (technolohy-2, sport-1, short stories-1, economy-1), the verb *show* (culture-1, politics-1, short stories-1, sport-1), the verb *talk* (sport-2, technology-1), and the verb *argue* (technology-1). The most frequent subordinator is subordinator *as well as* (technology with the verb *argue,* technology with the verb *talk, technology* with the verb *speak,* culture, politics and short stories with the verb *show*). In culture with this subordinator, the verb *show* follows the compelmentation pattern *show* + NP + *wh*-clause:

As well as showing you how to make the tonkotsu ramen that made him famous, it tells you his life story and explains in detail what it's like to open a restaurant, which I'd love to do myself at some point.

Subordinators *more than* (4), *as far as* (1), *less than* (1), *as qualified as* (1) are rare, while subordinators *as many as, as much as, fewer than, as good/fit/heavy/ large/better/heavier/larger/longer/more fit than, as far as, as long/soon/sooner/further than* are not used in our corpus.

Clauses of preference are found in the corpus with the verb *talk* (politics-3), the verb *show* (economy-1, speech-1, technology-1) and only one example is registered in technology with the verb *speak.* The only subordinator that marks clauses of preference is the subordinator *rather than*, while the subordinator *sooner than* is not found. Interestingly, in all 3 examples found in politics, the verb *talk* occurs in the form of gerund:

Rather than talking about the government's plans for the economy, he chose to spend his time at the dispatch box telling the Commons why no one should believe a word that was in the Labour manifesto.

Clauses of proportion are found only with the verbs *talk* and *speak*. The verbs *talk* combines with these clauses in the corpus of culture, sport and speech-one example per each corpora. Two examples of clauses of proportion are introduced by the structure *the more...the more* (culture and sport), while one example occurs with the structure *the more...the better* (speech). The verb *speak* occurs once within clauses of proportion in the corpus of culture and this example is introduced by the structure *the more...the more:*

We are backstage at the Barbican, the London Symphony Orchestra's home venue, and the more Rattle talks the more it seems clear that he sees "making things better" as not only a possibility but a responsibility.

Clauses of exception are very rare and we found only two examples combining with the verbs *speak* and *talk* respectively. In the corpus of short stories with the

verb *speak*, this clause is introduced by the subordinator *except that* and the verb *speak* is in negative form, while in the corpus of speech with the verb *talk,* this clause is marked by the subordinator *but that.*

Except that this voice was not speaking in Paul's broken Sahib-Hindi: it was colloquial, racy, freely mixed with Punjabi curse words.

Clauses of contigency are not combined with communicative verbs *show, speak, talk* and *argue* in the analyzed material.

Conclusion

Communication verbs *show, speak, talk* and *argue* are not frequently used within adverbial clauses. In our corpus, we registered 888 examples of adverbial clauses, which takes up only 0,01 of the total word count (8 million words).

As for individual verbs, most frequently used verb is the verb *show* with 307 examples, followed by the verbs *talk* (284) and *speak* (237), while the verb *argue* (60) has the lowest frequency in the analyzed corpus.

Clauses of time represent the most frequent subclass of adverbial clauses, which are frequently used with all four verbs of communication, but they are most dominant with the verb *talk.* The most dominant subordinator introducing these clauses is the subordinator *when.*

Reason clauses also combined with all verbs, but they are most numerous in corpus with the verb *talk*. The most frequent subordinator that is made of these clauses is the subordinator *because.*

Clauses of Condition occur with all verbs, but they are most frequently used with the verb *show.* The most dominant type of conditional is open conditional while hypothetical and indirect conditionals are not frequent.

Clauses of concession are not frequent, and are mostly used with the verb *show*, and less with other verbs. The most dominant subordinator in our corpus is the subordinator *although.*

Analyzed verbs are not frequently used within clauses of place. The greatest number of examples occur with the verb *talk,* and the only subordinator introducing these clauses in our corpus is the subordinator *where.*

Manner clauses are used only with the verbs *show, speak* and *talk*. The most dominant conjunction marking manner clauses is the subordinator *as.*

Although not frequent, all analyzed verbs are registered within clauses of result, while the most frequent subordinator is the subordinator *so.*

Clauses of contrast are also not frequently used with our verbs. In our corpus, these clauses are mainly introduced by the subordinator *while.*

Comment clauses only combine with the verbs *argue, speak* and *talk,* while clauses of purpose only occur with the verbs *talk, speak* and *show.*

Our verbs are not frequently combined with clauses of comparison & similarity, and the most frequent subordinator used is the subordinator *as well as.*

Clauses of preference are found with the verbs *talk*, *show* and *speak*, while clauses of proportion occur only with the verbs *talk* and *speak*. Similarly, only verbs *speak* and *talk* are registered within clauses of exception.

Clauses of Contigency are not combined with communicative verbs *show, speak, talk* and *argue* in the analyzed material.

Taking into consideration that communicative verbs within adverbial clauses are not extensively examined, we consider that this paper will give a significant contribution to research of other verb classes within adverbial clauses in the English language.

Literature

[1] Biber, D., Johansson, S., Leech G., Conrad S., & Finegan E. (1999). *Longman Grammar of Spoken and Written English*. London: Longman.
[2] Biber, D. (1988). *Variation Across Speech and Writing*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
[3] Carter, R., & McCarthy, M. (2006). *Cambridge Grammar of English: A Comprehensive Guide to Spoken and Written Grammar and Usage*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
[4] Cinque. G. (1999). *Adverbs and Functional Heads A Cross-Linguistic Perspective.* New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
[5] Đorđević, R. (2007). *Gramatika engleskog jezika*. Beograd: Čigoja štampa.
[6] Ford, E., & C. (2009). *Adverbial Clauses in American English Conversations*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
[7] Gruyter, W. (1996). *Adverbial Subordination: A Typology and History of Adverbial Subordinators Based on European Languages.* Berlin: De Gruyter Mouton.
[8] Haegeman, L. (2012). *Adverbial Clauses, Main Clause Phenomena, and Composition of the Left Periphery.* New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
[9] Haumann, D. (1997). *The Syntax of Subordination*. Niemeyer: Tubingen.
[10] Hetterle, K. (2015). *Adverbial Clauses in Cross-Linguistic Perspective.* De Gruyter Mouton ed.
[11] Kortmann, B. (2012). *Adverbial Subordination (Empirical Approaches to Language Typology, 18)*. De Gruyter Mouton, Reprint 2012 ed. edition (November 14, 1996).
[12] Lewis, M. (1986). *The English Verb: An Exploration of Structure and Meaning.* Heinle ELT.

[13] Quirk et al. Quirk, R., Greenbaum, S., Leech, G., & Svartvik, J. (1985). *A Comprehensive Grammar of the English Language*. Longman.
[14] Radford , A. (2012). *English Syntax: An Introduction.* Cambridge*:* Cambridge University Press.
[15] Radford, A. (2009)*. Analysing English Sentences: A Minimalist Approach (Cambridge Textbooks in Linguistics) 1st Edition.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
[16] Tortora, C. (2018). *Understanding Sentence Structure: An Introduction to English Syntax (Linguistics in the World).* Wiley-Blackwell.
[17] Greenbaum, S., & Quirk, R. (1990). *A Student's Grammar of the English Language*, Harlow: Longman.
[18] Corpus resources
[19] Allan, N. (2010). *Flying in the Face of God and Higher Up*. Interzone 227. Ely, Cambs: TTA Press.
[20] Barnes, J. (2004). *The Lemon Table*. London: Johnatan Cape.
[21] Barnes, J. (2011). *Pulse*. London: Johnatan Cape.
[22] Constantine, D. (2015). *In Another Country: Selected Stories*. Manchester: Comma Press.
[23] Gaiman, N. (2006). *Fragile Things: Short Fictions and Wonders.* London: HarperCollins.
[24] Hall, S. (2010). *Butcher's Perfume.* London: BBC Worldwide Limited.
[25] Hall, S. (2017). *Madame Zero*. London: Faber & Faber Ltd.
[26] Ishiguro, K. (2001). *A Village After Dark*. New York: The New Yorker.
[27] Ishiguro, K. (2009). *Nocturnes: Five Stories of Music and Nightfall.* New York: Afred A. Knopf.
[28] Lessing, D. (2003). *The Grandmothers: Four Short Novels*. London: HarperPress.
[29] Marek, A. (2012). *The Stone Thrower*. Manchester: Comma Press.
[30] McGregor, J. (2012). *This Isn't the Sort of Thing That Happens to Someone Like You*. London: Bloomsbury Publishing Plc.
[31] Oyeyemi, H. (2010). *My Daughter the Racist*. Bath: AudioGO Ltd, BBC Worldwide.
[32] Prawer Jhabvala, R. (2004). *My Nine Lives: Chapters of a Possible Past*. Washington,
[33] DC: Shoemaker & Hoard.
[34] Prawer Jhabvala, R. (2011). *Aphrodisiac*. New York: The New Yorker.
[35] Prawer Jhabvala, R. (2011). *A Lovesong for India: Tales from East and West*. Berkley: Counterpoint.
[36] Royle, N. (2017). *Best British Short Stories 2017*. London: Salt Publishing Ltd.
[37] https://www.theguardian.com/
[38] https://www.bbc.com/news/live/uk-42116319
[39] http://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/articles/3hshxFhHM4dKd3px6Q3NzRF/transcripts

[40] http://www.asapsports.com/show_interview.php?id=136570
[41] https://www.rollingstone.com/
[42] https://storgy.com/
[43] https://www.npr.org/sections/music-interviews/
[44] http://www.businessinsider.com/
[45] http://www.bookslut.com/
[46] https://charlierose.com/
[47] https://pando.com/

Critical Factors that Enhance the Effectiveness of Online Communities of Practice: EFL Coordinators' Patterns of Involvement - The Greek EL Teachers Cops Professional Development Paradigm

Katerina Kourkouli

National and Kapodistrian University of Athens

Abstract

The paper examines Greek EFL Coordinators' involvement in online Communities of Practice (CoPs) in terms of its impact on participating teachers' professional development. The study focuses on four online CoPs hosting 49 Greek EFL teachers as participants and four Greek EFL Coordinators, using an online platform named *2gather* developed by the National and Kapodistrian University of Athens in the context of a national in-service professional development project in Greece. The study involves investigating the Coordinators' patterns of involvement and their trainees' response using a mixed-methods approach which combines quantitative and qualitative research as collective case studies of the four groups. Differentiations between the four Coordinators' reported patterns of involvement and teachers' reported effectiveness of their CoP training experience enables us to identify critical factors that contribute to the enhancement of effectiveness. A comparison of the Coordinators' and their trainees' responses per online CoP highlights the factors that have supported teachers' reported reconstruction of knowledge and practices and the reported effectiveness of the CoP training experience regarding their everyday teaching practice. The findings contribute to furthering our understanding of effective online CoPs implementation in the context of continuing professional development.

Keywords: professional development, adult training, online communities of practice, effective coordination, effective implementation, design and development principles

Introduction

Teachers' professional development is increasingly being seen from a lifelong learning perspective in terms of providing teachers with opportunities and incentives for professional development throughout their careers. Such

opportunities enable teachers to refresh, develop and expand their knowledge base and understanding of teaching as well as to improve their skills and practices (Schleicher, 2016). From this point of view, investment on teachers' professional development (PD) portrays as a priority of education policies directed at the development of human capital so that teaching and learning in schools is up to date and effective (Timpereley et al, 2008). PD can encompass a range of forms, from formal courses and seminars to workshops, online training, mentoring and supervision which can be fostered within institutions or through external providers such as higher education or other training institutes and can be financed by governments, employers and private agents or co-funding arrangements (Schleicher, 2016).

However, all competent authorities should be aware that the benefits of professional development depend on the quality of the initiatives, the feedback and the follow-up support they provide. To address the issue of ineffectiveness of teacher education initiatives (Navarro & Verdisco, 2000), interest is currently growing in alternative approaches to teacher education which encourage more informal ways of learning such as reflection, joint problem – solving, networking and sharing of expertise and experience (Schleicher, 2016). The paradigm shift gathering momentum with regard to the professional development of teachers over the past few years has been that of online professional Communities of Practice (CoPs).

This innovative model was implemented as an integral part for the collection and analysis of data for a doctoral research at the English Department of the National Kapodistrian University of Athens in Greece in the context of EFL teachers' continuing professional development. The ELTeachers online CoPs were initiated, set up and officially launched in the academic year of 2014-2015. The investigation of the teachers' participation has confirmed that teachers can benefit from membership in supportive online CoPs and has also provided evidence on the central role that online CoPs can play in the teacher education field in Greece as an effective catalyst for the professional development of teachers. In addition, the study highlighted specific factors that supported teachers' reflection, their reported reconstruction of beliefs and practices and the reported effectiveness of the training experience in relation to their teaching practice (Kourkouli 2018a). Further research has also confirmed that ELTeachers online CoPs constitute a teacher training model that empowers teacher trainers themselves to engage in "reformed" training practice. It has also showcased the key role of the Coordinators'/teacher trainers' attitude toward the innovative model of teacher education for its feasibility and viability in Greece (Kourkouli, 2018b).

Therefore, it is the purpose of this paper to complement the current research on design principles for effective online CoP teacher education implementation. In particular, leadership patterns of involvement and professional development activities implementation will be addressed in order to pinpoint specific conditions

that enhance the effectiveness of online Communities of Practice in the context of EFL online CoPs Coordination. The study focuses on four Greek EFL Coordinators and fourty-nine EFL teachers participating in four online CoPs, using an online platform named *2gather* developed by the NKUA in the context of a national in-service professional development project in Greece. Differentiations between the four Coordinators' reported patterns of involvement and the teachers' reported effectiveness of the CoP training experience per online CoP provides a field for exploration in order to pinpoint the specific conditions that contributed to the enhancement of effectiveness.

The findings contribute to furthering our understanding of design principles for effective online CoPs implementation in the context of EFL continuing professional development.

Literature review

Traditional teacher education context

Most teacher education programs have traditionally been based on the "deficit" model, which dictates that some sort of new knowledge or skill should be acquired by teachers (Day & Sachs, 2004). Under this model, the visiting "expert" makes use of lecturing and presentations to disseminate knowledge, while some sort of assessment procedure is implemented to validate learning outcomes (Diaz-Maggioli, 2004). However, such short-term "spray-on" in-service PD seminars fail to provide teachers with the meaningful professional development activities proposed by current literature (Kourkouli, 2015).

In Greece, the educational model implemented is mostly convergent with the traditional one described above. Under the authority of the Ministry of Education, in-service teacher education policy is highly centralized while in-service teacher education programs mainly take the form of non-compulsory three-hour seminars organized by the Instructional Coordinators, selected by the Greek Ministry of Education in order to coordinate, supervise, provide advice and training opportunities for appointed teachers in their geographical jurisdictions. Little reference is made to the methodological procedures followed for the realization of the goals set or provision of guidelines on the mode of training to be adopted. Because the current teacher education practice in Greece is neither aligned with the international official bodies' adult and teacher education policy recommendations nor with the current international literature on effective adult and teacher education, the proposal put forward is for the identification of design principles and conditions for a more meaningful and promising form of adult and teacher professional development (Kourkouli, 2018b).

2.2 Policy recommendations on effective professional development for teachers: a shifting perspective

According to TALIS results (OECD's teaching and learning international survey, 2009) a significant proportion of teachers worldwide report that professional development does not meet their needs while the main reasons for unfulfilled demand are the conflict with their work schedule and the lack of suitable development opportunities. This suggests a need for better support for teachers to participate in professional development but also for policy makers to ensure that the development opportunities available are effective and meet the teachers' needs (OECD, 2009a: 48). OECD's review also stated "effective professional development is on-going, includes training, practice, feedback, and provides adequate time and follow-up support. Successful programs involve teachers in learning activities that are similar to ones they will use with their students and encourage the development of teachers' learning communities…" (OECD, 2009a: 49).

Another major finding is that indicators of participation in networks and mentoring have significant and stronger associations with teaching practices in a majority of countries and that PD activities that take place at regular intervals and involve teachers in social and collaborative contexts also have significantly stronger associations with teaching practices than regular workshops and courses. In addition, professional development is implemented at school level in many countries, fostering greater collaboration among teachers and having a more general impact on school quality (OECD, 2009b: 117). A frequent criticism of many professional development programs is treating teachers' PD as an activity distinct from teachers' daily work (Education Commission of the States, 2004).

In terms of policies recommendations, Schleicher (2016: 46-47) has concluded that "effective" teacher professional development activities that have an impact on teachers' instructional practices are those that take place in schools and allow teachers to work, over time, in collaborative groups, on problems of practice. Including teachers in the decision making appears to be another step in the right direction (Cordingley et al., 2015).

In the same light, the Council of the European Union (Council conclusions of 20 May 2014 on effective teacher education) also agrees that in both initial teacher education and continuous PD contexts, PD should apply adult learning principles based on communities of practice, online learning and peer learning. As a result, it invites the member states to promote the development of PD frameworks that reinforce collaboration and exchange of peer practices as well as to further explore this potential with a broad range of stakeholders in the development of teacher education programs. Furthermore, it invites member states to use the funding opportunities in EU instruments to support their PD policies and make use of the ET 2020 structures under the Open Method of Coordination to develop successful policies on effective teacher education programs. Finally, it invites the Commission

to build communities of teachers by making use of existing platforms with a view to promoting cooperation with peers across the EU as well as partners, networks and other organizations which can offer experience and know-how on designing effective teacher education programs.

2.3 Online Communities of Practice – a new approach in teacher education

Researchers too are in full agreement with the policy recommendations delineated above. The analysis of teacher education has shifted to a conception of teachers learning and developing within a broader context of community (Shulman & Shulman, 2004: 7), where teachers "try out new ideas, reflect on outcomes, and co-construct knowledge about teaching and learning within the context of authentic activity" (Butler et al., 2004: 436). Sociocultural perspectives of learning support that knowledge is socially constructed and interconnected to the contexts in which it is used (Putnam & Borko, 2000) and learning is an active process whereby learners get acculturated in a given community through dialogue and collective problem solving. In this view of learning, teachers engage in critical reflection on practice with peers and more experienced members to discuss practical problems, get feedback so that, through this interaction, they can scaffold to knowledge restructuring (Whipp, 2003). A shift of focus is therefore dictated from formal training to training in practice and to ongoing learning.

The Community of Practice (CoP) model can accommodate the proposed policy and research recommendations on effective adult and teacher education. According to Wenger et al. (2002: 4), CoPs' three main components are a) domain, the common ground on which participants share information and ideas, b) community, the result of belonging and mutual commitment shared by a group of people who establish positive relationships among themselves and c) practice, the materials, tools and knowledge that the community develops and possesses.

Participation in online CoPs can reduce feelings of disconnectedness or isolation (Duncan-Howell, 2010; Gray, 2004), facilitate knowledge sharing, knowledge creation across time and space and acknowledge the role of trainees as co-learners and co-producers of knowledge (Lai et al., 2006: 24-26). Teachers are also able to focus on specific work – related problems in order to gain "knowledge of practice" (Cochran-Smith & Lytle, 1999). The U.S. Department of Education's National Education Technology Plan calls for the use of social networking technologies to create online CoPs with the aim to ensure that professional educators have access to the content, resources, data, information, peers, and expertise they need to be highly effective (Booth, 2012: 2).

Contrary to the constraints of a co-located CoP, online CoPs offer participants the facilitative synchronous and asynchronous technology to share information and collaborate online, to practically reach out to everybody even in geographically isolated areas and powerful resources to provide work – embedded support for

teachers' ongoing learning (Karavas & Papadopoulou, 2014). Empirical research studies (Vescio et al., 2008) have also confirmed that well-developed CoPs can have a positive impact on the professional development of teachers.

2.4 Developing effective online Communities of Practice – the vital role of the Coordinator

Online CoPs can accommodate adult training in any line of business. But success cannot be achieved by simply building an online platform, inviting trainees to sign in and wishing that they will interact in meaningful ways. A number of design principles have been identified in the literature (Schwen & Hara, 2003; Stuckey & Smith, 2004; Wallace & St-Onge, 2003; Schlager & Fusco, 2004; Barab et al., 2003) with an eye to supporting sociability and participation, attracting diverse membership, providing for different roles, including suitable technology and blending online with offline activities (Lai et al., 2006). Specific issues related to defining the appropriate "social and technical architectures" to a given community have been addressed such as: identification of audience, purpose, goals, vision, activities, technologies, group processes and roles that will support the community's goals, piloting and launching the community to a broader audience, engaging members in collaborative learning and knowledge sharing activities, creating an increasing cycle of participation and contribution as well as assessing activities to inform new strategies and models for the future (Cambridge et al., 2005). A list of motivating factors and barriers lifting strategies include promoting members' sense of belonging to the community, building interpersonal trust as well as initial and follow-up IT training (Ardichvili, 2008).

The issue of effective coordination is identified and discussed in various studies but continues to portray as a relatively uncharted area, particularly as to the specific characteristics, beliefs, attitudes, knowledge base, activities, tools and presence attributes Coordinators should exhibit during their involvement in online CoPs teacher education programs. Best practices for generating and facilitating online discussion range from developing clear guidelines and expectations for discussion to striking a balance of trainees and Coordinators' interaction (Maddix, 2012). Wenger (2009: 10) characterizes the Coordinators of CoPs as "social artists" whose social energy and trust – building skills are a major factor for the success of the online CoP. Coordinators' knowledge of cultural, social and organizational issues (Gray, 2004), their ability to build alliances and foster trust (Bourhis et al., 2005) as well as intellectual and technological skills (Gairin-Salan et al., 2010) have also been recognized as important agents of success. Booth's study (2012) underscores the importance of effective moderation in online CoPs while Kourkouli (2018b) showcases that Coordinators engage in "reformed" training practice themselves as a result of their involvement in ELTeachers online CoPs, providing teachers with more meaningful professional development activities than in the traditional teacher training models. In addition, Coordinators report their own perceived benefits such

as gaining useful insights into their trainees' teaching practices and overcoming time, place and sharing constraints. Finally, the study highlights the key role of the Coordinators' attitude towards online CoPs for the feasibility and viability of this teacher education model in Greece and worldwide.

Since online CoPs must be carefully designed and developed in order to successfully fulfill their potential, it is within this and future papers' scope to cast more light into the vital role of the Coordinator and pinpoint specific factors associated with increased teacher learning and effectiveness, as well as with appropriate design and development principles that can pave the way for an improved teacher education paradigm in Greece and worldwide.

Method

3.1 Methodological approach

The purpose of this study is to investigate Greek EFL Coordinators' involvement in online Communities of Practice (CoPs) in terms of its impact on the participating teachers' professional development in order to pinpoint the specific conditions that contributed to the enhancement of effectiveness.

In this light, we selected the most suitable methodological approach to address the following research question:

Which are the specific conditions associated with the teachers' reported enhanced effectiveness of the CoP training experience for their teaching practice, in the context of the ELTeachers online CoPs implementation?

3.2 Study context

In order to respond to the research question stated above, we[1] made a difficult decision in the direction of reliability. We gathered the necessary data by developing our own authentic online CoPs, not with a focus group of the English Department NKUA acquaintances, but with the appointed Instructional Coordinators for the English language, operating in different geographical jurisdictions all over Greece who volunteered to enter the project without remuneration.

They are responsible for training and assessing all state – school appointed teachers working in their jurisdiction. Coordinators communicated our invitations through the competent Directorates of Primary Education in order to recruit EFL teachers working in their jurisdictions with real needs and everyday problems to enter the project without remuneration as well. For the online ELTeachers CoPs formation, we used the 2gather platform developed by the NKUA which combines features of

[1] The project and research were realized thanks to my PhD supervisor, Dr. Evdokia Karavas, Associate Professor at the English Department, National and Kapodistrian University of Athens, who initiated and supported me with feedback throughout this endeavor.

Learning and Content Management Systems with those of Social Networking Services. The platform integrates the following facilities useful to a CoP: a) homepage b) discussion spaces to foster discussions through a closed forum for every CoP, c) private and public messages), d) member directory with a profile – avatar and a short bionote for every participant as well as their online status), e) chatrooms, f) media library, g) activity streams) and h) groups and sub-groups (Karavas & Papadopoulou, 2014).

The whole project amounted to a monumental effort of setting up, publicizing, piloting, organizing launching as well as kick-off events, face and skype meetings, tutorial workshops as well as informing and training the Coordinators on the innovative teacher education method, the specific platform and available tools. The investigation lasted from April 2014 – June 2015. Each online CoP was composed of one Coordinator and as many teachers - volunteers as they could recruit, working in the broader geographical area of the Coordinators' jurisdiction, sometimes a whole Prefecture. The CoP training schedule and material was based on reported teachers' needs and was given to most Coordinators as a "guidebook" for further development. Coordinators posted one monthly activity in each CoP's forum divided in two fortnight sections with strict deadlines and specific ground rules designed to multiply interaction, foster reflection, development of open discussion, connection with teachers' everyday practice, provision of feedback and open interaction among the participants (Kourkouli, 2018a).

In other words, the whole project amounted to the first ever attempt in the EFL state education Greek context to implement an innovative model of teacher education with appointed Coordinators training volunteering appointed state school teachers. This participation plan was meant to increase the validity and reliability of the research findings.

Participants

Following Cambridge et al.'s example (2005), we assigned the roles as follows:

Administrator–Leader: Katerina Kourkouli, researcher at the English Department of the NKUA, responsible for the setting up of the 4 online CoPs under investigation.

Coordinators: 4 state EFL Instructional Coordinators assigned their own online CoP (A' CoP, K' CoP, C' CoP and I'CoP named like this for anonymity reasons) who consented to answer the "after" the CoP involvement questionnaire and provide all necessary information, data and clarification requested by the researcher. One of them, C' CoP's Coordinator opted to co-act as a Coordinator alongside an EFL teacher acting as a Deputy Coordinator.

Participants: 49 EFL state school teachers working in the primary education who participated voluntarily throughout the training period, in their authentic contexts, fulfilled the criteria in terms of workload and projects submitted specified by the

CoP program and answered the "after" questionnaire (16 teachers for A' CoP, 15 for C' CoP, 12 for K' CoP and 6 for I' CoP). (Kourkouli, 2018b).

3.4.Data sources

In order to address the research questions, two questionnaires were constructed as tools for data collection and analysis administered "after" the teachers and the Coordinators' CoP involvement. The Coordinators' questionnaire aimed to capture their respective patterns of involvement in the online CoP they were assigned while the teachers' questionnaire administered "after" their participation per online CoP aimed to capture the participating teachers' reported effectiveness of the CoP training experience. A comparison of the Coordinators' and their trainees' responses per online CoP highlights the specific conditions that have supported the teachers' reported reconstruction of knowledge and practices and the reported effectiveness of their CoP training experience regarding their everyday teaching practice.

Both questionnaires were constructed based on the study of variables that capture common experiences of people. In particular, the use of the Microsoft Excel 2007 Data processing programme accounted for the descriptive nature of this research and qualitative crosstabulation for the establishment of associations between variables (Dornyei, 2007: 228).

The sampling plan for this project yielded a total of 4 Coordinators' questionnaires compared with 49 Teachers questionnaires in July 2015.

Instrument

The Coordinators' questionnaire elicited information through mainly clozed-ended item types using factual, behavioural and attitudinal questions. In effect, Part I aims to build a profile of the respondents who participate in this research while Part II focuses on the online CoP course itself by exploring the topics covered, the presence of training practices used which are regarded conducive to teacher development as well as the specific professional development activities Coordinators provided their trainees with "during" their CoP training. Finally, we investigate the Coordinators' attitude towards the innovative model of teacher education for its feasibility and viability in Greece.

The teachers' questionnaire elicited information through mainly clozed-ended item types as well, using factual, behavioural and attitudinal questions. In effect, Part I aims to build a profile of the respondents who participate in this research, while Part II seeks to investigate the impact of the online CoP through the tracing of perceived teachers' knowledge and practice restructuring as well as perceived benefit and reported effectiveness of their training experience in relation to their teaching needs and practice "after" their participation in the CoPs.

Presentation and discussion of results

In this section, we will present the results and discuss them critically based on the research method described and the theoretical framework delineated above.

Personal and professional data

All four Coordinators participating in this research are female, three of them have 2-5 years of experience as Instructional Coordinators while one of them 0-1 year. Half of them report having received formal training concerning the area of teaching English to young learners, whereas the other half report no such training. Most of them (75%) have not been involved in an organized Community of Practice but are motivated into familiarizing themselves with it.

As for the trainees, the majority of the respondents are female teachers (91%) teaching English to young learners of the first and second grades of primary school (61%), 26% of the respondents hold a postgraduate degree in English teaching with a further 10% in some other field. A small percentage of 22% report no teaching experience with young learners while almost 39% report more than three years teaching experience with the target age group. In addition, 70% report having attended some type of training course, day seminar organized by the Instructional Coordinators and the NKUA or self-training in relation to teaching English to young learners. The vast majority (90%) had never participated in an organized Community of Practice before.

Description of results

The second part of this presentation focuses on the online CoP teacher education course itself. In effect, it seeks to pinpoint the impact of the Coordinators' reported implementation of strategies, activities and training procedures per CoP, through the tracing of perceived teachers' knowledge restructuring, teachers' reported change of their teaching practices as well as perceived benefit and effectiveness of their training experience in relation to their teaching needs and practice. In other words, it highlights the specific conditions that have supported the enhancement of effectiveness of their training. To this end, we have compared Coordinators' self-reported implementation of strategies, activities and training procedures to the following four indicators of effectiveness per CoP: 1.extent to which new insights into teaching have been gained per CoP, 2.perceived usefulness of the teachers' involvement for their everyday teaching practice per CoP, 3.extent to which teacher development needs have been met per CoP and 4. Frequency of usage of new ideas presented after the CoP course.

In response to the research question:

Which are the specific conditions associated with the Teachers' reported enhanced effectiveness of the CoP training experience for their teaching practice, in the context of the ELTeachers online CoPs implementation?

As can be seen, in Tables 1 and 2 below, concerning the specific process followed for deciding on the training topics during the ELTeachers online CoPs training course, K CoP's process, based on the existing self-study teacher training e-course of the English faculty of the National Kapodistrian University of Athens, has been found to be highly effective with regard to knowledge restructuring. In fact, 50% of the teachers participating in K. CoP have reported gaining of new insights to a great extent, followed by 38% of the A. CoP's teachers who report gaining of new insights to an equally high extent. A. CoP's Coordinator reports identification of the training topics based on needs analysis whereas I.CoP's and C.CoP's Coordinators' choice appears to be the least effective of all. Following the good practices of other Coordinators in selecting the training topics results in fewer teachers reporting a high degree of knowledge restructuring (33% and 27% respectively).

Table 1: Specific process followed for deciding on the training topics for primary school teachers during CoP

A. CoP	K. CoP	C. CoP & I. CoP
based on needs analysis and identification of topics	based on the existing self-study teacher training e-course of the English faculty of the NKUA	following good practices of other Coordinators

Table 2: Extent to which new insights into teaching have been gained after CoP involvement

	C. CoP	A. CoP	K. CoP	I. CoP
A great deal	27%	38%	50%	33%
Up to Some extent	73%	50%	50%	50%
A little	0%	6%	0%	17%
Not at all	0%	6%	0%	0%
Total	100%	100%	100%	100%

In terms of perceived usefulness of the teachers' involvement in the online CoP for their everyday teaching practice, the picture remains more or less the same. K CoP's topic identification process, based on the existing self-study teacher training e-course of the English faculty of the NKUA, is perceived to be very useful for the teachers' teaching practice by 83% of the respondents, followed by 81% of the A. CoP's teachers who responded the same. Adopting the good practices of other Coordinators in selecting the training topics has been found very useful by 67% of the I. CoP and 47% of the C. CoP (see Table 3).

Table 3: Perceived usefulness of Teachers' involvement in CoPs for their everyday teaching practice

	C. CoP	A. CoP	K. CoP	I. CoP

Very useful	47%	81%	83%	67%
Moderately useful	53%	19%	17%	33%
Slightly useful	0%	0%	0%	0%
Absolutely useless	0%	0%	0%	0%
Total	100%	100%	100%	100%

Regarding the third indicator of effectiveness, the extent to which teacher development needs have been met as a result of the participation in the CoP training course, 58% of the K. CoP teachers respond to a great extent, followed by 56% of the respondents in A. CoP. Adopting the good practices of other Coordinators is reported to meet teacher development needs to a great extent by only 33% of the teachers in I. CoP and 20% of teachers in the C. CoP (see Table 4).

Table 4: Extent to which teacher development needs have been met after CoP involvement (regarding everyday teaching practice)

	C CoP	A CoP	K CoP	I. CoP
A great deal	20%	56%	58%	33%
Up to some extent	73%	44%	42%	50%
A little	7%	0%	0%	17%
Not at all	0%	0%	0%	0%
Total	100%	100%	100%	100%

Finally, the identification of topics based on needs analysis (A. CoP) as well as based on the existing self-study teacher training e-course of the English faculty of the NKUA (K. CoP), have been found to be most effective in terms of reported change of teachers' actual teaching practices. More specifically, 38% of the teachers in A. CoP report implementing newly received knowledge in every single lesson followed by 34% of the teachers in K. CoP reporting the same. Adopting other Coordinators' implementation schedules is considered a less effective strategy by the majority of the respondents (see Table 5).

Table 5: Frequency of usage of new ideas presented after CoP involvement

	C.CoP	A. CoP	K. CoP	I. CoP
In Every Single lesson	13%	38%	34%	33.3%
Once a week	40%	38%	58%	33.3%
Once a month	40%	24%	8%	33.3%
Once a never	7%	0%	0%	0%
Total	100%	100%	100%	100%

Differentiations in topic coverage emerges as another condition for the enhancement of effectiveness of the online CoP training course. As can be seen in Table 6 below, topic coverage is significantly linked with reported reconstruction of

knowledge base and practices as well as with the reported effectiveness of their training experience in relation to teachers' teaching practice.

Table 6 : Topics covered during CoP with Primary school Teachers

	C. CoP	A. CoP	K. CoP	I. CoP
Teaching Practices appropriate to young learners		x	x	x
Teacher's role in the very young learner classroom		x	x	x
Young learners' characteristics		x	x	x
Utilization of educational technology		x	x	
Dealing with individual learner difficulties		x	x	
Classroom management	x	x	x	x
Using the suggested material in the 1st, 2nd and 3rd grades		x		x
Reflection as an integral part of the teaching process		x		
Peer lesson evaluation		x	x	
OTHER (Individual-collaborative lesson plan development/ Multiple intelligences/)	x	x		

In particular, covering the topics of teaching practices appropriate to young learners, teacher's role in the very young learner classroom, young learners' characteristics, utilization of educational technology, dealing with individual learners' difficulties, classroom management and peer lesson evaluation, are reported to have resulted in gaining of new insights into teaching to a great extent by 50% of the K. CoP teachers (see Table 2 above). The same topic coverage is perceived as mostly useful for teachers' everyday teaching practice by 83% of the K. CoP (see Table 3 above), while 58% of them report that their teacher development needs have been met to a great extent (see Table 4 above) and 34% state implementing newly gained knowledge in every single lesson as a result of their online CoP training course participation (see Table 5). Adding the topics of using the suggested material of the school book, reflection as an integral part of the teaching process, multiple intelligences and individual as well as collaborative lesson plan development in the A. CoP is also associated with high percentages of reported effectiveness, in terms of gaining of new insights (38%, Table 2), highly perceived usefulness of involvement (81%, Table 3), addressing the teacher development needs to a great extent (56%, Table 4) and high frequency of usage of new ideas (38%, Table 5). In contrast, less topic coverage in I. CoP and C. CoP is related with lower reports of perceived effectiveness (Tables 2, 3, 4, 5 & 6).

Concerning the professional development activities implemented, that is the methods the trainers employed to provide new input, findings show that

collaborative and exploratory learning constitute effective professional development activities. In fact identifying teachers' needs, giving feedback to teaching problems, involving them in sharing problems and exploring solutions with colleagues, in sharing resources and good practices as well as in putting a new approach into practice and in reflecting on practice could account for the higher percentages of reported effectiveness in K.CoP and C. CoP (see Tables 2, 3, 4, 5 & 7).

Table 7: Professional development activities implemented during CoP with primary school teachers

	C. CoP	A. CoP	K. CoP	I. CoP
Giving Lectures				
Involving teachers in sharing problems with colleagues	x		x	
Involving teachers in observing colleagues classes				
Involving teachers in exploring solutions with colleagues	x	x	x	
Involving teachers in sharing resources and good practices with colleagues	x	x	x	x
Identifying teachers' needs		x	x	x
Involving teachers in putting a new approach into practice		x	x	x
Giving feedback to teaching problems		x	x	x
Involving teachers in reflecting on practice		x	x	x
Giving follow-up training on new ideas/techniques				

Employing more effective reflection practices with teachers "during" the CoP portrays as another condition for the enhancement of effectiveness. More specifically, writing reflective lesson plans combined with reflective discussion in a collaborative environment constitute a training practice associated with increased reports of effectiveness in K. CoP and A. CoP (see Table 8). The significance of reflective practice in the context of the online CoPs as a major professional development activity for this sample is further corroborated by the relevant literature delineated above (Whipp, 2003; Butler et al., 2004).

Table 8: Tools frequently employed to guide teachers towards reflection

	C. CoP	A. CoP	K. CoP	I. CoP
Reflecting on their own		x	x	x
Discussing with colleagues in a collaborative environment	x	x	x	x
Keeping journals				x
Writing reflective lesson plans		x	x	

The issue of effective coordination identified and discussed in the literature is also corroborated by the finding below (see Table 9). In particular, Coordinators

participating actively in all stages of the online CoP training course and exhibiting a stronger teaching presence (Anderson et al., 2001) in terms of design, organization, facilitating discourse and direct instruction score higher in all indicators of effectiveness delineated above. In contrast, the C. CoP Coordinator who reports not participating actively, assigning the workload to a Deputy Coordinator acting under her wings, exhibiting weak organizational, intellectual, social and technological skills scores lower in all four indicators of effectiveness, that is 27% of the respondents for knowledge restructuring, 47% for perceived usefulness, 20% for meeting development needs to a great extent and only 13% for frequent implementation of received knowledge (Tables 2, 3, 4, 5).

Table 9: Active participation as a Coordinator of CoP				
	C. CoP	A. CoP	K. CoP	I. CoP
Yes		x	x	x
No	x			

Finally, the comparison of data depicts an association between the Coordinators' opinion on feasibility and viability of online CoPs with the teachers' reported effectiveness of the CoP course on their professional development. As Table 10 shows, the 3 CoPs' teachers (A. CoP, K. CoP, I. CoP) who reported a greater deal of effectiveness of the CoP course, were coordinated by Coordinators who were overly positive in their opinion on the feasibility and viability of CoPs as a teacher education model in Greece.

Table 10: Feasibility and viability of Communities of Practice for a teacher education model in Greece				
	C. CoP	A. CoP	K. CoP	I. CoP
A great deal		x	x	x
Up to Some extent	x			
A little				
Not at all				
Total				

Implications for educators' PD practice and research

The European Commission (2016) working group has identified a number of inter-related themes on which peer learning could focus which include workplace learning in a lifelong learning strategy, basic skills in the workplace both of employed and unemployed people, Public Employment Services (PES), validation of learning outcomes in workplace learning, workplace learning and economic growth, employers, activation of older workers, SMEs as learning workplace and vocational skills development. Obviously the domain of implementation is infinite. OECD has recognized "professional learning communities" as professional development approaches suitable for fostering beneficial adult learning for governments to

encourage staff to engage in professional development through the provision of incentives as a result of the need for better support for teachers to participate in professional development but also for policy makers to ensure that the development opportunities available are effective and meet the teachers' needs (OECD, 2009: 48).

Online CoPs have proved to be effective vehicles of collective learning, knowledge creation and reconstruction of trainees' beliefs and practices within different organizations (Ardichvili et al., 2003; Vestal, 2006; Kourkouli, 2018a). More and more systematic studies have been aiming at measuring the effectiveness as well as identifying a number of principles and conditions and factors for designing and implementing effective online CoPs as delineated above (Ardichvili, 2008; Kourkouli, 2018a; Kourkouli, 2018b). While it is important to recognize that every organization and community is different, the truth is that online CoPs can accommodate adult training in any line of business.

The professional development of teachers is also one domain of application for the online CoPs adult education paradigm which has been gathering momentum over the past few years all over the world in addressing the problem of ineffectiveness of the traditional teacher training programs (Lieberman & Mace, 2010). The issue of effective coordination and implementation is addressed particularly as to the specific topics, beliefs, attitudes, activities, tools and presence attributes Coordinators should exhibit during their involvement in online CoPs teacher education programs. In particular, effective leadership practices and effective professional development activities implementation have been addressed in order to pinpoint specific conditions that enhance the effectiveness of online Communities of Practice in the context of EFL online CoPs Coordination.

Identification of training topics, based on needs analysis as well as the existing self-study teacher training e-course of the English faculty of the National Kapodistrian University of Athens, has been found to be highly effective with regard to all indicators of effectiveness. A fuller coverage of the training topics available range and implementation of teacher development activities regarded conducive to teacher development can also account for the higher percentages of reported effectiveness. Employing more effective reflection practices with teachers "during" the CoP portrays as another condition for the enhancement of effectiveness. The vital role of the Coordinator for cultivating and sustaining knowledge sharing and trust is further associated with the overall report of effectiveness. In particular, Coordinators participating actively in all stages of the online CoP training course and exhibiting a stronger teaching presence (Anderson et al., 2001) score higher in all indicators of effectiveness designated above. In order to better showcase the role of the Coordinators' attitude towards the innovative model of teacher education for its feasibility and viability in Greece, the comparison of data depicts an association between the Coordinators' opinion on feasibility and viability of online CoPs with

the teachers' reported effectiveness of the CoP course on their professional development.

The findings contribute to casting more light into this vital role and pinpoint more factors associated with increased teacher learning and effectiveness as well as furthering our understanding of design principles and effective implementation of online CoPs in the context of EFL continuing professional development. In addition, they provide a platform for more research to be conducted by other educators in the same direction.

References

[1] Anderson, T., Rourke, L., Garrison, D. R., & Archer, W. (2001). Assessing teaching presence in computer conferencing context. Journal of Asynchronous Learning Networks, 5(2), 1-17.
[2] Ardichvili, A. (2008). Learning and knowledge sharing in virtual communities of practice: Motivators, barriers and enablers. Advances in Developing Human Resources, 10(4), 541-554.
[3] Ardichvili, A., Page, V. & Wentling, T. (2003). Motivation and barriers to participation in virtual knowledge sharing teams. Journal of Knowledge Management, 7(1), 64-77.
[4] Barab, S.A., MaKinster, J.G. & Scheckler, R. (2003). Designing System Dualities: Characterizing a Web-Supported Professional Development Community, The Information Society, 19(3), 237-256.
[5] Booth, S. (2012). Cultivating knowledge sharing and trust in online communities for educators. Journal of Educational Computing Research, (47)1, 1-31.
[6] Bourhis, A., Dube, L., & Jacob, R. (2005). The success of online communities of practice: The leadership factor. The Electronic Journal of Knowledge Management, (3)1, 23-34.
[7] Butler,D.L., Lauscher,H.N., Jarvis-Selinger, S. and Beckingham, B. (2004). Collaboration and self-regulation in teachers' professional development. Teaching and Teacher Education, 20(5), 435-455.
[8] Cambridge, D., Kaplan, S. & Suter, V. (2005). Community of practice designguide. A step-by-step guide for designing and cultivating communities of practice in higher education. Retrieved from: https://goo.gl/oKnVsh
[9] Cochran-Smith, M. & Lytle, S.L. (1999). Relationships of knowledge and practice: Teacher learning in communities. In A. Iran-Nejar & P.D. Pearson (eds.), Review of research in education, 249-305. Washington, DC: AERA.
[10] Cordingley, P., Higgins, S., Greany, T., Buckler, N., Coles-Jordan, D., Crisp, B., Saunders, L. & Coe, R. (2015). Developing great teaching: lessons from the international reviews into effective professional development, Project Report. London: Teacher Development Trust.

[11] Council conclusions of 20 May 2014 on effective teacher education. (2014). Official Journal of the European Union. Retrieved from: https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=CELEX%3A52014XG0614%2805%29
[12] Day, C. & Sachs, J. (2004). Professionalism, performativity and empowerment: discourses in the politics, policies and purposes of continuing professional development. In C. Day & J. Sachs (eds.), International handbook on the continuing professional development of teachers, 3-32. Maidenhead: Open University Press.
[13] Diaz-Maggioli, G. (2004). Teacher centered professional development. Alexandria, VA: ASCD.
[14] Dornyei, Z. (2007). Research methods in applied linguistics. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
[15] Duncan-Howell, J. (2010). Teachers making connections: Online communities as a source of professional learning. British Journal of Educational Technology, 41(2), 324-340.
[16] Education Commission of the States (2004). Professional development, pros and cons: What does the evidence say? Denver, CO: Education Commission of the States,.
[17] European Commission (2016). Working group on adult learning. ET 2020 Newsletter. Retrieved from: http://ec.europa.eu/assets/eac/et2020/201611-newsletter-et2020.html#WGVocational
[18] Gairin-Sallan, J., Rodriguez-Gomez, D. & Armegol-Asparol, C. (2010). Who exactly is the moderator? A consideration of online knowledge management network moderation in educational organisations. Computers and Education, 55(1), 304-312.
[19] Gray, B. (2004). Informal learning in an online community of practice. Journal of Distance Education, 19(1), 20-35.
[20] Karavas, E. & Papadopoulou, S. (2014). Introducing a paradigm shift in EFL continuing professional development in Greece: the development of online communities of practice. In D. Hayes (ed.), Innovations in the continuing professional development of English language teachers, 179-206. London: British Council.
[21] Kourkouli, K. (2015). Investigating the effectiveness of training procedures employed in Greek EFL state induction teacher education courses. Research Papers in Language Teaching and Learning, 6(1), 6-24.
[22] Kourkouli, K. (2018a). "Investigating the impact of Greek EFL teachers' participation in online communities of practice as a means of professional development", European Journal of Education, 1 (1), 56-75.
[23] Kourkouli, K (2018b). Investigating greek EFL coordinators' involvement in online ElTeachers communities of practice as a means of professional

development. European Journal of Social Science Education and Research, 5 (3), 41-55.
[24] Lai, K.W., Pratt, K., Anderson, M. & Stigter, J. (2006). Literature review and synthesis: Online communities of practice, research division. Dunedin: Ministry of Education, New Zealand.
[25] Lieberman, A. & Pointer Mace, D. (2010). Making practice public: Teacher learning in the 21st century. Journal of Teacher Education, 61(1), 77-88.
[26] Maddix. M. (2012). Generating and facilitating effective online learning through discussion. Christian Education Journal: Research on Educational Ministry, (9)2, 372-385.
[27] Navarro, J.C. & Verdisco, A. (2000). Teacher training in Latin America: Innovations and trends. Washington D.C: Education Unit Publications. Inter-American Development Bank.
[28] OECD. (2009a). The professional development of teachers. In Creating effective teaching and learning environments: First results from TALIS, 47-78.
[29] OECD. (2009b). Teaching practices, teachers' beliefs and attitudes. In Creating effective teaching and learning environments: First results from TALIS, 87-122.
[30] Putnam, R. & Borko, H. (2000). What do new views of knowledge and thinking have to say about research on teacher learning? Educational Researcher, 29(4), 4-15.
[31] Schlager, M.S. & Fusco, J. (2004). Teacher professional development, technology, and communities of practice: Are we putting the cart before the horse?. In S. Barab, R. Kling, & J. Gray (eds.), Designing for virtual communities in the service of learning, 120-153. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
[32] Schleicher, A. (2016). OECD. Teaching excellence through professional learning and policy reform: Lessons from around the world. International summit on the teaching profession, Paris: OECD Publishing.
[33] Schwen, T. M., & Hara, N. (2003). Community of practice: a metaphor for online design? The Information Society, 19(3), 257-270.
[34] Shulman, L.S. & Shulman, J.H. (2004). Know and what teachers learn: a shifting perspective, Journal of Curriculum Studies, 36:2, 257-271.
[35] Stuckey, B & Smith, J. (2004). Building sustainable communities of practice. In P. Hildreth, & C. Kimble (eds.), Knowledge networks: Innovation through communities of practice, 150-164. York, UK: Idea Group Publishing.
[36] Timperley, H. (2008). Teacher professional learning and development. In J. Brophy (ed.), The Educational Practices Series – 18. Brussels: International Academy of Education & International Bureau of Education.
[37] Vescio, V. Ross, D. & Adams, A. (2008). A review of research on the impact of professional learning communities on teaching practices and student learning, Teaching and Teacher Education, 24, 80-91.

[38] Vestal, W. (2006). CoPs in progress: AQPC and Texas Medical Association. Knowledge Management Review, 9(1), 8-9.
[39] Wallace, D. & St-Onge, H. (2003). Leveraging communities of practice for strategic advantage. Burlington: Elsevier Science.
[40] Wenger, E. (2009). Social learning capability - our essays on innovation and learning in social systems. In Sociedade e Trabalho booklets: Social innovation, 12 - Separate supplement, 15-35. Lisbon: MTSS/GEP & EQUAL.
[41] Wenger, E., McDermott, R. & Snyder, W. (2002). Cultivating communities of practice. Boston, MA: Harvard Business School Press.
[42] Whipp, J. (2003). Scaffolding critical reflection in online discussions: Helping prospective teachers think deeply about field experiences in urban schools. Journal of Teacher Education, 54(4), 321-333.